# **Enhancing Employability and Leadership for Youth (EELY)**



AGA KHAN FOUNDATION

**Final Narrative Report** 

(April 1, 2011 – March 31, 2017)

Prepared for Global Affairs Canada (GAC)

Submitted by Aga Khan Foundation Canada (AKFC)

July 7, 2017

# ACRONYMS

AKCSP	Aga Khan Cultural Sorvices Dalvistan
	Aga Khan Cultural Services, Pakistan
AKDN	Aga Khan Development Network
AKEPB	Aga Khan Economic Planning Board
AKFC	Aga Khan Foundation Canada
AKFP	Aga Khan Foundation Pakistan
AKPBS	Aga Khan Planning and Building Services
AKRSP	Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
АКТС	Aga Khan Trust for Culture
AKYSB	Aga Khan Youth and Sports Board
BDS	Business Development Services
BDSP	Business Development Service Providers
BSP	Business Service Provider
CAD	Canadian Dollar
CBSGs	Community Based Savings Groups
CO	Community Organisations
CBDRM	Community Based Disaster Risk Management
CPEC	China Pakistan Economic Corridor
DPAP	Diamer Poverty Alleviation Program
DRR	Disaster Risk Reduction
ECD	Early Childhood Development
EDT	Enterprise Development Training
EELY	Enhanced Employability and Leadership for Youth
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
	Economic Transformation Initiative
ETI	
GAC	Global Assistance, Canada
GAD	Gender and Development
GB	Gilgit-Baltistan
GBC	Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral
GBDMA	Gilgit-Baltistan Disaster Management Authority
GBLA	Gilgit-Baltistan Legislative Assembly
GoGB	Government of Gilgit-Baltistan
ICT	Information Communications Technology
ID	Institutional Development
IDS	Institutional Development Survey
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
INGO	International Non-Government Organization
KADO	Karim Abad Development Organization
KDF	Karakorum Disability Forum
KIU	Karakorum International University
КР	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LFPR	Labour Force Participation Rate
LG	Local Government
LGRD	Local Government and Rural Development
LM	Logic Model
LMA	Labour Market Assessment
LUMS	Labour Market Assessment Labore University of Management Sciences
LSO	Local Support Organisation
MD	Market Development
1.10	Market Development

MELD	Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning for Development
MER	Monitoring, Evaluation and Research
MIAD	Multi-Input Area Development
MIS	Management Information System
MTs	Master Trainers
NATCO	Northern Areas Transport Corporation
NAVTTC	National Vocational and Technical Training Commission
NDMA	National Disaster Management Authority
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NOC	No Objection Certificate
PCP	Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy
PDCC	Professional Development Centre Chitral
PDCN	Professional Development Centre North
PIP	Project Implementation Plan
PKR	Pakistani Rupees
PMF	Performance Measurement Framework
PPP	Public Private Partnerships
PSC	Project Steering Committee
PTDC	Pakistan Tourism Development Corporation
PTI	Pakistan Tehrik-e-Insaaf
QoL	Quality of Life
RSPN	Rural Support Programmes Network
SAT	Self-Assessment Test
SEI	Special Education Institute
SESGBC	Socio-Economic Survey of Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral
TVET	Technical Vocational Education and Training
TEVTA	Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority
ToR	Terms of Reference
ТоТ	Training of Trainers
TVET	Technical & Vocational Education and Training
UC	Union Council
VC	Value Chain
VCD	Value Chain Development
VO	Village Organisation
WBS	Work Breakdown Structure
WO	Women's Organisation
YCLDP	Young Community Leadership Development Program
YDP	Youth Development Plan
YIP	Youth Internship Program
YMCA	Youth Micro Challenge Award

# Contents

ACRO	ONYMS	2
SECT	ION A: BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES	8
I.	Background and rationale	8
II.	EELY Goal and objectives	12
III.	Results	13
SECT	ION B: SUMMARY DESCRIPTION OF THE PROJECT	15
I.	Management and organization	15
II.	Description of activities	16
III.	Stakeholders, their roles and responsibilities	16
SECT	ION C: ANALYTICAL REVIEW OF THE PROJECT	18
I.	Planned and achieved goal and objectives	18
II.	Detailed final report on achievement of results	57
III.	Political considerations	75
IV.	Analysis of scheduling	76
V.	Logistical difficulties	76
VI.	Public relations	78
VII.	Analysis, recommendations and lessons learned	79
ANNE	EX A: YEAR 6 SUMMARY REPORT	88
ANNE	EX B: ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN UNDER EELY INTEREST INCOME	92
ANNE	EX-C: MEET THE BENEFICIARIES	96

# Table of Figures

Table 1: Population Projected for 2010 (Government of Pakistan Statistics)
Table 2: Cumulative Total of Young Women and Men Reached by the EELY Project Years 1 - 6
Table 3: Cumulative Total of Young Women and Young Men Indirectly Reached by the EELY Project Year1 - 6
Table 4: EELY Components: Concept, Approach and Main Deliverables
Table 5: Number of Skill Development Service Providers Supported, by Year and Region
Table 6: Number of Skill Development Service Providers Supported, by Year and Type of Support21
Table 7: Number of Participants in Transition Programs (Apprenticeships, Placements), by Year and Sex
Table 8: Number of Internships Provided to Fresh Graduates, by Year, Sex and Region
Table 9: Number of Subsectors Assessed, by Region and Year
Table 10: Number and Type of Support Services Strengthened, by Year and Value Chain         32
Table 11: Number of Awareness Workshops and Participants, by Year and Sex
Table 12: Number of Young Women and Young Men Trained in Entrepreneurship Development, by Year
Table 13: Number of Social Enterprises, by Year and Type
Table 14: Number of Micro-Challenge Awards Awarded, by Year, Region, and Sex
Table 15: Business Support Services, by Type of Business Support Provider and Type of Support37
Table 16: Number of Micro-Challenge Awards Awarded to Youth Organizations, by Year, Type and Sex- of-Leadership
Table 17: Number of Direct Beneficiaries of the Youth Micro-Challenge Awards, by Region and Sex40
Table 18: Number of Youth Recognition Events and Participants, by Year, Region and Sex of Participants
Table 19: Number of Trainer of Trainers Sessions and Trainers Trained, by Year, Region and Sex ofTrained Trainers
Table 20: Number of Partner Organizations and Trained Facilitators, by Year and Sex of Facilitator 43
Table 21: Number of DRR Events Conducted and Participants, by Year, Region, and Sex of Participants
Table 22: Number of Youth Development Plan Priorities Supported, by Year and Region
Table 23: Number of Youth Leadership Program Participants, by Year, Region, and Sex

Table 24: Number of Savings Groups Established and Number of Youth Members, by Year, Region, and Sex of Youth Members
Table 25: Number of LSO representatives Participating in Training, by Year, Region and Sex of Representatives         50
Table 26: Number of LSOs Receiving Matching Management Grants, by Year and Region
Table 27: Number of Interns Placed Under the Institutional Development Program, by Year, Region, andSex of Intern53
Table 28: Technical Assistance Contracted for EELY by AKFC
Table 29: Percentage of Service Providers Classified as 'Performing' or 'Promising' (2015)         58
Table 30: Percentage of Trained Young Women and Men Using Skills Training to Earn Income, by Sex
Table 31: Perception of Trainees on Quality of Skill Development Providers (Baseline vs. Midline):59
Table 32: Perception of Trainees on Relevance of Skill Development Providers' Offerings (Baseline vs.Midline)59
Table 33: Percentage of Employers who Listed 'Available Skills' As Biggest Challenge to Hiring Youth, bySex (Baseline vs. Endline):60
Table 34: Percentage of Targeted Producers with Sale Range of PKR 100,000, Post EELY Training60
Table 35: Young Women and Men who have Received Support to Own, Operate, and Manage anEnterprise in Target Value Chains, by region and sex of members
Table 36: Percentage of Youth Supported Under EELY's Employability Stream Who Own an Enterprise
Table 37: Number of Interventions Implemented Through In/formal Agreements and Market ActorsEngaged, by Targeted Value Chain
Table 38: Interventions implemented as a result of in/formal agreements, by value chain
Table 39: Percentage of Total CSO Membership, by CSO Type and Sex of Members (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 40: Percentage of Youth in Management Positions at Community Organizations, by Sex and Typeof Position (Baseline vs. Midline)63
Table 41: Type of Service and Details of Service Provided to Youth in GBC64
Table 42: Number and Types of Services Available for Youth (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 43: LSOs Institutional Viability Scores
Table 44: Perceptions of Youth about Relevance and Quality of Programs, by Type of ProgramImplementer (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 45: Percentage of Youth in Midlevel and Senior Positions at AKRSP, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)

Table 46: Percentage Increase in Sales Price in Selected Value Chains (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 47: Percentage Increase in Annual Sales Volume in Select Value Chains (Baseline vs. Endline)68
Table 48: Female Youth with Control Over Financial Decision-making, by Region (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 49: Number and Type of Public Services and Practices that are Youth and Gender Sensitive70
Table 50: Participation of Young EELY Beneficiaries in Local Government after Elections in Chitral, 2015
Table 51: Young Women and Men in the Gilgit-Baltistan Legislative Assembly (Baseline vs. Endline).72
Table 52: Percentage of Youth Who Belong to Community Organization From Total Population, by sex(Baseline vs. Endline)72
Table 53: Average Monthly Gross Income (PKR), by Region, Sex and Beneficiary Status (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 54: Average Monthly Gross Income (PKR) by Region, Sex and Beneficiary Status (2017 Endline;EELY vs. Non-EELY)73
Table 55: Employment Status of Youth, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 56: Unemployment Status of Youth, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)
Table 57: Percentage of Self-Employed Youth by Sex and Region (2017 Endline; EELY vs. Non-EELY)74
Table 58: Percentage of Wage-Employed Youth by Sex, Region and Beneficiary Status (2017 Endline;         EELY vs. Non-EELY)
Table 59: Guide to Moser's Three-Role Terminology and its Connection to EELY Activities
Table 60: Assessment of Synergy between EELY and two Global Affairs' Funded Projects
Table 61: Number of DRR Trainings and Trainees, by Type of Training and Sex of Trainee

# Section A: Background and objectives

# I. Background and Rationale

EELY was a six-year (April 2011 to March 2017), CAD \$19.0 million project designed to increase engagement of male and female youth (between the ages of 18 and 35 years) as productive and full members of Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral (GBC) through two complementary components: youth employability and youth engagement and leadership. The youth employability component sought to enhance professional skills development and enterprise support services. The leadership component worked to promote engaged and empowered youth by enhancing youth participation in community and civic activities and institutions. It also worked to build the capacity of local institutions to support an enabling environment for youth development and youth decision makers. Both components were designed to be mutually reinforcing and interactive to most effectively achieve long term, sustainable results at scale.

Overall, EELY targeted 189,000 beneficiaries over the life of the project, almost half of whom were young women.

The following conceptual model depicts the logical relationship and interaction of EELY's different components both on the demand and supply sides to achieve its objectives and outcomes.



Figure 1: Programmatic approach for EELY project

The Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP) was responsible for the overall project implementation; Aga Khan Foundation Pakistan (AKFP) was responsible for inter-agency coordination, monitoring and grant management in Pakistan; and Aga Khan Foundation Canada (AKFC) was the executing agency and had the ultimate responsibility for project results and reporting to GAC. The project was implemented in nine districts<sup>1</sup> of Gilgit-Balistan (GB) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa's (KP) Chitral district (referred herein as GBC).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> These districts include: Gilgit, Hunza, Nagar, Astore, Diamer, Ghizer, Skardu, Shigar, Kharmang, and Ganche.

Pakistan is currently the sixth most populous country in the world with 191.71 million in 2015 at a growth rate of 1.92 percent and 60% belonging to the working age group of 15-59 years old.

Pakistan has a remarkably young age structure, and youth employment has remained one of the major concerns of the government. Youth in Pakistan face various disadvantages including limited job search expertise, a mismatch between education, aspirations and employers' requirements and a lack of mobility, among other factors. The government envisions long-term investment in human capital through formal and informal education as well as strategically strengthening the links between education and the labor market. Furthermore, the government aims to increase entrepreneurial activities among youth by providing business wisdom, inspiration and motivation by stressing the importance of business opportunities and demand-driven technical education along with entrepreneurial education to address youth unemployment.

# Gilgit-Baltistan (GB) and Chitral

Gilgit-Baltistan has never been formally integrated into the Pakistani state and does not participate in Pakistan's constitutional political affairs. Under the order granting self-rule to the people of GB in 2009, it became a de facto province without constitutionally becoming part of Pakistan. After inception of the first elected provincial government in GB in 2010, the provincial level departments and policies were gradually initiated and evolved over the time of the EELY project.

EELY spanned all ten districts of GB and one district of KP, Chitral, located in the most remote and isolated parts of northern Pakistan. GB and the neighbouring Chitral district have a combined population of more than 1.6 million people living in approximately 1,000 villages scattered over vast mountainous terrain. This population inhabits a total area of 87,346 km<sup>2</sup> with a population density of 14 persons per km<sup>2</sup>, compared with 166 persons per km<sup>2</sup> nationally. Much of the region rests 1,200 meters above sea level, and settled farming communities exist up to an altitude of 3,000 meters. While small in population and highly isolated compared with the rest of Pakistan, the target area's population is linguistically and religiously diverse. GBC contains adherents of Sunni (of the Deobandi, Ahle-hadith



Figure 2: EELY's operational geography, Gilgit-Baltistan province and Chitral district

and Barelvi sects), Shi'a Ithnashari, Shi'a Ismaili, Sufi and Imami Nurbukshi Islam as well as a small non-Muslim minority, the Kalash tribe in Chitral. Similarly there are variations in socio-cultural openness from the supportive communities of Hunza valley to the conservative district of Diamer.

Although geographically remote, GBC represents a critical border area, the stability and security of which has serious implications for the wider region. The diverse religious, ethnic and linguistic backgrounds enrich GBC, but also potentially expose it to a range of destabilizing forces including sectarian violence. The area also shares a significant border with Western China, where ethnic tensions were heightened during 2008 to 2010, and across which both China and Pakistan seek to expand ongoing border trade, investments and collaboration on security with recent Chinese investments of over \$46 billion in energy and infrastructure through the China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) project from Gilgit to the southern port city of Gawadar in Baluchistan province. Chitral also shares a long, porous border with Afghanistan, in which the AKDN and the Canadian Government are making significant investments to address extreme poverty, rebuild communities and address the issues of societal disillusionment among youth in some upper valleys of Gilgit and Chitral.

#### **Diamer District**



Figure 3: Map depicting the remote valleys of Diamer in south-west Gilgit-Baltistan

Diamer was included under EELY at the request of the GB government who considers youth engagement a key part of its stability agenda for the district.

The Diamer district is the most socially conservative and impoverished district of Gilgit-Baltistan with its population scattered across 23 villages with the majority living at altitudes over 6,000 feet. The population of the Diamer district is around 270,432 individuals (projected 2013) with women making up 48% of population in about 31,300 households of which only 10% live in urban areas.

The literacy rate in Diamer is 9% (national 58%) and female literacy is almost negligible at 0.020%. Unemployment, specifically among youth, is high because of the absence of both appropriate skills to compete in the job market and sufficient job opportunities in the district and elsewhere in Pakistan.

The majority of the villages remain cut off from the only major road, the Karakorum Highway, posing accessibility and livelihood problems and also greatly reducing the reach of the population to health and education facilities and services. These problems generally hamper and undermine any development initiatives undertaken in the district.

Limited economic opportunities coupled with conservative social norms and rigid customs have made life even more difficult and demanding for the women. As compared to other districts of GB, the women in Diamer face more hardship with limited access to educational and health facilities and income earning opportunities. Negligible numbers of women are involved in economic and productive activities in urban centres.

Capitalizing on the space created by providing support to the Diamer Poverty Alleviation Program (DPAP) by the government of GB, AKRSP decided to extend the EELY project to Diamer by providing financial and technical support to DPAP. The objective of this extension was to increase outreach with an incremental approach to help address the growing issue of poverty, extremism, and low livelihoods particularly amongst youth while also providing an entry point for AKRSP. This however was also a result of successful dialogue with key stakeholders particularly religious leaders and tribal elites, which for the first time allowed for communities' acceptance of AKRSP's support through DPAP.

# **EELY Target Population**

EELY defined its youth target group as individuals between the ages of 18 and 35 years (as opposed to the national range of 15 to 29<sup>2</sup> years) due to the later school graduation age and transition into adulthood in GBC. The table below shows the population of youth in the age bracket of 18 to 35 as projected for 2010, based on the Pakistan Census of 1998.

DISTRICT	TOTAL POPULATION - 2010			POPULATION 18-35 YEARS - 2010 PROJECTED					
DISTRICT	Female	Male	Total	Female	%	Male	%	Total	%
GILGIT	95,278	109,486	204,764	32,431	15.84	37,476	18.30	69,907	34.14
HUNZA-NAGAR	65,695	70,851	136,546	21,775	15.95	21,703	15.89	43,478	31.84
GHIZER	88,314	86,218	174,532	26,153	14.98	20,136	11.54	46,289	26.52
ASTORE	49,308	54,978	104,286	16,227	15.56	17,706	16.98	33,933	32.54
SKARDU	132,698	153,264	285,962	42,825	14.98	47,598	16.64	90,423	31.62
GHANCHE	49,770	53,195	102,966	15,834	15.38	15,941	15.48	31,775	30.86
CHITRAL	211,113	218,493	429,606	64,819	15.09	61,735	14.37	126,554	29.46
DIAMER	94,907	100,596	195,503	30,147	15.42	29,320	15.30	59,467	30.42
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	786,773	847,392	1,634,165	250,145	15.31	252,513	15.45	502,658	30.76

Table 1: Population Projected for 2010 (Government of Pakistan Statistics)

According to these projections, there were 502,658 youth between the age of 18 and 35 in GBC (252,513 young men and 250,145 young women), which amounted to 30.76% of the total projected population at the start of EELY.

# **Rationale for EELY**

According to the population projections of the GB government in 2010, there were more than 400,000 people in the labour force (defined as ages 15 to 65) in GBC, which was growing by an estimated 20,000 annually. Notably, of the total youth population in GBC, less than 50% were actively participating in the labour force. This number was highly gender imbalanced with 75% of men participating in the labour force compared to 25% of women.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ministry of Youth Affairs Pakistan: <u>http://www.moya.gov.pk/national\_youth\_policy.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Government of Pakistan, Statistics on Labor Participation, 2010.

The widespread and persistent youth unemployment, especially among young women, caused further social problems such as acute depression. Importantly, many of the employed youth did not make a sufficient income to meet their needs and hence remained economically vulnerable. Also, the school-going youth were not receiving education aligned with the needs of the labour market.

The GBC government did not have a formal skill development policy in place to address youth vocational training and skill development at the time of EELY inception. However, with support from the federal government's Skill-ing Pakistan Initiative, the National Vocational and Technical Training Commission (NAVTTC) had supported the Karakoram International University (KIU) to develop its Institute of Technical and Vocational Skills Development by establishing a training centre on the KIU campus. NAVTEC and the Gilgit-Baltistan Department of Education had started training centres in each district to train young women and men in various technical trades by the start of EELY in 2011. Other service providers that were addressing this gap through youth training initiatives included the private sector, AKRSP and other AKDN agencies, and NGOs in Chitral and GB on a limited scale. The subject of these trainings included fruit processing, wool processing, embroidery, computer technology, masonry, carpentry, plumbing, welding, refrigeration and electrical. Men tended to be trained in computers, masonry, and carpentry, while young women received training in fruit processing, wool processing, and embroidery.

The limited participation and leadership of youth, especially young women, in civil society and their roles in decision-making were attracting the attention of community organizations, development practitioners and governments in Pakistan and particularly in GBC.

The level of membership of youth in Village Organizations (VOs) and Women's Organizations (WOs) varied across the region, though were generally low. Young men were members of less than 20% of VOs in Gilgit and less than 40% in Baltistan, but 60% of VOs in Chitral. The participation of young women in WOs was comparatively lower than that of young men in VOs. For example, more than 87% of the WOs in Gilgit and 97% in Baltistan did not have any representation from young women, while nearly half of the WOs in Chitral had young women involved in their organizations.

# II. EELY Goal and Objectives

The basic premise of the project was that young women and men of the area will play a major role in determining the future direction of GBC and therefore, should be considered central players in the development process through their inclusion in decision-making bodies.

EELY, a six-year (April 2011 to March 2017) project with a total budget of CAD \$19 million (\$16 million from Global Affairs Canada and \$3 million from Aga Khan Foundation Canada), aimed to reach 63,000 youth directly in GBC, of which at least 40% would be young women as direct beneficiaries.

The project's ultimate outcome was increased engagement of youth as productive and full members in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral.

The project's ultimate outcome was expected to be achieved through two intermediate outcomes:

- 1. Increased and more equitable employability of young women and men in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral.
- 2. Increased and more equitable engagement between and among male and female youth leaders, community institutions and local government to address the needs of youth in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral.

The project's expected immediate outcome results were fourfold (two immediate results under each of the two intermediate results) which are as follows:

1.1 Sustainable improvement in quality, outreach and relevance of skill development services (technical, vocational and entrepreneurial) for young women and men.

- 1.2 Sustainable and more equitable integration of economic actors into effective market systems to improve youth livelihoods.
- 2.1 Improved and more equitable participation of young women and men in community and civic institutions.
- 2.2 Enhanced capacity of relevant community and state institutions to develop and extend enabling programs for the equal development of young women and men.

# III. Results

Against a target of benefitting 63,000 youth, the project has directly benefitted 77,680 youth; including 42,253 young men (54%) and 35,427 young women (46%). The details are provided in Table 2.

	Cumulative Target			Cumulative Achievement			Achievement as % of Target			Young women
Direct Beneficiary youth	Young women	Young men	Total	Young women	Young men	Total	Young women	Young women	Total	as % of total benefic iaries
Employable Skills	3,216	3,484	6,700	3,766	3,484	9,386	117	117	140	40%
Entrepreneurship & employment creation	3,318	3,594	6,912	3,783	3,594	7,194	114	114	104	53%
Sub-total: Youth Employability	6,534	7,078	13,612	7,549	7,078	16,580	116	116	122	46%
Participation & Leadership	6,943	7,522	14,465	7,842	7,522	18,236	113	113	126	43%
Institutional Development	16,763	18,160	34,923	20,037	18,160	42,864	120	120	123	47%
Youth Participation & Leadership	23,706	25,682	49,388	27,878	25,682	61,100	118	118	124	46%
Grand Total EELY	32,760	32,760	63,000	42,253	32,760	77,680	129	117	123	46%

Table 2: Cumulative Total of Young Women and Men Reached by the EELY Project Years 1 - 6

In addition to directly benefitting 77,680 youth in GBC, EELY has indirectly reached approximately 174,355 youth (81,501 young women, or 47%) in GBC against a target of 126,000. These numbers of indirect beneficiaries have been calculated from the outreach of EELY's mass-coverage activities under all four sub-components of the project. Details of the indirect reach is outlined in Table 3.

Table 3: Cumulative Total of Young Women and Young Men Indirectly Reached by the EELY Project Year 1 - 6

Components		Targets		Achievements		
	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total
Employable skills	13,481	20,119	33,600	18,654	20,119	46,495
Entrepreneurship & employment creation	22,176	28,224	50,400	30,686	28,224	69,742
Sub-total: Employability	35,657	48,343	84,000	49,341	48,343	116,237
Participation & Leadership	7,649	9,151	16,800	10,585	9,151	23,247
Institutional Development	10,836	14,364	25,200	14,995	14,364	34,871
Sub-total: Participation and Leadership	18,485	23,515	42,000	25,580	23,515	58,118
Grand Total:	58,898	67,102	126,000	81,501	67,102	174,355

Key results:

- Over the project period, a cumulative number of 2,249 youth including 1,167 young men and 1,082 young women have been provided with professional internships. Data from tracer studies conducted on EELY internship graduates have shown that 48% of young men and 41% of young women became fully employed in public and private sector organizations within six months of completion.
- Under the marketable skills development program, a total of 3,361 youth, including 2,184 young men and 1,177 young women, have been trained in a wide range of technical skills such as: plumbing, carpentry, auto mechanics, electric, beauty, construction machinery operator, porters, cooking, tailoring, embroidery, handicrafts, and fruit and vegetable processing.
- Since baseline the average monthly income of EELY beneficiaries has risen from PKR 8,603 to 21,253 (almost PKR 4,000 higher than non-participants). Results are particularly impressive in Chitral where young men from the EELY project make an average of PKR 34,698 (compared to PKR 14,333 of non-participating men) and young women make PKR 19,388 (compared to PKR 6,375 of non-participating women).
- A key indicator of economic empowerment is the ability to make decisions over financial assets; since the baseline the proportion of young women who make joint or sole decisions on how to use their money has increased from 58.4% to 95.8% among EELY beneficiaries.
- Combined with increased regional stability, the availability of improved tourism services, widescale destination promotion, and publicity interventions led by youth under EELY, the number of tourists to GBC has increased from 30,000 in 2012 to 250,000 in 2015. The government of Gilgit-Baltistan has acknowledged the role that EELY has played in this sharp increase during the 2016 project steering committee.
- The Young Community Leadership Development Program (YCLDP) and the local support organization (LSO) capacity building programs have resulted in increased participation of youth in community organizations. An YCLDP study and labour market assessment (LMA) midline survey have confirmed that 40% of young men and 31% of young women are serving community organisations in management/leadership roles.
- As a result of EELY's youth focus, there is increased GB government and private sector support for youth development, specifically skills delivery, internships and gender equality (i.e. the GB government contributed PKR 4.4m towards internships over the last three years and have agreed to extend for two years beyond EELY).

# Section B: Summary Description of the Project

# I. Management and Organization

AKRSP was responsible for overall EELY project implementation through a dedicated team based at the GBC regional offices. An AKRSP core office in Gilgit led on EELY initiatives that had a general bearing on EELY progress in all regions such as engagement and dialogue with key stakeholders and some of the cross-cutting activities. AKFP was responsible for inter-agency coordination, monitoring and grant management/compliance; and AKFC as the executing agency had the ultimate responsibility for project compliance, results and reporting to Global Affairs Canada. AKFC also provided necessary technical assistance to build capacity of the AKRSP team in delivering the required project results.

*Aga Khan Rural Support Program:* AKRSP was responsible for implementing the project in GBC with the cooperation and active participation of local stakeholders, mainly LSOs, the GB government and the district administration in Chitral. AKRSP was also responsible for providing information against the PMF indicators and for producing annual work plans, semi-annual reports, budgets and financial reports, monitoring and evaluation reports, results-based management documents as well as other updates/information for review and inputs for AKFP and AKFC, as required for the implementation of the project.

**AKF Pakistan:** AKFP was responsible for grant management, compliance, technical assistance and liaising with government and other stakeholders at the national level. AKFP also facilitated and supported AKRSP in coordinating EELY initiatives with other AKDN agencies working in the GBC region. AKFP also had the responsibility for managing, transferring and reporting on the funds received from AKFC to AKRSP. AKFP further facilitated and supported AKRSP in annual work planning, developing and finalizing narrative and financial reports and annual budgets for submission to AKFC. AKFP was also responsible for liaising with Global Affairs Canada in Pakistan on all project related matters including responding to queries and arranging/facilitating field visits by Global Affairs Canada to GBC.

*AKF Canada:* Aga Khan Foundation Canada acted as the executing agency and was ultimately accountable to Global Affairs Canada for project compliance and results. AKFC worked with AKFP and AKRSP to develop and review project strategies, and had the responsibility for project results and submission of financial and narrative reporting to Global Affairs Canada. It provided guidance, oversight and direct technical support to AKRSP as relevant towards the production of annual work plans, narrative reports, budgets and financial reports, monitoring and evaluation systems, results-based management documents, and other project documentation. AKFC conducted project monitoring visits to review progress towards achievement of results, lessons learned, and challenges, and assessment of capacity building needs especially in areas such as gender, M&E, and environmental sustainability. A key responsibility of AKFC was to arrange high quality technical assistance to build capacity of the implementing partner and support project implementation. AKFC also prepared the agenda for and coordinated the project steering committee meetings in consultation with AKFP, AKRSP, and Global Affairs Canada.

AKFC also managed the Canadian-based activities of EELY including recruiting Canadian technical assistance/consultants, linkages with Canadian institutions, placing Canadian young professionals with the implementing partner, and engaging the Canadian public and government through development of education activities including events and discussions on key lessons from the project, developing communication material and dissemination of Canada's contribution to development through EELY.

**Project Steering Committee (PSC):** At the strategic level, a PSC was formed as a forum for discussion between key partners and to review progress and lessons as well as provide overall guidance on the project. The committee met once a year to provide strategic recommendations based on achievements and challenges faced during project implementation. Typically AKFC and Global Affairs Canada chaired the meetings. The composition of membership included Global Affairs Canada, AKFC, AKFP, AKRSP,

representatives of GB government, KP government and Chitral district administration, and representatives of KIU and the rural support programs network (RSPN).

# II. Description of Activities

EELY consisted of four interrelated components, summarized and tabulated below:

Table 4: EELY Components: Concept, Approach and Main Deliverables

	YOUTH EN	<b>IPLOYABILITY</b>	YOUTH L	EADERSHIP	
Component	Employable Skills	Employment and Self- Employment	Leadership	Institutional Development	
Concept	Preparing youth for the labour market.	Preparing the labour market for youth.	Preparing youth for community engagement.	Preparing community and State institutions for youth engagement.	
Approach	Widening the availability of skills development services for youth that are relevant to the labour market.	Supporting targeted reforms and support for potential employment and enterprise opportunities that will increase employment and self-employment opportunities for youth.	Strengthening youth leadership competencies to enable them to participate constructively in civil society and community development.	Improving the receptivity and ability of community institutions to ensure youth participation in programs and supporting youth- friendly state policies and programs.	
Main Deliverables	Labour market and training needs analysis. Strong and more relevant skills for employment programs.	Quality business information. Selected market and enterprise support services.	Youth mobilization programs. Youth leadership programs.	Youth development programs implemented through LSOs. Public sector youth development policies.	

Under its public engagement component, AKFC carried out a number of activities that showcased the results, achievements and lessons learned under EELY in order to enhance Canadians' understanding of the value of investing in youth leadership and livelihoods in northern Pakistan. Specific target groups included post-secondary students, members of the public and the international development community. Activities included the development of a communications strategy, which guided content collection missions in the field, the production of engaging communications content, exhibits and displays, and public events.

# III. Stakeholders, their Roles and Responsibilities

EELY, over its six years of implementation, worked with a number of local, community based, public and private sector stakeholders to mainstream youth in GBC. AKRSP has a continuous presence in the area and continues to engage these stakeholders through a variety of other development initiatives which has cemented a solid working relationship and created a supportive environment to expand a local development agenda even to the remotest and most isolated parts of the region.

EELY engaged and worked closely with the community based organizations across all the 11 districts of GBC. These included: 85 LSOs who were active partners in implementing EELY and activities at village level through more than 4,000 VOs, WOs, and youth organizations and groups. These LSOs played a key role in information dissemination to youth and member communities about skill development and other activities, selection and nomination of youth for trainings, organizing events at community level e.g. sports, exhibitions, etc.

On the service provision side, EELY partnered with many public and private sector organizations to deliver on its key interventions under all the four project components, including AKDN agencies such as Aga Khan Cultural Services (AKCS) who participated in promoting greenwood value chain and skill development program; Professional Development Centres Gilgit and Chitral (PDCN) who participated in delivering training, counselling, internships etc.; FOCUS Humanitarian Assistance and Gilgit-Baltistan Disaster Management Authority (GBDMA) who jointly participated in disaster risk reduction (DRR) activities implemented under EELY; Aga Khan Youth and Sports Boards (AKYSB) who helped plan and organize youth sports events; Aga Khan Economic Planning Board (AKEPB) and Aga Khan Planning and Building Services (AKPBS) who supported in the internship and skill development programs.

NAVTTC, the Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA), Department of Labor and Industries provided technical support in delivery of marketable technical skills to youth, Department of Youth, Planning and Development Department and KIU helped in hiring and placement of freshly graduated youth under the internships program; delivery of enterprise development trainings and jobplacement of trained youth in the private sector, organizing sports, etc. The Gilgit-Baltistan Legislative Authority (GBLA), and the KP government supported in implementing all the EELY activities besides participating in public-private partnership events, festivals, exhibitions, exposure visits, policy advocacy events, and youth policy development.

# Section C: Analytical Review of the Project

# I. Planned and Achieved Goal and Objectives

Immediate Outcome 1.1: Sustainable improvement in quality, outreach and relevance of skill development services (technical, vocational and entrepreneurial) for young women and men



Photo 1: Ruzeena Shaheen and Naila Bano are preparing a stage for a wedding. They run a small business in Gilgit called The Decor, which was started with a small cash award received during seven-day entrepreneurship training.

Outputs under this outcome aimed to improve the outreach and relevance of skills development services for young women and men by undertaking ongoing market assessments that examine the demand and supply of labour and employment, and build the capacity of identified institutions through a range of customized technical inputs, linkages and market information.

EELY helped service providers think beyond traditional training mechanisms by facilitating pilot projects that roll out successful innovations in employable skill development programs including variations of on-the-job training, apprenticeships and private sector coaching. The existing service providers were also helped to assess their business models, facilitate self-sustaining business practices, support improvements in training curriculums, facilitate standard setting and accreditation, and promote linkage of trainees to the job market besides supporting them in improving workplace ethics, especially for receiving and working with women e.g. women instructors were not available with existing service providers, but after engagement with EELY and the gender and development (GaD) team, more service providers hired or contracted women instructors and some young women themselves evolved as service providers.

Output 1.1.1: Comprehensive labor market and skills development survey, analysis and report completed

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Labor Market Surveys	3	3	0
Mini Surveys	6	9	+3
Qualitative Labor Market Studies	6	21	+15
Management information system (MIS)	1	1	0

An EELY baseline market assessment of the demand and supply of labour and employment in the target area was conducted, identifying vocational fields with the highest potential for employment and business start-ups, and mapping existing and potential providers of training services. This survey included four sub-surveys: (i) the labor force survey; (ii) the employers' survey; (iii) the youth skills development service providers' survey; and (iv) youth perceptions survey. The findings of this baseline LMA provided a basis for planning and helped set directions for the relevant and responsive youth employability-related interventions of EELY.

A midline survey was conducted in 2014-15 to compare the progress of the project against the baseline, which included three sub-surveys: (i) employers' survey; (ii) skills development service providers' survey; and (iii) youth perceptions survey. The labor force survey was not included in the midline survey due to limitations of time and cost and more importantly shortcomings in baseline findings which did not contribute directly to PMF indicators of EELY. Instead tracer studies on selected key interventions were undertaken to report on the midline status of the outcome indicators as included in the PMF.

By the end of EELY, an end of project evaluation was commissioned which included two of the sub-surveys from baseline and midline surveys: (i) youth skills and perception survey; and (ii) employers survey. These surveys were backed up with focus group discussions and key informant interviews during the end of project evaluation to gather data on the endline status of the outcome indicators.<sup>4</sup>

In addition to the baseline, midline and end of project market surveys, a total of 21 major studies were carried out during the project period on flagship interventions, which include ten studies under the employability component and 11 studies under the leadership component. The following is the list of these studies which have been shared with Global Affairs Canada and other stakeholders.

#### **Employability:**

- 1. Assessment of Effectiveness of Local National Training/Service Providers and Partners.
- 2. Evaluation of Skill Development Program
- 3. Assessment of Youth Internship Program
- 4. Impact Evaluation of Youth Micro Challenge Award Round 1 and 2
- 5. Assessment of Perceptions of Beneficiaries of EELY Leadership and Employability Activities
- 6. Tracer Study on Enterprise Development Program
- 7. Tracer Study on Skill Development Program
- 8. Tracer Study on Value Chain Study
- 9. Assessment of Apprenticeship program

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> This study was actually a replacement of the LMA endline survey, which was not conducted for the following reasons: (i) the LMA was most suitable for project planning and appraisal at the start of the project and was not an ideal tool for measuring the impact or progress as the endline; (ii) it did not include all the PMF results indicators of EELY; (iii) it collected data on a wide range of market indicators and variables which were not needed or were irrelevant to the EELY context; (iv) the midline survey suffered from issues of traceability of respondents of the baseline LMA; and (v) most significantly, restrictions imposed by the government on field enumeration and data collection in all areas of GBC due to security reasons.

10. An Assessment of Community-Based Skills Development Trainings in Chitral

# B. Leadership:

- 11. Evaluation of Young Community Leadership Development Program (YCLDP)
- 12. Linkages and Partnership Development of LSOs in Gilgit-Baltistan
- 13. Assessment of Public Sector Engagement for Youth Development in GBC under EELY Project
- 14. Post Internship Gender Review Report
- 15. Tracer Study on Youth Life Skills Program
- 16. Impact of Trainings on the Institutional Capacity of LSOs
- 17. Assessment of Youth Development Plans of LSOs
- 18. Assessment of AKRSP Supported LSO's Initiatives in Developing and Implementing Youth Development Plans in Gilgit
- 19. Assessment of AKRSP staff Capacity Building and Youth Induction Plan
- 20. Sustainability of LSOs: Gap Analysis for Capacity Development of LSOs in Downward Accountability
- 21. An Assessment of Young Professional Development Program

# Management Information System (MIS)

The need for an MIS emerged early in the project due to the difficulty in tracking youth beneficiaries. Previous independent evaluations had articulated the point that AKRSP needed to bolster its technical capacity in tracking large populations. In turn, the Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning for Development (MELD), an online MIS, was developed and implemented from the fourth year of EELY. Sectorial staff, regional and core office-based management teams were provided orientation and training to use the MELD for internal management, monitoring and evaluation purposes. The accumulative historic monitoring data from inception to year four was transferred from conventional MS-office software to MELD and was made fully operational in Year 5 replacing all existing M&E tools and instruments. At project close, the MELD system was tracking the beneficiaries of seven major interventions. According to the endline report MELD has "no doubt contributed to the high rate of achievement of project targets," by improving documentation, limiting duplication of results, and increasing efficiency.

Post-EELY, MELD will be gradually adapted for other AKRSP projects, and allow them to link EELY beneficiaries to future opportunities.

# **Output 1.1.2 Capacity of Service Providers built**

# Indicator 1.1.2.1: # of skill development service providers supported

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Skill Development Service Providers Supported	18	25	+7
Courses (Specific Trades) Strengthened	10	12	+2

The support ranged from training of trainers, provision of funds, equipment, training material, furniture and renovation of their respective training facilities to promote the market relevant trades and vocational skills identified through the LMA baseline survey. Gender sensitization sessions were also conducted for promoting an enabling environment and a code of conduct was introduced where young mothers were provided day care facilities.

Three other examples of gender responsive changes include:

- Day care facilities and breast-feeding areas in some service providers;
- Trainers guided on how to make curriculum language and instruction methods more gender sensitive; and
- For non-traditional trades where women might feel intimidated, or threatened by male colleagues, separate sessions were held, some led by female facilitators.

The training courses offered by these service providers covered 12 sectors and/or trades including: IT, onlinecommerce, early childhood development, green-wood product manufacturing industry, mountaineering and tourism, heavy machinery operating trainings for construction industry, tailoring and embroidery, and driving for police officers. They also offered courses supporting apple, apricot, capsicum, and potato value chains.

Regions	Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4	Y5	Y6	TOTAL
Gilgit		3	3	2		-	8
Baltistan	1	2	1	1		-	5
Chitral		3	2	1		-	6
Diamer		-	-	2	1	-	3
Core			-	1	2	-	3
Total	1	8	6	7	3	-	25

Table 5: Number of Skill Development Service Providers Supported, by Year and Region

The training centres operated by the 25 supported service providers have been strengthened in an effort to get them to run on a sustainable basis in both public and private sectors. These training centres were equipped with relevant machinery, equipment, training material and trained trainers for the delivery of marketable skills to youth for accessing gainful employment.

 Table 6: Number of Skill Development Service Providers Supported, by Year and Type of Support

Years	Type of Support	Total
Y1	Mountaineering training and provision of equipment	1
Y2	Master trainers training for service providers staff on training delivery and upgrading of training facility	3
Y2	Financial and technical support for green-wood, apple and apricot value chain development	5
Y3	Technical and vocational training centres supported with provision of machinery and equipment and training in new trades and skills	6
Y4	Enhanced technical capacity of technical training institutes by providing training equipment, renovation of training centres and assistance in adding new market relevant trades and skills	7
Y5	Upgrading of KADO training centres with provision of computers, equipment and internet facility for new E-learning courses and internet-based freelancing	1
Y5	Provision of equipment and furniture and related material to driving school in Chilas Diamer	1
Y5	Mountain School of Economics supported with training and material on cross-border trade management in the backdrop of CPEC	1
	Total no. of service providers supported	25

After the conclusion of EELY, the centres will provide training to 3,000 young women and men every year across GBC.

Despite the support, some deficiencies still remain within the TVET service providers. A 2016 study conducted by Seneca International found:

- Smaller private training service providers have a number of challenges that prevent them from achieving a higher level of trainings and trainee outcomes. Their equipment is limited, with most students only having limited exposure to technical tools.
- The sustainability of the service providers is precarious. During the AKRSP service providers survey 46% mentioned this as a challenge, which was also apparent during the field assessment. The general financial model relies on government funding on a per-student basis.
- Female beneficiaries are still hesitant to enter non-traditional programs due to the classroom environment, lack of female instructors, and lack of clear market opportunities. As a result a majority of the women trained under EELY were trained in courses such as sewing, fashion design and embroidery.

Indicator 1.1.2.2: # of networks of service providers formed

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
No. of networks formed	18	115	-7
Participation of service providers in key sector events	38	32	-6
and/or forums and learning trips			

These networks and associations were provided with technical and financial assistance in formation, including setting up the office and organizational structure and management system, legal registration, provision of basic supplies and equipment, capacity building through training and exposure visits, and developing linkages with national and international market entities.

EELY also provided opportunities for skills training service providers to participate in different sector events and/or forums and undertake learning trips for the advancement of learning standards, interactive sessions for exchange of innovative ideas and experiences, fostering partnerships and linkages of partners.

The remaining target of seven networks and/or associations was abandoned based due to lessons learned from the process of forming and supporting the initial 11 networks or associations:

- The targeted priority value chains, such as gems and jewelry, arts and crafts, tourism, high value horticulture, and greenwood, were entirely covered by the 11 network associations formed.<sup>6</sup>
- Secondly, other major key trade sectors, such as border trade, commerce, dairy, agriculture, and mining, already had their own existing associations.
- Thirdly, the service providers in sub-sectors of these key value chains were not interested in forming lower level associations in addition to the higher level associations to which they already belonged.

# Output 1.1.3 Training and apprenticeship programs for youth on marketable skills delivered

Indicator 1.1.3.1: # of participants in transition programs (apprenticeships, placement)

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Professional skills and transition support for university	2,0007	3.361	+1.361
and skilled graduates	2,000	5,501	1,501

The objective of this output was to enhance competencies and technical and soft skills of youth, increase awareness of TVET-related skills development opportunities and job markets, provide skills in key trades, and facilitate practical on-the-job placements/apprenticeships with private and public sector institutions.

Table 7 presents the project performance against this indicator over the six-year project period:

 Table 7: Number of Participants in Transition Programs (Apprenticeships, Placements), by Year and Sex

Years	Young women	Young men	Total achieved
Year-1	16	29	45
Year-2	93	166	260

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The associations /networks included: Zumlukh Business Women Association- Baltistan, Chitral Apple Growers, Apple Farmer Association, Pakistan Gems, Nayyab School of Arts, Chitral Skill Development Network, Five Star Gems and Jewelry Centre, Dar Ul Hunar Handicrafts, Gulmit Carpet Centre and Chewdok Girls Forum, Chitral.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Greenwood refers to wood which has recently been cut and has not had the opportunity to dry by evaporation. In GBC, greenwood generally refers to poplar, which grows quicker and can be replenished and offset. To avoid reducing forest cover, greenwood can be used as a conservation effort.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> At the PIP the target was 4,000 when this activity was combined with the Youth Internship Program. Due to the high profile of both activities, the Youth Internship Program was transformed into a dedicated output with a target of 2,000, also reducing the target of utput 1.1.3 2,000.

Years	Young women	Young men	Total achieved
Year-3	438	815	1,253
Year-4	411	743	1,154
Year-5	219	431	650
Year-6	-	-	-
Total:	1,177	2,184	3,361

The major themes of these employable skills trainings were; beautician, auto-mechanics, construction, heavy machinery operators, tile fixing, wood carving, cooking, dress making, land surveying and estimation, painting, AutoCad, electrification, health, ECD, trade management, solar panel design, wind-turbine repair, plumbing, carpentry, ICT, tourism, tailoring, mountaineering, bags manufacturing, mountain agriculture and mechanical, masonry, hotel management, office automation, office administration and management. The target of 2,000 was over-achieved by 1,361 due to the demand of GBC's unemployed youth and ensuring a wider outreach to remote and underserved areas.



Photo 2: Irfan Rashid from Ayun valley is cutting tile using advanced tools. He is participating in a practical placement after attending the skill development program.

Over 300 women participated in non-traditional training, such as electrical repair and carpentry. Their participation increased with an increase of female instructors and other provisions were made to increase comfort in the learning environment.

In line with the findings of the LMA survey, EELY designed training programs for selected trades and themes by working with the KIU, AKPBS, AKTC, NAVTEC and private sector, to enhance training, mentoring and on-the-job skill development programs. EELY specifically promoted women's integration into the construction and enterprise sectors by helping to facilitate tailored programs, Such as mentoring and apprenticeship components designed to ensure women's maximum participation and gainful employment.

Among these trained youth, 1,200 graduate trainees have received extended trainings (>1 month) in different trades, such as construction machinery, auto-mechanics, survey and estimation of civil works, and ECD.

Out of these trained youth, 1,216 including 754 young men and 462 young women were placed for apprenticeships with auto workshops, the furniture making industry, hotels, engineering firms, plumbers, ICT and ECD centres, LSOs, AKDN agencies, and government departments, etc. A tracer study, conducted by AKRSP, found that the Skills Development Program contributed towards a 6% increase in employment within six months of completion (from 5% to 11%).

The endline review of EELY's skill development program was largely positive: "the Skill Development Program provided highly needed skills to young women and men, including specialized skills."

However, one significant criticism did emerge from the focus group discussions with former interns, which is that the variable lengths of the trainings meant that some of the beneficiaries of the shorter trainings (<1 month) felt they did not receive enough training to confidently enter the job market.

An unexpected result that emerged from this output is the role that ECD training had in offsetting women's reproductive roles. While ECD is often considered an extension of traditional gendered child-rearing roles, and access to ECD training considered a practical gender need, the increased availability of more ECD services meant that more women could enter the workforce, since they could offset some of their duties. While EELY's original scope did not suggest that it would have targeted interventions aimed at the reproductive sphere, this result helped EELY usher more women into the workforce, and local organizations.

# *Indicator 1.1.3.2: # of awareness raising campaigns for youth about job market information and skill development opportunities facilitated*

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Awareness Raising Campaigns	36	54	+18

These sensitization and awareness raising campaigns included information on marketable skills, entrepreneurship opportunities, sharing of key findings of the LMA, opportunities for women's self-employment, ECD training, crafts, high value horticulture, retailing related skills, economic sectors, tourism, resource mobilization, peace and development, and women's participation in non-traditional skills and trades. It is estimated that more than 5,000 young women and men directly participated in these 54 awareness raising sessions and campaigns over six years. Since the creation of the GBC Youth Portal created under output 2.1.1, awareness campaigns were also put online with average daily hits of up to 4,200 in Year 6 and 4.2 million cumulative website visits.

EELY placed a special emphasis on increasing awareness of available training programs and associated support measures. LSOs and their constituent networks played a key role in supporting outreach to isolated communities and connecting youth with training and development programs that were relevant to the local labor market and skills and aspirations of individual young women and men. EELY ensured that the divergent challenges of young women and men were incorporated into awareness campaigns. For example, specific efforts were made to raise young women's awareness of non-traditional employment opportunities as a means to expand the scope of possible vocational opportunities, and at the same time sensitize the general public to issues of gender equality within the marketplace. As a result, combined with pre-training efforts, more young women participated in nontraditional TVET skills like electricians and carpenters and some of the young women evolved into TVET service providers. Communication material with gendered messages were developed and disseminated in LSOs to further disseminate to communities and member organizations.

# 1.1.4 Internships provided to fresh graduates for increased employment



Photo 3: Ambreen was an intern at Karakoram Area Development Organization (KADO) in Karimabad, Hunza-Nagar managing projects related to youth capacity building in Hunza-Nagar.

#### Indicator 1.1.4.1: # of participants in internships

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Internship Opportunities for University Graduates	2,000	2,249	+249

The aim of the internship program, on one hand, was to contribute towards improving access of fresh university graduates to employment in the job market; and on the other hand, was to help establish permanent mechanisms to ensure continuity and scaling up of the internships with government and private sector organizations so that young women and men graduating from universities every year could be provided with basic skills and experience required to access the job market and secure employment.

AKRSP together with service providers like KIU, LSOs, government line departments and other AKDN organizations, facilitated the internship program. A standardized process was followed for implementing and managing the internship program whereby opportunities were advertised in local newspapers and online through the EELY supported Youth Portal; and the short-listed candidates had to appear and compete through a written test. The successful candidates went through a one-week orientation followed by a week-long training conducted by the staff of AKRSP. Topics of the training included interview skills, life skills, communication skills, stress management, online job search and the basics of pre-interview research. After the training, the interns were placed with different organizations based on relevancy of their existing skillsets for one to three month experiential learning.

Voore	Gil	Gilgit		Baltistan		itral Core Diamer		n Chitral		ner	То	tal Intern	15
Years	YW	YM	YW	YM	YW	YM	YW	М	YW	YM	YW	YM	Total
Y1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	
Y2	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	15	-	-	10	15	25
Y3	14	16	25	27	22	23	8	9	-	-	69	75	144

Table 8: Number of Internships Provided to Fresh Graduates, by Year, Sex and Region

Years	Gilgit		Balti	stan	Chit	Chitral		Core		ner	To	tal Interi	15
rears	YW	YM	YW	YM	YW	YM	YW	Μ	YW	YM	YW	YM	Total
Y4	50	67	8	47	45	36	-	-	-	29	103	179	282
Y5	37	49	29	38	37	38	140	209	-	15	243	349	592
Y6	187	263	215	35	165	146	31	56	71	37	669	537	1206
Total	288	395	277	147	269	243	189	289	71	81	1094 (49%)	1155 (51%)	2249

Some of the key institutions facilitating placements for the internships were: (i) State Bank of Pakistan; (ii) Aga Khan Planning and Building Services (AKPBSP); (iii) Aga Khan Education Services (AKESP); (iv) private schools and colleges; (v) community and civil-society institutions, and to a smaller extent; and (vi) the private sector.

EELY experienced some initial difficulty in finding hosts for interns due to the limited professional market available in GBC. Starting in Year 5, EELY revised its strategy including:

- Signing an MOU with the Human Resource Development Network in Islamabad to help find placements for interns;
- Directly targeting the private sector to take on more interns; and
- In special cases, such as Diamer, entrance criteria was relaxed to reflect the available skills, while still meeting the demands of the hosts.

"The internship gave a push to understanding career selection and starting a career. The learning during YIP was more valuable than knowledge acquired during my academic career, and resulted in my getting a job." – Male endline FGD participant, Chitral

A tracer study was conducted on the Youth Internship Program (YIP) during Year 5, which indicates about 46% of the interns have been able to secure jobs in their respective field of interest, six months post internship. From those employed, 53% were young women and 47% young men. Eighty-six percent of the interns found the internship program effective and relevant to their needs in engaging with the labour market.

Young women seemed to particularly benefit from the internship program and used it to pursue entry into the labor market as it increased both their confidence level and practical skills. In District Diamer the first batch of 20 young women who went through the internship program were placed in government girls schools of which 17 got employed by the government education department. This was the first such opportunity for young women in Diamer.<sup>8</sup>

The endline study found that the internship program had other impacts beyond employment:

- A change in the attitude of parents towards their daughters was noted, particularly in less developed parts of the region. According to female participants, the internship placement showed parents and husbands that young women could work in a safe environment, which increased their support for them pursuing employment, including in non-traditional sectors.
- The successful extension of the YIP to 71 young women in Diamer had a significant impact on the social acceptability of young women pursuing education and trades within the district. Prior to EELY, no young women were able to pursue training or engage within a trade; but after the YIP, AKRSP and their local partners the DPAP have been approached for more training opportunities, particularly for women.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The step-by-step strategy for this has been extensively covered in a case-study provided to Global Affairs Canada, as part of the "Women's Economic Empowerment in Practice: ADDRESSING GENDERED BARRIERS TO ACCESS AND SUCCESS" summary.

An external consultant, Frida Kahn, in the women's economic empowerment (WEE) evaluation referenced the internships as one of the key strengths:

One of the main strengths of EELY has been its focus on young, professional, educated women through the youth internship program. Development projects often neglect to address the issues of such women, targeting the poor and less educated as beneficiaries instead. However, women who are already educated can, with a small intervention, make a significant gain since they have a strong foundation to begin from. This program, unlike the skills development one, starts from a higher point in the empowerment index. These are women who have already engaged in or aspiring to productive employment, and therefore already renegotiating gender roles and relations. Focused on women's and men's employment at mid-management levels, the internship program aims to give them the workplace skills and knowledge to participate in management, decisionmaking and leadership roles. For women, the program relies on a high level of conscientization, an awareness that women's work is important and they can work at par with men.

Three areas of recommendation emerged during the endline study and WEE evaluation:

- The YIP needs to be redesigned in areas where internship placements are hard to find;
- The duration of the internship (two to three months) was considered too short by some participants and should be extended in order to allow interns to gain confidence and complete entire sets of tasks; and
- Employers should have a pre-training on how to incorporate female interns into the workplace with regular follow-up. Both reports mentioned that EELY's weakness was in its direct intervention with employers.

Immediate Outcome 1.2: Sustainable and more equitable integration of economic actors into effective market systems to improve youth livelihoods



Photo 4: Four women entrepreneurs opened an electric repair shop in their neighborhood of 750 households after receiving a Youth Micro Challenge award. They attended a month long training on electrical repair in Skardu, Gilgit-Baltistan and became the first women to engage in this non-traditional trade in their community.

This component facilitated strengthening market mechanisms and support services for potential growth markets by promoting linkages between entrepreneurs and markets. Contributing to an expansion of commercial market activity relevant to youth in GBC, the project supported increased income opportunities specifically for young females and males. In support of this objective, the project analyzed and strengthened potential enterprise opportunities by identifying a selected set of four subsectors with market growth potential and addressed the constraints that helped strengthen the marketing positions of entrepreneurs and enterprises. These value chain sub-sectors, as identified in the LMA baseline survey, included tourism, construction, horticulture, and greenwood industries.

# Output 1.2.1 Potential employment and enterprise opportunities and key constraints assessed in six to eight sub-sectors

EELY analyzed potential enterprise opportunities by identifying four economic sub-sectors (tourism, construction, high value horticulture, and greenwood) with the greatest potential for market growth and equitable employment or self-employment opportunities for both young women and men.

Careful market analyses were conducted with a pro-youth, pro-poor, environmentally sustainable, and gender equality lens, to determine interventions that could maximize the potential for expansion and sustainability. More specifically, the various linkages along each identified subsector's value chain were analyzed and interventions were implemented; processing, packaging, marketing, transportation and the constraints thereof were identified, including socio-cultural constraints for women (for example, families often do not allow women to enter into non-traditional trades and the mobility of women is

restricted) that prevented the market from reaching its full potential in terms of entrepreneurial and employment opportunities for male and female youth and affirmative actions like lowering qualification criteria were conceived and implemented to maximize the benefit to women. This acknowledged the additional educational and financial barriers that young women had to overcome and significantly increased women's participation. Despite the lower criteria, there was no significant observable difference in performance.

#### Indicator 1.2.1.1: # of subsectors assessed

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Sub-Sectors assessed	6 - 8	15	+7

EELY assessed 15 sub-sectors against a project target of six to eight, as outlined in Table 9.

Table 9: Number of Subsectors Assessed, by Region and Year

Years	Sub-Sectors Assessed	Location	Total
Y1	Apricot, mulberry, potato, honey, tourism, organic meat, construction, and gemstones	GBC	8
Y2	Apple, greenwood, and domestic tourism	GBC	3
Y4	Peas, walnut, capsicum and pine nut	Diamer	4
	Total no. of sub-sectors assessed		15

During the assessment process, meetings were held with local business leaders, support service providers, communities, government officials, NGOs, and young women and men. These sectors were selected for assessment based on the criteria for establishing industry, including number of small and medium enterprises, number of employment opportunities, volume of production, volume of sales, environmental friendliness, resource base, cost-effectiveness, growth potential, comparative advantage, marketability, barriers to entry and participation of women, and availability of resources for interventions.

Based on these 15 assessment studies, a total of seven value chains were selected to develop and implement interventions at production, processing and marketing levels aimed at creating jobs and promoting employability for young women and men. The seven selected value chains included:

- 1. Greenwood
- 2. Apple
- 3. Domestic tourism
- 4. Peas
- 5. Walnuts
- 6. Pine nuts
- 7. Capsicum

# Indicator 1.2.1.2: # of value chain development plans developed

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Value Chain Development Plans	2 - 4	7	+3

Value chain development (VCD) plans for the sub-sectors of greenwood, apple, and domestic tourism were developed and selected interventions were implemented starting from Year 2, while the four VCD plans for peas, walnuts, pine nuts and capsicum were developed and selected interventions were supported only in Diamer district, starting from Year 4.

As planned, the two VCDs with the highest potential for women's absorption (greenwood and apple) were reviewed with the lens of promoting women's economic empowerment.

WEE recommendations from the externally-performed VCD for greenwood included:

# **29** | P a g e | **EELY End of Project Report**

- Increase women's bargaining power to play a role in direct marketing;
- Increase women's technical skills in product development in the greenwood value chain and help bring them into the market through initial hand-holding so they can perform as independent artisans and entrepreneurs in the local and national market; and
- Raise awareness among men along the greenwood value chain, to create an enabling environment among potential buyers.

Output 1.2.2 Support services and linkages strengthened in selected value chains



Photo 5: Iftikhar Hussain, 30, runs Apple House and distributes apples grown in his village of Pari in Kharmang District. He has attended Apple Value Chain Training, and received a Youth Micro Challenge Award of PKR 150,000 to set up his apple business. His yearly income has increased from PKR 30,000 to PKR 100,000 a year.

EELY worked to address the specific market constraints identified in the value chain analysis and facilitated the strengthening of existing market mechanisms. EELY facilitated the strengthening of institutions and actors to provide market information, services and critical linkages to other value chain components. EELY also identified generic market linkages, such as storage, packaging, transportation or marketing that were relevant for more than one economic sub-sector, and provided relevant support (described in detail under indicator 1.2.2.2). This activity included targeted strategies to address the socio-cultural constraints of young women such as:

- Engaging women in innovative ways to add value addition to projects;
- Intensive trainings on packaging and marketing to get women's products to elite markets which are less discriminatory;
- Expose women to national and international markets;
- Have targeted sessions on bargaining for women in the market place; and
- Introduce women to buyers and sellers who will negotiate with them fairly.

Most of the enterprise support services were within the agri-based sector (such as agriculture, horticulture and food processing), recognizing that the majority of households in GBC owned small parcels of farm land. While youth were less interested in traditional farming activities, they were attracted to commercial agricultural opportunities in higher level production, processing, packaging, value-addition and marketing, for which the existing market mechanisms were improved.

The end of project evaluation reported that:

AKRSP made concerted efforts to promote selected value chains to increase youth employability, including high value horticulture, domestic tourism, and greenwood. Some important initiatives in this area included introduction of a new certified variety of potato seed in disaster hit Gojal valley, training in traceability system which will enable beneficiaries to receive a traceability bar code for national and international trading. Other positive developments included a significant increase in employment and increase in income from domestic tourism.

Indicator 1.2.2.1: Market actors in selected value chains linked and/or supported

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Value Chain Selection	4 - 6	3	-1
Sub-sector Market Actors Linked	24	6	-18

The purpose of this activity was to mobilize resources and market players into effective market systems by creating links between actors at various stages of value chains.

The market actors, which were linked/supported in selected value chains included:

- The Baltistan Hotel Association (BHA), comprised of all hotels in Baltistan region, was provided support for its registration, office establishment, publicity/promotion and lobbying for improving products and services for domestic tourism in the region. As a result the BHA played an instrumental role in lobbying and influencing the government to increase the number of flights between Islamabad and Skardu and further strengthen security measures, to ease the difficulties of tourists and to attract more domestic and international tourists.
- The all-female construction and planning company, CIQAM, was given support for jointly installing a greenwood seasoning plant in Altit Hunza to respond to the need for seasoning services under the greenwood value chain while also allowing women a place in a male-dominated value chain.<sup>9</sup>
- Three enterprises were supported to provide training in greenwood seasoning and product development. These include CIQAM, Green World Construction, and a private sector enterprise working in Ghizer in the greenwood value chain.
- The Baltistan Farmers' Association was formed and supported by providing support for registration, office establishment, technical trainings, and exposure visits, etc., in production, processing, and product marketing stages of the high value horticulture (apple and apricot) value chain.

The identification and partnership for support to value chain enablers has been challenging during the project<sup>10</sup> as a number of actors, including government line departments, various sector related associations, and KIU were involved in the process causing delays.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Seasoning refers to the process of drying the greenwood through evaporation of internal moisture.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Value chain Enablers are the market-based entities who have the ability to contribute towards developing different parts and elements over the stages of a value chain in a particular sector or sub-sector, e.g. horticulture, greenwood, tourism sector value chain development stages, input provision, production, processing and marketing.

Furthermore, since the rationale behind supporting value chain enablers was to improve the overall value chain, simple cash transfers to underwrite business development was not a sufficient approach. Rather, technical assistance in the areas of product, process, and service upgrading was considered more favorable which is a long term and expensive approach and therefore it was beyond the scope of interventions and resulted in under-achieving the target.

# Indicator 1.2.2.2: # and type of support services strengthened in selected value chains

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Market Interventions to Strengthen Support Services	18	35	+17

Against a target of 18 interventions, the project supported 35 interventions and/or linkages in selected value chains over the project period, as follows:

Years	Value Chains	Inter- ventions	Type of support services provided
Year-1	Domestic tourism	1	Conducted market research, provided market information, product theme, stories, and assistance in design to one female enterprise.
Year-2	High value horticulture (apple, apricot)	1	Training in picking, grading and packing to 10 youth from four LSOs.
Year-3	Greenwood	1	All female construction crew, CIQAM, supported in wood season plant installation and training in wood seasoning.
	Domestic tourism	1	Baltistan Farmers Association supported to organize young farmers at one platform, introduce new apple varieties, ensured quality standards and increased bargaining power of farmers.
Year-4	High value horticulture (potato, apricot and apple)	5	Seeds, training on traceability, harvest management, market assessment study, improved technology.
	Domestic tourism	7	Formation of community tourism associations, improve missing services, e.g. packages, destination promotion, training and input supplies.
	Greenwood	2	Scale-up seasoning facility, product development trainings.
	High value horticulture (Capsicum)	1	Provision of seeds and inputs, training to farmers on cultivation and crop management, market assessment study.
Year-5	Domestic tourism	1	Facilitated entrepreneurs to participate in and promote/sell products at Khunjerab Pamir festival.
	High value Horticulture	2	Pre- and post-harvest management training to 40 farmers, packaging material production for apple and apricot.
	Domestic tourism	10	Tourism promotion workshops in four districts of GB with public/private sector stakeholders, destination management support to entrepreneurs, capacity building of 20 workers in food processing and production, camping sites, tourist guide book published.
			A social media webpage was created and maintained for tourism promotion. <sup>11</sup> Registration support for tour operators in Chitral, support to Broghol festival, mountaineering training to 10 youth in Chitral. Supported 25 youth to participate in ski camping in Shimshal, Gojal valley.
	Greenwood	2	Supported Hunza furniture to establish seasoning plant; eight youth from five LSOs trained in carpentry.

Table 10: Number and Type of Support Services Strengthened, by Year and Value Chain

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> www.facebook.com/beautifulbaltistan/\_\_\_\_

Years	Value Chains	Inter- ventions	Type of support services provided
	All value chains	1	Produced studies for value chain investment conference.
Total		35	-

#### Output 1.2.3: Capability of youth built to start new enterprises

In support of newly established youth-led enterprises, EELY facilitated the provision of initial business training, advancing linkages to critical financial services and market information, and raising awareness of networking and business opportunities amongst youth and newly established youth-led enterprises. This was achieved through a network of business support services and information points. Considering the local economy, the enterprise support services were focused on downstream components of agribusiness value chains, such as production, processing, packaging, value-addition and marketing, in accordance with the findings of the market assessment and value chain studies that were conducted for select sectors, such as tourism, horticulture, and greenwood.

#### Indicator 1.2.3.1: # and type of awareness raising events conducted

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Awareness Raising Events and/or Sessions	36	38	+2

These events and/or sessions on raising awareness of youth on entrepreneurship development were attended by 1,631 youth including 972 men and 659 women.

Number of workshops/ participants	Y1	Y2	¥3	Y4	Y5	<b>Y6</b>	Total
No. of awareness raising workshops/ sessions on entrepreneurship development	4	2	18	12	2	-	38
No. of young men participated	125	60	399	323	65	-	972
No. of young women participated	125	20	250	229	35	-	659
Total number of participants	250	80	649	552	100	-	1,631

Table 11: Number of Awareness Workshops and Participants, by Year and Sex

The sessions covered the basics of entrepreneurship, success and failure of businesses, and constraints and availability of scarce resources for setting up new enterprises keeping in mind the local context.



Photo 6: Young participants involved in a group activity at entrepreneurship development training in Chilas, Gilgit-Baltistan. The training helped them start micro enterprises in their villages.

#### Indicator 1.2.3.2: # of young women and men trained

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Training of Youth for Entrepreneurship	4,000	4,099	+99

Intensive trainings in entrepreneurship were provided through selected service providers across GBC. Youth were selected from a large number of applicants on the basis of their skill, education and willingness to do business. Once trainees were selected, they were taken through a seven-day in-house training. After successful completion of the training, the trainees developed their business plans. The best, most viable business plans were selected for youth micro challenge awards (YMCAs) through a competitive process where the most viable and innovative business plans were selected, further detailed under output 1.2.3.4

Table 12: Number of Young Women and Young Men Trained in Entrepreneurship Development, by Year

Entrepreneurship trainees	Y1	Y2	Y3	Y4	Y5	Y6	Total
Number of young women	-	110	314	832	1064	202	2,522
Number of young men	-	61	326	398	646	146	1,577
Total number of youth trained	-	171	640	1230	1710	348	4,099

The trainees also participated in a mentorship and business linkage development session delivered by different service providers, financial institutions, and successful businessmen/women. These people were invited to share their experiences and their organizations' product offers. This holistic training package was aimed to maximize the chances of success and sustainability of the business ventures of the new young entrepreneurs. This aspect was also noted to be highly effective, gender sensitive and sustainable by the mid-term monitoring mission and end of project evaluation.

#### Indicator 1.2.3.3: # and type of social enterprises supported

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Support to Social Enterprises	24	23	-1

The purpose of supporting social enterprises was to enable them to provide basic and needed social services to the community, particularly for women and children. For example, the ECD enterprises supported the scale-up of early childhood education in GBC, which in turn provided employment for women and also helped women enter the workforce as their children were looked after. Another example was a community-based NGO that was supported to provide small grants to poor women to sustain their livelihoods.

A total of 23 social enterprises in four different trades were supported against a target of 24. Since the ECD sector was nascent in GBC and was in high demand from the communities, the establishment and capacity building of 20 ECD centres were supported across all three regions of GBC. Later on, during Year 3, the market demand was noticed by the private sector, which then, along with local NGOs, contributed towards the large increase in ECD centres in the last two to three years. In fact, the participation of Hashoo Foundation, and other NGOs, became so independent and sustainable, that the final target was abandoned.

Type of enterprises	Y1	Y2	¥3	¥4	Y5	Y6	Total
Early childhood development	1	6	13	-	-	-	20
Shawls making (non-profit)	1	-	-	-	-	-	1
Computer education in madrasas	-	-	1	-	-	-	1
The Karakorum Disability Forum <sup>12</sup>	-	-	1	-	-	-	1
Total	2	6	15	-	-	-	23

Table 13: Number of Social Enterprises, by Year and Type

Besides directly supporting the social enterprises that were generating incomes to benefit the poor, disadvantaged and differently abled youth, EELY provided technical assistance support to three service providers across GBC for replication of the social enterprises into remote areas where such services were not available:

- In Gilgit, support was provided to Hashoo Foundation to increase its outreach for activities related to ECD training.
- In Baltistan, support was provided to Karakorum Disability Forum (KDF) which a leading social enterprises working across Baltistan and Chitral regions.
- Also, support was provided to the Pakistan government's Special Education Institute for staff capacity building and introduction of new technology as per the request of the Institution for Skill Development of Differently-Abled People.

# Indicator 1.2.3.4: # of youth micro challenge awards

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Micro Challenge Awards for Youth	100	269	+169

YMCAs (business) have been awarded to youth with viable business plans. These include 156 enterprises in Gilgit, 65 in Baltistan, 42 in Chitral, two awarded centrally from the core office in Gilgit, and four in Diamer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Karakorum Disability Forum brings together citizens to promote an inclusive society in Gilgit-Baltistan, specifically for the differently-abled: <u>https://www.facebook.com/pg/KDF-Gilgit-Baltistan-</u>662416317152017/photos/?tab=album&album\_id=1192679567459020

Table 14: Number of Micro-Challenge Awards Awarded, by Year, Region, and Sex

Regions	Y1	Y2	¥3	Y4	Y5	Y6	Total
Gilgit	-	-	12 (6 F)	82 (38 F)	64 (26 F)	-	154 (70F)
Baltistan	-	-	6 (3 F)	16 (11 F) <sup>13</sup>	41 (20 F)	-	64 (36 F)
Chitral	-	-	7 (3 F)	16 (6 F)	20 (13 F)	-	43 (22 F)
Diamer	-	-	-	-	4 (0 F)	-	4 (0 F)
Core (program area level)	-	-	2 (0 F)	-	-	-	
	-	-	25 (12 F)	115 (55 F)	129 (59 F)	-	269 (128 F)

An evaluation of the YMCA was conducted in Year 4 and beneficiaries were surveyed as part of the Year 6 endline. Key findings included:

- YMCA business awards have been of great significance in developing a feeling of empowerment among youth, increasing their income, enhancing their spending on household education and health as well as in increasing employability among youth. For example, Nazia, a young women from Hunza, Gilgit, after one year of the award, found herself in a place where she can support her husband in running the household, send her children to the best school of the village, and pay five young women who help her with the business.
- According to endline results, out of all interventions under EELY, the YMCA had the highest success rate (68%) of ensuring a sustainable income-generating occupation within two years of completion; recipients also had the highest average monthly incomes.

Some areas of improvement noted by the endline evaluation:

- The small size of the grant limited the scale for rapid prototyping, which hindered innovation;
- Limiting the grant to individuals also prevented small multiple-partner businesses, cooperatives, or common interest groups from applying.

# Using micro-challenge awards to contribute to the rise of ECD

As more women begin working outside the home, the demand for safe, secure child care services is rising. In Danyore, Gilgit, a group of women have responded to that demand by setting up the Leading Stars Montessori and Daycare Centre. The idea of this facility came to life when it won the Youth Micro Challenge Award, a scheme set up under the EELY project, to promote entrepreneurial thinking and recognize innovative projects that meet a social need.

Using the money from the Award, the three founding women supplemented their fund with personal loans of PKR 50,000 each taken from THRIFT, a community-based savings and loans group. They then tapped into other resources including ECD training offered by Hashoo Foundation supported by Aga Khan Education Services to have their staff trained. Rupani Foundation funded sessions where parents were informed about the Montessori and day care and the advantages of professional supervision and early learning for children.

"There was resistance in the beginning," says one of the founders, herself a Master's degree holder in Economics whose own child is enrolled in the Montessori. "Mothers-in-law were particularly critical. They were first saying women should look after their own children. But gradually, as they saw that children who spent time in a professional learning environment were better behaved, got admission into school more easily, and performed better academically, they became more supportive of the idea."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> One award in Baltistan was given to a mixed group of recipients, made up of young women and men.
The facility currently has 60 children, all under the age of seven, which is when they begin school. There are separate areas for babies, toddlers and older children, all supervised by trained staff. Some mothers work in nearby banks and offices, some run shops in the adjacent market, and there are some who simply attend because their mothers think it is a good experience for their children. The centre offers all-day care as well as hourly packages for mothers who are busy for a short time and need only occasional care for their children. The facility is also one of the rare ones that also caters for children with special abilities who are often refused admission in regular schools.

Monthly fees are PKR 2,500 but there is flexibility for low-income parents. The centre generates enough revenue to sustain itself but profit margins are not large. "We would appreciate getting business training," say the founders, "on how to expand businesses, but also set up new ones. We have a lot of ideas - safe transport services for women, hostels for women, and of course, more day care centres!"

#### Indicator 1.2.3.5: # and type of service providers supported

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Service Providers Supported	18	14	-4
Sub-Sector Services Covered	24	10	-14

A total of 18 service providers was the target for provision of support for market information services in 24 sub-sectors to young entrepreneurs. Against this target, a total of 14 service providers have been supported in the three key selected value chain sectors such as domestic tourism, high value horticulture and greenwood, covering ten sub-sectors. The targets were underachieved due to the small size of the service provider market in GBC. Both establishing and supporting entirely new business service providers (BSPs) was not considered feasible and hence support was provided to existing local BSPs.

Table 15: Business Support Services, by Type of Business Support Pro	vider and Type of Support
	mach and type of support

Type of BSP services	Type of support	No. of BSPs
Capacity building in youth entrepreneurship	Awareness sessions	3
Documentary on employability	Financial support	1
Business information dissemination	Web portal development	1
Public schools in Diamer	Furniture and stationery	2
Promoting entrepreneurship in GB	Financial support <sup>14</sup>	2
Job market info dissemination	Start up support	1
Study on mapping/assessment of financial services in GBC	Financial and technical support	1
Web-based market info database	Financial and technical support	1
Jobs information dissemination online	Web portal of GBC	1
Employment of youth in auxiliary jobs	Financial support	1
		14

While not part of the three key value chains, public schools were selected in Diamer because they provided an internship placement and employment opportunity, particularly for young women.

### Immediate Outcome 2.1: Improved and more equitable participation of young women and men in community and civic institutions and in the broader Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral region

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Funds provided to business service provider to prepare and disseminate info on promoting entrepreneurship.



Photo 7: Ruzeena Shaheen and Naila Bano are the managers of the Women's Organization of Rahimabad. Every morning before leaving for their work in Gilgit, they first meet the community members in the office to note any community issues.

Under this youth leadership component, EELY worked closely with the government, the nascent private sector and community-based institutions, and enhanced their motivation and capacities to promote proyouth and gender equality policies and practices. It also supported increased youth participation at all levels. Project activities supported participatory processes to develop youth friendly strategies and action plans, assist partners in improving their planning and implementation capacities, supported youth mobilization, participation and associational activities, and developed competencies of youth, enabling them to unleash their own economic and civic leadership potential.

To increase the participation of male and female youth in social sector community development programs, EELY had a particular focus on assisting the LSOs that had prior experience and capacity to provide and/or support youth-friendly services. The aim was for EELY to increase the relevance of LSOs' programs and services to male and female youth, while also helping to support youth involvement as leaders in community affairs.

# Output 2.1.1: Support and facilitate the mobilization and activities of existing and new youth organizations and youth serving organizations

EELY promoted and facilitated youth mobilization and associational activities in an inclusive and equitable manner through supporting activities identified by youth groups themselves. These activities included university associations geared towards professional development, student council activities, youth sports groups and youth groups engaged in arts and cultural development, environmental and working on other social issues. By supporting a diverse array of youth leadership activities, AKRSP engaged the leaders of the groups in promoting equality, tolerance and healthy living.

It was under this output that women were encouraged to form and participate in sports organizations, which has significantly improved the women's participation in public events. In some parts of GBC women had never participated in sports prior to EELY; and now sports clubs and women's gyms are sprouting across the region.

*Indicator 2.1.1.1: # of youth organizations receiving YMCAs (disaggregated by sector/theme and category of awards, by gender leadership)* 

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Micro Challenge Awards for Youth Organizations	140	178	+38
% Women's Led Organizations	30%	34%	+4%

The YMCA (leadership) was another flagship activity. Given widespread interest and the huge number of applications received, including from youth organizations in inaccessible areas and women-led organizations, the project exceeded the overall target set in the PMF. Under YMCA, youth-led and youth-serving organizations came up with innovative social action ideas and went through a competitive process to win micro-awards of up to PKR 100,000 to implement their ideas through mobilizing additional local resources at village, sub-district and district levels.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Annual Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	15 (5 WL)	11 (3 WL)	11 (4 WL)	-	37 (12 WL)
Year – 3	17 (3 WL)	14 (1 WL)	13 (1 WL)	-	44 (5 WL)
Year – 4	25 (8 WL)	15 (4 WL)	14 (4 WL)	2 (0 WL)	56 (16 WL)
Year – 5	12 (7 WL)	14 (14 WL)	8 (4 WL)	4 (0 WL)	38 (25 WL)
Year – 6	-	-	-	2 (2 WL)	2 (2 WL)
TOTAL	69 (23 WL)	54 (22 WL)	46 (13 WL)	9 (2 WL)	178 (60 WL)

 Table 16: Number of Micro-Challenge Awards Awarded to Youth Organizations, by Year, Type and Sex-of-Leadership

### \* WL = Women-led organizations

The 178 awards were given in nine award cycles covering diversified and wide-ranging themes including education, environment, culture, gender equality, youth mainstreaming, ICT, media, health, social issues, eco-tourism, career counselling, sports, library, speech competitions, resource centres, women's tailoring centres in Diamer, and peace making. Due to high demand and the usefulness of the YMCA (leadership) in promoting inclusion, additional awards were handed out by reallocating savings from other EELY components during Years 5 and 6.

As planned, at least 30% of these awards were intended for women-led organizations to support themes that would address key social women's issues. While initially slow, the dedicated targeting of women-led organizations received an overwhelming response from Year 4 onwards and in Year 5, 25 out of 38 awards were given to women-led organizations across GBC. The following are some examples of themes supported by the awards to women-led organizations:

- Awareness sessions and community mobilization against gender based violence;
- A sports festival to boost confidence and leadership in young girls;
- Awareness and training sessions on health for women;
- Debate competitions to encourage public speaking;
- Trainings to improve governance systems in women's organizations working in the union council;
- Resource centre for female students to improve their computer literacy;
- Enhancing women's literacy in the conservative district of Diamer; and
- Enhancement of marketable skills for young women in three different valleys of Diamer.

A study was conducted in Year 4 on the results of YMCAs awarded from the beginning of EELY up to end of Year 3 and key findings were:

- The YMCA (leadership) award has resulted in contributing to an enabling environment for young people to play leadership roles in society, such as the Ishpata Newsroom among the Kalash people of Chitral, which enables youth to lead the Kalasha community and connect them with the rest of the world through media.
- Another significant impact has been the encouragement of women's leadership roles in areas other than the stereotypical activities of education and health. For example, Ghazala, a young social worker from Gilgit and her friends helped empower young women and men in leading their communities towards a safer future through environmental campaigns and organizing the local youth at union council level committees to tackle the issue of a growing suicide rate among young women.
- Survey data also indicated changes in the participation and inclusion of young women and men in civic activities. Seventy-two percent of respondents were of the opinion that youth inclusion and participation had contributed positively towards their communities, and 96% thought that the status of young women and men has improved in society due to their engagement in civic activities.

Indicator 2.1.1.2: # of direct beneficiaries of the awards

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Direct Beneficiaries of Youth Micro Challenge Awards	5,000	8,401	+3,401

The supported youth-led organizations across GBC conducted various activities in diversified themes that benefitted 8,401 beneficiaries (4,086 women, 4,315 men) through nine award cycles, exceeding the target of 5,000.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Total	Women	Men
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	615	451	468	-	1,534	383	1,151
Year – 3	697	574	530	-	1,801	936	865
Year – 4	1025	675	532	64	2,296	689	1,607
Year – 5	945	520	755	210	2,430	1,738	692
Year – 6	-	-	-	340	340	340	-
	3,282	2,220	2,285	614	8,401	4,086	4,315

Table 17: Number of Direct Beneficiaries of the Youth Micro-Challenge Awards, by Region and Sex

The project overachieved the target due to high demand and the higher than anticipated reach of the successful YMCA winners.

Among the various activities conducted by the awarded YMCA beneficiaries across GBC, a total of 8,095 direct beneficiaries benefited through their interventions in which 4,315 were men (51%) and the remaining 4,086 (49%) were women.

#### Indicator 2.1.1.3: Youth portal and youth directory updated annually

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Development and Annual Updating of Youth Web-portal	1	1	0

The overall target was to establish a youth portal to post important materials, such as success stories, additional resources, and relevant announcements, such as job opportunities in different organizations, trainings, scholarships and higher studies abroad. The target was achieved and the GBC Youth Portal (<u>http://gbcyouth.org/gbc/</u>) was successfully formed and outsourced to a service provider, Pamir Media

Group (www.pamirtimes.net/ ) during the final year to explore income options to sustain the portal in future. An Android application for GBC Youth Portal was developed and made available for download. The portal has also been linked to social media, i.e. Facebook and Twitter, which attracts additional visitors. To date, the average daily hits have increased to over 4,223, reaching over 4,209,425 hits to the end of the project in March 2017. In the second-last year of the project alone, a total of 477 out of 590 applicants for YIP used the portal to download the application form and apply online. Of note, 398 out of the 437 applicants of YMCA used the portal to download the application forms. Another sub-domain of the portal was created in Y5 for information about the internship program and was visited over 3,500 times per week.

AKRSP closely monitors content being posted on the portal and performs regular follow-up with the service provider for quality assurance.

# **Output 2.1.2: Establish/strengthen public recognition programs of organizations to spotlight** young leaders



Photo 8: Nadia opened an environmental club in her LSO in Chatorkhand. Through the initiative, she gathered a group of volunteers and placed trash bins across the village. Afterwards she attended the Young Community Leadership Development Program and went village to village to help people reactivate inactive women organisations.

A public recognition program was also critical to unleashing the leadership potential of youth. It helped build community awareness of the programs and youth leaders, as well as incentivizing youth to become involved in the development of youth within their communities. EELY worked with the Gilgit-Baltistan government, local government and leading LSOs to institute annual awards for young achievers, promote competitions and debates, institute challenge funds to encourage innovation and leadership in various trades like science, arts, economy and adventure sports etc. in an equitable manner. EELY support provided cash awards, certificates, shields/medals, etc. Youth conferences and festivals were promoted and special recognition programs were supported for outstanding youth for their achievements. Recognition programs were tailored to the different needs of young women and men to ensure that the most positive benefits accrue to the individual given their contextual realities.

Indicator 2.1.2.1 & 2: # and type of recognition events facilitated; # of youth participants spotlighted

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Award Ceremonies and/or Festival events	12/384	40/224	+28/-160
Spot-lighting Youth	NA	15,605 Youth	NA

Public recognition is important to unleash the leadership potential of youth. It was helpful under EELY to build community awareness of the programs and youth leaders, as well as incentivizing youth to become involved. EELY worked with the GB government, and local governments in Chitral, alongside leading LSOs, to institute annual awards for young achievers. Recognition programs were tailored to the different contexts of young women and men to ensure that opportunities were equitable.

Various types of events were held: mountain music festival in Tajikistan, conferences, symposiums, high achiever awards, youth festivals, traditional celebrations/events, national youth camp and youth hiking, career counselling and educational awareness, software exhibition, rescue and first aid, summer camp, Independence Day, peace-themed mushaira (poetry), documentaries, discussion on youth policy, Worldwide Cane Day, speech competitions, and essay writing competitions.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Core	Total	Women	Men	Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	4*	4*	4*	-	-	12	127	183	310
Year – 3	7	4	6	-	2	19	534	834	1,368
Year – 4	8	3	5	5	4	25	702	1,098	1,800
Year – 5	4	3	2	2	4	15	421	659	1,080
Year – 6	55	30	33	25	10	153	4,253	6,794	11,047
	78	44	50	32	20	224	6,037 (39%)	9,568 (61%)	15,605

Table 18: Number of Youth Recognition Events and Participants, by Year, Region and Sex of Participants

\* Regional locations unavailable, just total completed and attendance figures.

All events were organized through service providers and government with support provided by EELY.

The total attendance in 216 events was approximately 15,605 (9,568 men, 6,037 women) across GBC.

The target of organizing events and festivals for youth were underachieved by 160 mainly because the project influenced local community organizations and government line departments to take over the responsibility and hold ceremonies with their own costs, which was viewed as a positive step towards sustainability. After this development, EELY strategically selected opportunities with the widest outreach rather than focusing on the number of events. In the final year EELY used it as an opportunity to highlight some of the most inspiring leaders from the duration of the project, in partnership with the government and LSOs.

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Partnership with Public Sector Departments	2 across 7	2 across 7	0

Against the target of partnering with two public sector departments across seven districts, the project successfully achieved the target by partnering with the Department of Tourism and Youth Affairs in GB and district governments in Chitral for carrying out activities such as youth festivals, and overseeing the youth internship programs. As a result, the department provided financial support for 50 interns and including placement of interns in different public sector departments. Government departments also shared the cost and actively participated in the youth festivals and other events organized. EELY considers these partnership events a success because EELY was able to leverage and mobilize public

sector resources for sustaining youth centric events and festivals. Many of these initiatives continued beyond the close of project activities.

#### Output 2.1.3: Establish/ strengthen youth life skills and leadership services and programs

EELY supported the establishment of youth support services throughout the project's target area. Key support services included healthy lifestyle information, life skills, gender equality, career and educational counselling and personal counselling. These services were essential for youth to overcome various personal barriers that inhibited their full participation in the local community and economy. Such support services were delivered through established networks of community and learning organizations, including training institutions and LSOs.

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
ToT Sessions	7	13	+06
Master Trainers Trained	105	96	-09
Mentoring and Peer – Peer Sessions	42	170	+128

The project trained 214 facilitators (117 Men, 97 Women) across GBC who delivered peer-to-peer training to 6,188 youth (3,713 men, 2,475 women) on basic life skills, i.e. communication, stress management, decision making, conflict resolution, problem solving, anger control, gender responsive learning environment, and education.

It is under this output that one of the most innovative gender equality elements was piloted: gender pairs. Gender pairs is an innovative format of training where a couple (one male and one female) of facilitators guide an audience of couples (married or siblings) through a guided session on gender power dynamics in the household. Topics varied by context and the openness of the audience, but included elements of sharing decision-making, views towards women's empowerment in Islam, and women's roles outside of the household.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Core	Total	Women	Men	Total
Year – 1	-	-	1	-	-	1	10	15	25
Year – 2	-	-	2	-	-	2	5	5	10
Year – 3	-	-	-	-	2	2	16	16	32
Year – 4	1	1	1	2	-	5	8	6	14
Year – 5	-	1	1	1	1	4	9	6	15
Year – 6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	1	1	5	3	2	13	48	48	96

Table 19: Number of Trainer of Trainers Sessions and Trainers Trained, by Year, Region and Sex of Trained Trainers

EELY also identified partner organizations, such as LSOs and WOs, to find potential facilitators to multiply the number of trainings on life skills and gender. EELY identified 55 partner organizations and worked with them to train 117 male and 97 female facilitators.

Table 20: Number of Partner Organizations and Trained Facilitators, by Year and Sex of Facilitator

Years	Partner Organizations	Female Facilitators	Male Facilitators	Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	-	-	-	-
Year – 3	9	9	10	19
Year – 4	31	25	69	94

Years	Partner Organizations	Female Facilitators	Male Facilitators	Total
Year – 5	15	63	38	101
Year – 6	-	-	-	-
	55	97	117	214

Output 2.1.4: Youth participation in disaster risk reduction trainings, and relief and reconstruction processes facilitated



*Photo 9: Participants who received training on disaster risk reduction demonstrate an emergency rescue activity at a community workshop in Chitral.* 

Since GBC is prone to natural disasters, EELY worked with humanitarian assistance agencies within the AKDN and local government to expand their programs to promote youth leadership in DRR, disaster management, disaster preparedness and environmental management. Youth were sensitized to environmental issues including climate change adaptation and were trained in communicating environmental issues in order to help educate their own communities about the link between environmental management and DRR. The EELY project also realized new opportunities to train LSOs and V/WOs on how to identify youth entry points into relief and reconstruction activities. LSOs and V/WO were well positioned and played a key role in promoting and engaging youth as leaders within community groups, as managers of relief camps and in negotiating with government officials. All youth leadership programs including programming related to the flooding, was inclusive of young women and men and strove to ensure women's equal and active participation.

Indicator 2.1.4.1 & 3: # of DRR plans developed by LSOs; # of participants in and # of knowledgesharing and sensitization events organized in collaboration with other organizations (seminars, conf. workshops, etc.)

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
DRR Plan Developed by LSOs	20	20	0
Organization of Knowledge and Sensitization Events	50	51	+1
Participation in Sensitization Events	NA	2,467	NA

In partnership with FOCUS, 20 village-level DRR plans were developed involving young women and men through nine selected LSOs (six in Gilgit, one in Baltistan and two in Chitral). FOCUS conducted 51 knowledge-sharing events for the young volunteers nominated by the LSOs. Details of the events are as follows:

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Total	Women	Men	Total
Year – 1	1	-	1	-	2	116	128	244
Year – 2	1	1	1	-	3	169	207	376
Year – 3	5	4	4	-	13	117	149	266
Year – 4	1	1	2	2	6	121	154	275
Year – 5	6	2	4	2	14	209	336	545
Year – 6	5	3	3	2	13	287	474	761
	19	11	15	6	51	1,019	1,448	2,467

Table 21: Number of DRR Events Conducted and Participants, by Year, Region, and Sex of Participants

A DRR manual and communication material was developed by FOCUS Humanitarian Assistance and disseminated to LSOs for improving their capacity to work with youth to develop DRR activities. The manual provides useful information and elaborates effective practices for community based disaster risk management (CBDRM). The manual covered topics such as basic knowledge on CBDRM, risk, vulnerability and capacity assessment; participatory community based disaster management planning; formulating community disaster risk management committees; emergency management response, conducting simulation drills and monitoring and evaluation. An orientation for LSOs and their youth members on the manual was conducted by FOCUS.

For sustainability of DRR activities, LSO DRR plans were developed with youth taking a lead role. EELY helped coordinate relevant stakeholders to cater to the unique needs of the communities to equip them with knowledge and skills as well as infrastructure to build their capacities for effective disaster response. The collaboration and partnership with FOCUS, GBDMA, the Red Crescent, and other stakeholders led to joint activities ranging from awareness events to capacity building. ToTs helped roll out the DRR training and develop community-led DRR plans with a special emphasis on the roles of young women and men.

A total of 2,467 young women and men benefitted from DRR sensitization events in which 59% were men and 41% were women.

One of the impacts of EELY was a greater inclusion of young women in preparing for disasters, which was traditionally a role played by older men. Following the devastating flooding in Chitral during Year 5, the EELY team held a consultation with women to discuss the important role they can play before, during, and after a disaster. A total of 79 women, including LSO members and counselors, attended and developed a list of recommendations for local DRR response. Similar events were done in Year 6 in Chitral and Gilgit, where 120 people participated, of which 70 were women.

Immediate Outcome 2.2: Enhanced capacity of and strengthened relevant community and state institutions to develop and extend enabling programs for the equal development of young women and men.



Photo 10: Luke Rehmat interviews a community elder at his studio, Ishpata News. Luke anchors a TV show on his endangered indigenous community, the Kalash. This news studio engages the youth of Kalash through live and recorded programs, highlighting issues important to young women and men from this small, remote community.

EELY challenged the local government, existing community organizations and the private sector to change their orientation and develop new capacities to actively involve youth as leaders and bring the priorities of youth to centre stage. Community-based organizations were supported in youth mobilization and participation activities, and specific programs were developed and implemented for different segments of youth. EELY continued the process of organizational strengthening of the LSO network. It consolidated them as credible public-interest associations, while refocusing the associations to help LSOs promote development targeted at young women and men.

EELY included systematic monitoring and evaluation of the LSOs to ensure that the determinants of sustainability, effectiveness, and gender equality were identified and supported; that resources were not overextended; and that clear benchmarks were set for AKRSP to phase out its support to LSOs and other institutions over the EELY project period as capacities of these organizations were developed.

# Output 2.2.1: Provision of technical assistance and resources to LSOs to design and implement demand driven youth specific programs and projects

Beyond individual LSOs, EELY promoted partnerships and linkages for youth leadership development activities through broader networks of LSOs and further public and private partnerships beyond the LSO network to provide youth services and support youth leadership. LSOs and their institutional networks were supported in building partnerships with public and private sectors that served to broaden the range of leadership opportunities for young women and men. This activity enabled the

sharing of good practices and lessons learned between and beyond LSOs and supported the replication and joint delivery of selected youth support and leadership activities.

### Indicator 2.2.1.1 & 2: # of LSOs youth development plans developed and updated;

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
LSO Youth Development Plans	50	85	+35
Activities in LSO YDPs Supported	150	190	+40

The project has been able to support implementation of 193 youth centric interventions from YDPs of 85 LSOs, which implies that all the supported LSOs have developed YDPs and implemented selected interventions.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	6	8	8	-	22
Year – 3	20	14	14	-	48
Year – 4	23	14	14	12	63
Year – 5	13	8	8	2	31
Year – 6	10	7	7	2	26
	71	48	58	16	190

Table 22: Number of Youth Development Plan Priorities Supported, by Year and Region

The major thematic areas were: youth mobilization, sports and recreation, DRR, social mobilization, social protection, establishment of youth resource centres, health and hygiene training, youth leadership and community management, first aid, anti-drug campaigns, inter-schools *Naat* and speech competitions, and the establishment of a library in Diamer.<sup>15</sup>

During Year 5, at core office level a study was performed to examine the effectiveness, relevance and inclusiveness of LSO youth development programs, their resultant changes and their prospects for sustainability. The study revealed that in order to engage youth and sustain youth development programs activities had to be innovative and needs-based, rather than generic. Youth crave innovation and are increasingly conscious of their needs. As a result of the study, the LSOs were pushed to be more creative, innovative, listen to the interests and demands of their constituencies. LSO and LSOs' networks still need to develop mature mechanisms to carry out lobbying and advocacy for LSOs to fund youth activities.

In addition to AKRSP support, LSOs have been making efforts to mobilize resources from other channels for carrying out youth development programs on a sustainable basis. YDPs enabled youth to create and/or find local employment opportunities. Youth were able access alternative forms of training and self-development has been enhanced due to improved access to information. To promote sustainability, LSOs created youth development plans and linkages with other donors and partners to fund youth service activities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Islamic poetry in praise of the Holy Prophet Mohammad (PBUH).

#### Indicator 2.2.1.3: # of youth participated in # YCLDP

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Youth Participation in YCLDP	120	123	+3

EELY supported a young community leadership development program (YCLDP) to assist youth to unleash their talent with confidence to improve the quality of life of their peers. Many YCLDP trainees worked towards extending youth support services at the community level.

The establishment of this program under EELY was aimed at helping address the physical, emotional and social needs of young people, especially those aged 15 to 19. EELY encouraged youth organizations, LSOs and LSO networks to forge partnerships with learning resource providers to develop and support a cadre of youth advisors, youth counsellors, coaches and youth mentors who were able to provide support services in areas such as life skills, self-confidence, self-esteem, healthy relationships, anger management and communications skills, etc. Other youth support services included career counselling, job search assistance, workers' rights, legal advice, health awareness, substance abuse and addiction, community and family healing and mediation, sports and recreational activities, arts, music and cultural inspirations and others as relevant to the location and context across all the districts of the project area.

Against a target of training 120 participants under YCLDP, the project managed to train 123 participants. Details are as follows:

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	8	8	8	-	24 (12 F)
Year – 3	10	8	9	-	27 (11 F)
Year – 4	25	20	-	-	45 (21 F)
Year – 5	11	8	8		27 (10 F)
Year – 6	-	-	-	-	-
	47	36	40		123 (64 F)

 Table 23: Number of Youth Leadership Program Participants, by Year, Region, and Sex

The major thematic areas were: participatory development, leadership and organizational management, gender and development, social mobilization, record keeping, data collection, basic research skills, and financial management. The total number of beneficiaries through the multiplication sessions by YCLDP ToTs were 3,517 (2,110 men and 1,407 women).

#### Ms. Zubaida Hussain and her 'Ray of Hope'

A resident of Ulding, Skardu, Ms. Zubaida Hussain is currently working as school teacher. During 2014, she heard about YCLDP from her friends. Ms. Zubaida Hussain considered the program an opportunity for both her professional and personal development. She applied for the program through Khaplu LSO and got selected for Cohort 3. "It was an exciting moment for me," she says reflecting on her selection. During her stay at YCLDP trainings, she attended programs on participatory development, how to conduct a ToT, and financial management. Ms. Zubaida says that trainers at YCLDP helped her in apply these concepts in her everyday life. "I did not know," she says, "the importance of participatory development as a tool to change my society."

Ms. Zubaida Hussain along with her fellow alumni have formed a group called the Diya Group - Ray of Hope, to replicate the YCLDP model in their communities. Using this platform, she helped her peers conduct seven sessions in various regions of Baltistan districts and trained 140 young women and men. "Diya Group is a family to my fellows and me," she says. "Apart from giving me valuable tools, it has provided me with an opportunity to act as a community leader," she further adds. Ms. Zubaida

Hussain is one of many who had not only used YCLDP platform to change their professional lives, but also the lives of others.

### Mr. Syed Shahid Raza: Taking Flight

Syed Shahid Raza, another YCLDP participant, is 28 years old and a devoted social worker and youth activist in his region of Skardu. After completing his YCLDP training program, he served in numerous community based organizations in various roles, including leadership. Currently, Shahid is leading both a student organization and a village organization as president and general secretary respectively. "Social work is my passion," he says. "We can build better societies for the future only with the help and participation of youth," he adds. Shahid says that YCLDP has strengthened his leadership qualities by boosting his confidence, and he was glad to practice his skills in voluntarily assisting AKRSP with some gender initiatives.

He has conducted two district-level trainings with the support of AKRSP, training almost 300 people on social mobilization and record-keeping. Shahid Raza calls YCLDP "a runway that has made my first flight possible." Moreover, in partnership with LSO Network Baltistan, he has started trainings on working with youth as social mobilizers in five LSOs. "I feel proud when I recount my contributions to these communities as an YCLDP alumni," he says.

Indicator 2.2.1.4 & 5: # of CBSGs forme	ed; # of youth CBSG members
---	-----------------------------

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
CBSGs Formed	400	430	+30
Youth membership in CBSGs	6,000	7,060	+1,060

Community-based saving groups (CBSGs) were established to cater for the financial needs of GBC's poorest communities, particularly women and youth, through a transparent and community owned and managed system of collective savings. CBSGs have enabled communities to solve some of the social and economic issues impacting them and it provided another platform for youth to share their needs, requirements and potential. Often the loans were used for setting up small businesses and women in particular have used it to generate income.

Of the 430 CBSGs formed with 8,380 total members, 84% (7060) are youth. Young women made up the bulk (87%) of youth members of CBSGs. Details are as follows:

Table 24: Number of Savings Groups Established and Number of Youth Members, by Year, Region, and Sex of Youth Members

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Total Formed	Youth Members	Total Members (including Adults)
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	-	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 3	24	23	26	73	1,534 (1,377F, 157M)	1,910
Year – 4	96	40	40	176	2,653 (2,339F, 314M)	3,206
Year – 5	120	30	30	180	2,873 (2,429F, 444M)	3,264
Year – 6	-	-	-	-	-	-
	240	93	97	430	7,060 (6,145F, 915M)	8,380

### Output 2.2.2: Provision of technical and financial assistance to LSOs for their sustainability

Capacity and technical support was offered by AKRSP to assist LSOs to access local resources and build technical, managerial, and financial competencies. Direct support was provided to 50 LSOs over the life

of the project. AKRSP put together a customized LSO training package that directly addressed the specific gaps and capacity needs of individual LSOs. Part of these targeted trainings included youth sensitive business plan development, hands-on learning with other LSOs, advocacy skills, youth and leadership succession development and training and support to form CBSGs. All of these activities were aimed at further strengthening the sustainability of the LSOs to enhance a better future for youth in GBC.

Building the technical and financial capacities of the LSOs has helped establish sustainable business practices responsive to the needs of their respective target communities. These activities provided EELY with a sustainability mechanism leaving behind key flagship activities sustained by the LSOs and other partner organizations in the long run for continued youth development in GBC.

Indicator 2.2.2.1: # of LSO	representatives	participated in training.	
	<b>F</b>	F F	

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
LSO Representatives Trained	250	673	+423

Due to high demand, EELY overachieved its target by training 673 LSO reps (138F, 535M) in 31 training sessions across GBC., at no additional cost. Details are as follows:

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Diamer	Total
Year – 1	18 (4 F)	10 (2F)	10 (2 F)	-	38 (8 F)
Year – 2	58 (15 F)	46 (18 F)	25 (19 F)	-	129 (52 F)
Year – 3	150 ( 30 F) <sup>16</sup>	50 (7 F)	0	-	200 (37 F)
Year – 4	86 (16 F)	65 (4 F)	45 (2 F)	-	196 (22 F)
Year – 5	56 (5 F)	27 (9 F)	10 (5 F)	17 (0 F)	110 (19 F)
Year – 6	-	-	-	-	-
	234 (70 F)	154 (40 F)	94 (28 F)	17 (0 F)	673 (138 F)

Table 25: Number of LSO representatives Participating in Training, by Year, Region and Sex of Representatives

The major themes for training were: financial management, resource mobilization, proposal writing, project management, corporate management, financial compliance, report writing, gender equality, office management, bookkeeping, and linkage development.

#### Indicator 2.2.2.2: # of LSOs receiving matching/management grant

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Terms of Partnership Signed with Matching-Grant Receiving LSOs	50	85	+35

The grants and cost-matching management support were given on a cost-share basis to LSOs who could fundraise 50% of the amount. The small grants covered the LSOs' core costs and allowed them to continue to support and engage youth in their communities.

Detail are as follows:

Table 26: Number of LSOs Receiving Matching Management Grants, by Year and Region

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan Chitral		Total
Year – 1	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	15	8	9	32

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Estimate.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Total
Year – 3	18	-	-	18
Year – 4	-			-
Year – 5	18	10	7	35
Year – 6	-	-	-	-
	51	18	16	85

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Self-Assessment Exercises and Reports	6/6	6/6	0/0

EELY assisted 85 LSOs in carrying out six self-assessment exercises. Each year, one self-assessment exercise was held which covered all LSOs working with the project for that year. Six detailed reports on the process and outcomes of the self-assessment test (SAT) exercises were also produced. The purpose of this exercise was to let LSOs assess their own institutional capacities and explore areas of strengths and weaknesses, especially in extending programming to young women and men.

Out of these six SAT exercises, five were conducted internally by LSOs with technical support of AKRSP and one final assessment exercise was designed and conducted by the Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy (PCP) in 2016. The PCP is the only body designated by the government of Pakistan to evaluate, ratify and certify civil society organizations (CSOs) including NGOs and LSOs. The PCP conducted the SAT study titled: *The State of Local Support Organizations in Gilgit, Baltistan and Chitral*, an evaluation of 40 EELY supported LSOs operating in GBC looking at factors of sustainability, community mobilization and community impact.

It is encouraging to note that the majority of LSOs have female representation in their general body and executive boards, and more than half of LSOs have women as volunteer staff, whereas two Gilgit-based LSOs are completely led by female local leaders. Among regions, Chitral has better achievement in democratic governance, management capacity, networking and partnerships than Gilgit and Baltistan, whereas Gilgit has ranked the highest on sustainability parameters with reporting of more than one ongoing project and multiple sources of income.<sup>17</sup>

### Output 2.2.3: Provide support to governments to develop and implement youth related policies, programs and projects

Also under EELY, the government's youth and gender equality-focused government policies, programs and services were supported. EELY worked with LSOs and youth to review policies and ensure they were widely accessible and reflected the needs and priorities of communities, particularly the remote and marginalized, and opened doors for economic opportunities that encouraged investment and local enterprise development. Encouraging the government to develop institutional mechanisms for equal participation in decision-making for youth and women ensured that regional employment and youth leadership opportunities benefitted the entire community.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy, the State of Local Support Organizations in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral, 2016.

Indicator 2.2.3.1: # and type of priorities (trainings, youth events, policy briefs, research and communications) of GB and KP governments supported

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Support to Government Priorities and Youth Calendar Events	6/40	45/34	+39/-618

Key priority areas supported were:

- Capacity building of staff of key government line departments of Gilgit-Baltistan in project management and gender responsive budgeting (training provided by the Social Policy Institute and Lahore Institute of Management Studies);
- Training the newly elected members of GBLA in youth-focused legislation and parliamentary services (training provided by the Pakistan Institute of Parliamentary Services);
- Training the newly elected young women and men of local bodies under the new local government system established in Chitral (training provided by AKRSP's institutional development and GAD teams); and
- Support to DPAP, a government-established civil society organization in Diamer, which would become AKRSP's foothold within the conservative district.

The LSO youth conventions were organized annually across the three project regions on themes such as empowered youth and empowered communities. The delegates from youth, the LSOs, and public and private sector organizations throughout GBC participated in these conventions, which provided a platform for all partners to join hands to cater for the specific needs of youth. The *LSO Youth Charter* 

#### Farida Makes her Empowerment Journey

Farida was born in 1984 in a village of Chitral, Bakerabad. She was brought up in a conservative environment where women were expected to keep quiet in front of men and a woman's role was limited to household chores. In the local body elections in 2015, after being inspired by EELY's messaging on the importance of women's civic participation, Farida entered the elections at her husband's encouragement and got elected as a Member of Tehsil Council in Chitral. She, to her own admission, had no idea of how the system worked, or her responsibilities as a counselor. She recalls that initially the female councillors would sit aside silently in the meetings looking at the faces of their male counterparts.

Eight months after the elections, she approached AKRSP and suggested a training for the newly elected female councillors and got a chance to attend a training workshop on local government systems organized by AKRSP. In the training workshop she learned how the system worked, how to develop a project or policy, how to include her points in the meeting agenda, and how to engage fully in the councils meetings. She recalls the first day at Council after her training when she started her comment by raising a copy of the council's policy on gender equality which guarantees funding for women's initiatives. She says that from that moment onwards she very confident at councils meetings and started talking freely. She extended a proposal to her union council for utilization of women specific funds. Initially their male counterparts resisted them but she and her fellow female councillors compelled their male councillor counterparts to listen to them and she successfully was able to secure funding for two projects for women's economic empowerment in Chitral.

"Educating women on their rights is the key to empowerment and I am grateful to AKRSP for its constant support in this regard and I am sure that AKRSP will extend this support to other women in the future as well." - Farida

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> The government priorities were often in supporting the youth calendar events, but they were counted as contributing towards "government priorities" rather than "calendar events" to avoid double-counting.

was developed and adopted as a resolution, which served as guideline for EELY/AKRSP to include in its annual action plans.

#### Output 2.2.4: Staff capacity developed and internship programs established

EELY provided targeted capacity building support to AKRSP in youth and women's empowerment and also worked with other partners to launch expanded internship programs for youth, providing fresh graduates with on-the-job training within AKRSP including career counseling and mentoring. In order to ensure that youth perspectives were integrated and that youth were involved in setting the strategic directions, AKRSP inducted youth into its professional cadres and worked over the course of the project to elevate aspiring young people into AKRSP's management cadres.

# Indicator 2.2.4.1: # of interns (disaggregated by sex, by region, by district, by disadvantaged area)

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
Internship Programs (with 20 Interns per year)	6 rounds / 360	6 rounds / 495	00/+135

The internship program under the institutional development component selected and inducted 495 interns against a target of 360 (20 interns per region per year). These interns were young graduates from GBC who were offered internship opportunities and placed with key departments of AKRSP core and regional offices, such as M&E, gender and development, market and enterprise development, institutional development, finance, administration, and human resources. This internship program was partnered with key universities, and AKDN institutions, so that the most promising students, who wish to pursue careers in rural development and sustainable mountain development were offered opportunities. Special consideration was made to encourage young women from underserved areas.

Note: these interns are a sub-component of the interns under Output 1.1.3. They were reported on separately since they focused specifically on community development and leadership.

Overachievement occurred when the government of GB wanted to utilize interns of this caliber for placement within their different departments such as the LGRD, the Department of Agriculture and Livestock, Department of Forestry, Department of Education, and Department of Health. They provided a percentage of the money for interns' stipends and helped facilitate their placement.

Years	Gilgit	Baltistan	Chitral	Core	Diamer	GBC
Year – 1	-	-	-	-	-	-
Year – 2	12 (3 F)	6 (2 F)	7 (2 F)	-	-	25 (7 F)
Year – 3	90 (35 F)	68 (7 F)	65 (30 F)	-	-	223 (72 F)
Year – 4	41(25 F)	30 (13 F)	30 (15 F)	5 (3 F)	53 (0F)	159 (57 F)
Year – 5	40 (18 F)	16 (10 F)	25 (14 F)	7 (4F)	-	88 (46 F)
Year – 6	-	-	-	-	-	-
	183 (81 F)	120 (32 F)	127 (61 F)	12 (7 F)	53 (0 F)	495 (182 F)

Details of the intern distribution are as follows:

Table 27: Number of Interns Placed Under the Institutional Development Program, by Year, Region, and Sex of Intern

Of the 495 interns, 313 were male (63%) and 182 female (37%).

Indicator 2.2.4.2: # of staff participating in formal training events organized

Activity	Project Target	Achievement	Variance
AKRSP Staff Provided Formal Training	72 (50%	311 (34%	+239
	female)	female)	. 200

A total of 311 project staff (multiple counting) got training through different capacity building events arranged and facilitated under EELY. Female staff made up 34% (105 staff) of the total trained. Details for some of the trainings are as follows:

- Training on research methods was organized at core office where 22 staff (7F, 15M) participated.
- In Chitral region, 15 staff members (4F, 11M) from M&E, ID, MD and GaD departments attended training on results based management.
- The orientation on the MELD MIS was conducted for a total of 20 staff from all three regions. These staff included regional management and M&E staff.
- A training on cost-benefit analysis of YMCA projects proposals was held in Islamabad in which 26 staff (6F, 20M) participated.
- In core and Gilgit region a three-day training was held on report writing, proposal writing and conflict management in which 27 (10F, 17M)) staff participated.
- In Chitral region, a training was held on report writing, proposal writing and conflict management in which 20 (8F, 12M) staff participated.
- In Baltistan region, 20 (6F, 14M) staff were trained on: report writing, proposal writing and conflict management.
- At core office, a three-day workshop on women's economic empowerment was attended by 28 people (10F, 18M).

#### Canadian Component: Public Engagement in Canada

Over the course of the project two communications missions were carried out (in 2014 and 2017). Program staff visited project areas with communication professionals (photographer and videographer) to meet with project beneficiaries, staff and partners to collect photographic, video and narrative content.

This content was used to produce compelling communications products over the course of the project During which close attention was paid to gender aspects. Efforts were made to break stereotypes and showcase individuals in non-traditional gender roles. Examples of products produced include:

- A <u>photo gallery</u> was developed featuring images that demonstrate the range of EELY activities and the impacts on beneficiaries, drawn from the communications mission conducted in 2014. This gallery is available online and has been accessed over 1,600 times; printed photo panels from the gallery are regularly displayed at AKFC events and other activities.
- Three dedicated EELY stories were produced and disseminated through AKFC's social media platforms and newsletter, and are featured on AKFC's website (they can be found <u>here</u>, <u>here</u> and <u>here</u>).
- An infographic was created highlighting some of the challenges facing youth in Northern Pakistan and the progress made by EELY in providing skills and trainings to enable young people to reach their full potential. The infographic was disseminated through social media in conjunction with International Youth Day 2015 and at the WUSC-CECI International Forum.
- AKFC produced a podcast featuring Abdul Malik, the general manager of AKRSP discussing the ways that EELY has inspired and empowered youth to be more active in local government and the decision-making process in their communities. The podcast is available on akfc.ca (here) and was promoted through social media and the AKFC monthly newsletter.
- A video featuring the owner of a shop in the Karimabad women's market was produced and screened at the WUSC-CECI International Forum. It was the first in a series of four videos that were finalized in Year 6, demonstrating the impact of the program on a variety of beneficiaries. The additional stories include a textiles entrepreneur in Kalash, a heavy machinery operator in Attabad, and a couple who participated in the gender pairs program.
- A case study outlining EELY's objectives and approaches to promoting women's economic empowerment was developed in 2016 and shared as part of the roundtable discussion held with other civil society organizations.

This content has been disseminated widely through AKFC's newsletters, websites and social media channels as well as at events, exhibits and other public engagement activities undertaken by AKFC. In addition to this content dedicated to EELY, photos and stories from the program have been woven into broader communications activities, such as presentations, social media campaigns, and digital photo galleries.

In 2016, AKFC undertook a dedicated social media campaign to test approaches to engaging new constituents and sustaining relationships through digital engagement, which reached over 600,000 Canadians. Content on EELY was featured as part of this initiative.

In 2012 and 2017, EELY was featured as part of AKFC's Global Village at the World Partnership Walk and World Partnership Golf, which are attended by tens of thousands of Canadians in ten cities across the country. The Global Village is a showcase of GAC-AKFC supported programs and is designed to show participants how their contributions are making a difference in the developing world.

The project has also been featured in AKFC's mobile exhibition, <u>Together</u>, which has had 55,000 visitors to date in ten provinces. EELY featured in content on breaking down gender barriers through promoting women in non-traditional roles, skills-based training for youth, and creating local economic opportunities in remote locations.

In October 2013, AKFC delivered a presentation at the <u>OCIC Global Citizen Forum</u> on approaches to developing youth employment initiatives, drawing on lessons from EELY. Approximately 30 development professionals and students participated in the session.

In 2014, AKFC's annual university seminar series focused on youth employment issues and featured Abdul Malik, who spoke about EELY's approach to promoting youth livelihoods and leadership. The series entitled <u>Youth (Un) Employment: Global Problems Meet Local Solutions</u> was held at five universities in Calgary, Toronto, Ottawa, Halifax and Montreal and reached over 200 participants in person and via webcast.

In January 2016, AKFC collaborated with WUSC and CECI to deliver the <u>youth employment and</u> <u>entrepreneurship stream at the WUSC international forum.</u><sup>19</sup> The stream included two panel presentations and two interactive workshops. Abdul Malik attended the session and spoke about how AKRSP approaches youth employment and entrepreneurship under EELY. The stream also included a case study on EELY in which participants were asked how they would approach the youth leadership programming in a context such as northern Pakistan. In total approximately 250 students, civil society, and government representatives participated in the stream.

In 2016 and early 2017, AKFC held two roundtable events to bring together development practitioners from civil society and the public sector to share successes, challenges and lessons learned in implementing women's economic empowerment programming. The first event, entitled *Roundtable on Women's Economic Empowerment in Practice: Addressing Gendered Barriers to Access and Success* featured case studies from AKFC, CARE Canada, Mennonite Economic Development Associates, Oxfam Canada, Save the Children and World University Service of Canada. These cases illustrated the diverse strategies used to address gendered barriers to women's economic access and success. Small group discussions followed the case study presentations, giving participants the opportunity to explore the issues in more depth. The second event provided a discussion on new directions in WEE frameworks. In total, 60 people participated in these two roundtable events.

In conjunction with the roundtable held in November, AKFC also participated in two events in Toronto to share EELY's successes and lessons in empowering young women. The first was held in conjunction

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> This workshop was co-funded under EELY and the AKFC-GAC Partnership for Advancing Human Development in Asia and Africa (PAHDAA).

with World Vision Canada, and the second was a presentation delivered at Seneca College. Approximately 90 people participated in these sessions.

In total, approximately 558,000 Canadians were reached through EELY public engagement activities.

#### **Canadian Component: Technical Assistance**

AKFC has managed the following technical assistance contracts during the EELY project:

Table 28:	Technical	Assistance	Contracted	for EELY	bv AKFC
				Je: ===:	~,

Date of TA	Consultant (Team)	Name and Objective of TA
June to August 2011	Ben Fowler Consulting Inc.	<ul> <li>PIP market development review:</li> <li>Provided expert advice and recommendations to ensure the strength of the youth employability component of the EELY PIP.</li> <li>Reviewed EELY's sustainability strategy from a market development perspective.</li> </ul>
August to December 2011	EcoVentures International	<ul> <li>Strengthening the capacity of the market development team to target youth:</li> <li>The consultant guided the team in applying a youth lens to all their work and to identify activities and opportunities where youth can hold a comparative advantage.</li> <li>Developed new field-based tools which are youth-targeted and youth-friendly and trained AKRSP team members on their use.</li> <li>Develop a process guide for engaging youth in market assessment processes.</li> </ul>
March to October 2012	Mennonite Economic Development Associates (MEDA)	<ul> <li>Baseline and MERL system development:</li> <li>Worked with the MER team to develop and streamline a baseline and monitoring system that collects and analyzes qualitative and quantitative data.</li> <li>Built the capacity of the MER team in collecting, storing, and analyzing data for PMF indicators.</li> </ul>
June to December 2012	Linda Jones (Coady Institute)	<ul> <li>WEE in AKRSP, review and recommendations:</li> <li>Completed an historical analysis of AKRSP's WEE work and documented their key approaches and tools.</li> <li>Provided evidence-based recommendations for WEE programming under EELY.</li> <li>Worked with the GAD team to produce gender integration management tools, including check-lists and revised TORs.</li> </ul>
August to September 2013	Carlo Alberto Pinelli and Co.	<ul> <li>High Altitude Mountaineering ToT:</li> <li>Developed a pool of local youth into internationally-certified mountaineering trainers.</li> <li>Worked with local mountain climbing service providers to develop a sustainable and replicable business model.</li> <li>Increased the number of qualified female mountaineering instructors to help remove barriers from women enjoying the sport.</li> </ul>

Date of TA	Consultant (Team)	Name and Objective of TA
September to October 2013	Paul Rippey (independent)	<ul> <li>Investigating alignment opportunities for Community-Based Savings Groups within Enhancing Employability and Leadership for Youth:</li> <li>Assist AKRSP in formulating a strategy to incorporate CBSGs into the overall programmatic framework.</li> <li>Develop local capacity around formulating and delivering appropriate training modules for CBSG development.</li> <li>Work with AKRSP and LSO Support Units to explore different models in which various providers of financial services, VOs, WOs, formal financial institutions, and CBSGs, would efficiently provide complementary services, including services for youth.</li> </ul>
January to April 2016	Frida Khan (independent)	<ul> <li>Women's Economic Empowerment Assessment and Capacity Building in Northern areas of Pakistan:</li> <li>Identified barriers, opportunities and existing potentials for advancing WEE within and outside traditional economic sectors in GBC, with a particular focus on young women.</li> <li>Developed a contextualized strategic framework and its operational plan for advancing WEE within and outside traditional economic sectors in GBC, with a particular focus on young women, to be implemented during the last year of the project and incorporated into future project designs.</li> <li>Organized a capacity building workshop for EELY staff on implementation of the WEE framework during the last year of EELY.</li> </ul>
January to May 2016	Seneca International	<ul> <li>Assessing the Effectiveness of TVET Service Providers and Developing a TVET Sustainability Strategy for the Enhancing Employability and Leadership for Youth (EELY) Project in Pakistan:</li> <li>Assessed effectiveness of TVET service providers related to increased employability in the context of the project, and their sustainability beyond EELY.</li> <li>Developed a strategic framework to provide recommendations on how TVET service providers can sustain beyond EELY within the framework of national and provincial skills development strategies and polices.</li> </ul>
January –to April 2017	Institute for Social Sciences – Pakistan (ISS)	<ul> <li>End of Program Evaluation of Intermediate and Ultimate Outcomes:</li> <li>Determined the extent to which ultimate and intermediate outcomes have improved from those observed at baseline.</li> <li>Through a quasi-experimental approach, determined if outcomes can be attributable to EELY.</li> <li>Assessed the effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability of the various EELY components and provided findings, conclusions, recommendations and lessons to inform and strengthen future AKF programming.</li> </ul>

### II. Detailed Final Report on Achievement of Results

Immediate Outcome 1.1: Sustainable improvement in quality, outreach and relevance of skill development services (technical, vocational and entrepreneurial) for young women and men

# Indicator 1.1.1: % of youth accessing improved skill development services from supported service providers

This indicator was challenging to measure since, by definition, it involved service providers beyond the EELY project. As detailed in the Seneca International consultation, TVET service providers have limited capacity in maintaining proper records.

However, at endline the project was able to estimate that EELY-supported service providers as of 2017 have an average annual intake of 3,000 youth per year.

Regarding the "improved" component of the indicator, the proxy is: the quality of the service providers, specifically those ranked as either "promising" or "performing" organizations. An evaluation conducted in 2015 ranked the training service provider organizations engaged by EELY.<sup>20</sup> This evaluation took into account a total of 31 service providers who had benefitted from EELY support to improve the quality, outreach and relevance of trainings they offered for youth. Of these, 35% fell into category "1" which implies that these were "performing organizations" in terms of quality, outreach, relevance and effectiveness. Twenty-six percent fell into category "2" which means they are "promising organizations" having potential to grow into performing organizations. The study further found that 13% of the service providers were "non-performing organizations" falling under category "3". Another 26% of these organization fell into category "4" termed as "other organizations" because they could not meet the bare minimum criteria to be a viable training service delivery organisation. Table 29 shows comparisons across categories.

Cat	tegory	Number of organizations	Percentage of Total
1.	Performing organizations	11	35%
2.	Promising organizations	8	26%
3.	Non-Performing Organizations	4	13%
4.	Others: Unable to meet minimum criteria	8	26%
	Total:	31	100%

Table 29: Percentage of Service Providers Classified as "Performing" or "Promising" (2015)

Using the above proxy, it can be inferred that 61% of the 3,000 annual students attending EELY-supported TVET service providers will have access to *improved* skill development services.

# Indicator 1.1.2 % of trained young women and men who are applying newly acquired skills to earn income

Trained male and female youth are accessing gainful employment or self-employment at a visibly accelerated rate which is reflected by the tracer studies and the end of project evaluation reports. The tracer studies tracked skill development trainees who had completed the program one to two years prior. A change in earning status was only deemed acceptable if it had held true for at least one month. In total, there was a 27% increase in youth earning income after undergoing skills training (25% increase by young women, 30% increase by young men).

Women and men both benefitted from the program, even if the types of skills they gained were different. As Table 30 demonstrates, women entering the skill development program were more likely to be earning an income prior to joining. In terms of percentage increase in earning status, more men advanced to an income-generating status, although overall women graduates were most likely (at 77% compared to 72%) to be generating income.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Assessment of Effectiveness of Local and National Training/Service Providers and Partners, April 2015; Khan, Ahmed Wali

		Earning Income (Employed or Self-Employed) n=357	% difference
Female	Before Skills Training	52%	+25%
remale	After Skills Training	77%	
Male	Before Skills Training	42%	+30%
Male	After Skills Training	72%	
Total	Before Skills Training	47%	+27%
Total	After Skills Training	74%	

# Indicator 1.1.3: % of young women and men targeted under EELY project, reporting increased awareness of skills development and employment opportunities

The 2015 midline survey (n=1,553) reflected an overall 20% increase in the awareness of skills development and employment opportunities available to youth from the baseline measurement of 30% (a midline status of 50%). These are youth who could identify accessible training or upgrade opportunities, or resources for seeking employment.

This measurement was not done at endline; however, in key informant interviews with service providers, the endline survey team reported that that there was a notable increase in the number of inquiries they had receive from youth about their programming and available services. Youth were also more likely to ask about placements and practical opportunities, or ask questions about relevance for the labour market.

#### Indicator 1.1.4: Perception of trainees, on quality, range, and access of skill development services

The LMA midline study has reported that 90% of surveyed youth (1,553 youth, including 695 men and 890 women) found service providers' overall quality either good or excellent, which is a slight change from 88% (1,608 youth, 679 men and 929 women) at baseline. The high rating at baseline could be a reflection of youth not having exposure to better quality service providers, and hence assessing the ones that are available to be of good quality.

	Poor	Adequate	Good	Excellent
Baseline	0%	12%	48%	40%
Midline	0%	10%	45%	45%
Change	0%	-2%	-3%	+5%

Table 31: Perception of Trainees on Quality of Skill Development Providers (Baseline vs. Midline):

In a similar proxy question, the same sample was asked about the relevance of the programs available by their service provider. There was a slight decrease from 87% at baseline to 82% at midline. This can perhaps be attributed to more youth being equipped with basic labour market assessment skills and being more discerning on the skills development opportunities with which they engage.

Table 32: Perception of Trainees on Relevance of Skill Development Providers' Offerings (Baseline vs. Midline)

	Poor	Adequate	Good	Excellent
Baseline	2%	11%	57%	30%
Midline	3%	15%	52%	30%
Change	+1	+4%	-5%	0%

# Indicator 1.1.5: Perceptions of employers on quality and relevance of skills provided by targeted service providers to youth labour force

The end-of-project evaluation study concluded that: "most employers were satisfied with the technical and professional skills of their young staff that they had acquired from the training service provider

organisations." Ninety percent of employers said they were either highly satisfied or satisfied with the technical and professional skills that their young staff had when entering the workforce.



Figure 4: Employer Satisfaction with Technical and Professional Skills of Young Staff (2017)

Additionally, as a proxy for this indicator, employers were asked the biggest challenge in hiring young women and men at baseline and endline. As presented in Table 33, at baseline 20% of employers said that the biggest challenge to hiring young women was available skills, and 61% for young men.<sup>21</sup> This decreased significantly by 12% for young women and by 33% for young men entering the work force.

Table 33: Percentage of Employers who Listed 'Available Skills' As Biggest Challenge to Hiring Youth, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline):

	Young Women Applying	Young Men Applying
Baseline	20%	61%
Endline	8%	28%
Difference between baseline and endline	-12%	-33%

# Immediate Outcome 1.2: Sustainable and more equitable integration of economic actors into effective market systems to improve youth livelihoods

# *Indicator 1.2.1: % of targeted producers and entrepreneurs report improvements in selling products and services in markets*

A 2015 tracer study on enterprise development training graduates showed that there was a significant increase in the percentage of youth who were able to sell a commercially viable amount (>PKR 100,000). Prior to training only 29.6% of youth were in this category, but within one year, 42.9% of youth were in this category, an increase of 13.23%.

Table 34: Percentage of Targeted Producers with Sale Range of PKR 100,000, Post EELY Training

Sale Range ( mont		Before EELY training	After EELY training	Difference
100,000 A	bove	29.63%	42.86%	+13.23%

*Note: unfortunately this study did not produce sex-disaggregated data.* 

# Indicator 1.2.2: % of women and youth who owned, operated and managed enterprises supported by the project

A total of 4,099 youth (including 2,522 women and 1,577 men) were trained in entrepreneurship. A 2015 tracer study on enterprise development has found that 68% of the trainees have initiated new businesses, and three percent have expanded their existing businesses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> It should be noted that only 30% of employers in the survey had any female staff.

In addition to the trained entrepreneurs starting new businesses or augmenting existing ones, another 2,613 youth (1,044 women, 1,569 men) have started a combined 83 new enterprises within the three targeted value chain sectors with financial and technical support of EELY. Details of these are covered in Table 35, since they have not yet been covered within this report.

Table 35: Young Women and	Men who have Received Sup	port to Own, Operate,	and Manage ar	n Enterprise in Target
Value Chains, by region and sex of members				

Region	Young Women	Young Men	Enterprises
Gilgit	462	877	47
Baltistan	500	551	13
Chitral	82	141	23
Total	1044	1569	83

If we combine the enterprise development trainees and estimate that 71% of them started enterprises and add them to the confirmed youth in enterprises under supported value chains (Table 35), we can get the total number of youth supported with functional enterprises under EELY. By using the direct reach of EELY under the employability component as a denominator, we can see that 33.3% of youth reached under this stream owned, operated, or managed an enterprise; or 37.5% of women or 29.8% of men. The calculations are detailed under Table 36.

	Enterprise Development Trainees (EDT)	EDT Trainees who started enterprise EDT * 71%	Youth enterprise supported under value chains	Total EELY beneficiaries who are in functioning enterprise	Reach of EELY, Employability component	% of youth supported by EELY's employability stream who own an enterprise
		(a)	(b)	(a + b)	(c)	((a +b) / c)
Young women	2,522	1,790	1,044	2,834	7,549	37.5%
Young men	1,577	1,120	1,569	2,689	9,031	29.8%
Total Youth	4,099	2,910	2,613	5,523	16,580	33.3%

Table 36: Percentage of Youth Supported Under EELY's Employability Stream Who Own an Enterprise

# 1.2.3 In/formal agreements (e.g. MOUs, contracts, purchase orders) between market actors in selected value chains

During the EELY project period, a total of 18 market actors were engaged through either formal or informal agreements for implementing 52 interventions to develop value chains in three selected sectors: domestic tourism, high value horticulture, and greenwood. A breakdown by number of intervention is provided in Table 37.

Table 37: Number of Interventions Implemented Through In/formal Agreements and Market Actors Engaged, by Targeted Value Chain

Value Chain	# of interventions implemented through in/formal agreements (e.g. MOUs, contracts, purchase orders)	No. of Market actors engaged in/formally
Domestic Tourism	17	4

High Value Horticulture	24	9
Greenwood	11	5
Total	52	18

The details of value-chain sector-wise interventions implemented in collaboration with the market actors are given in the matrix below:

Value chain	tions implemented as a result of in/forma Partners supported	Interventions implemented
	r ar ther's supported	interventions implemented
sector Domestic Tourism	<ol> <li>Department of Tourism Gov. of GB.</li> <li>District government Chitral.</li> <li>Serena Hotel.</li> <li>College of Hospitality and Tourism Management Islamabad.</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Branding and promotion of GBC through the "Gilgit-Baltistan: Jewel of Pakistan" video, and "Baltistan Tourist Guide" book; the Baltistan Adventure Tour Operators website was upgraded.</li> <li>Tourism and cultural promotional festivals and shows in major cities of Pakistan, i.e. Islamabad, Lahore, and Faisalabad, to promote adventure and cultural tourism to GBC.</li> <li>Awareness raising for communities and exposure visits for tourism value chain players.</li> <li>Capacity development provided for chefs, hotel managers, tour operators, and input suppliers.</li> <li>Facility improvement at distant and high potential locations, i.e. Phundar, Hopper, Rama, and Broghi.</li> <li>Tourism associations' workshops with the Nagar Community Tourism Association, Astore Tourism Association.</li> <li>Festivals and exhibitions at key locations i.e. Broghil, Khunjerab, Nagar, and Shigar Fort.</li> </ul>
High Value Horticulture	<ol> <li>Metro Islamabad.</li> <li>Hyper Star.</li> <li>Highland Gaba Foods.</li> <li>North Land Traders.</li> <li>Azeem and Nayyab Traders.</li> <li>Baltistan Farmers Association.</li> <li>Department of Agriculture, Baltistan.</li> <li>PCSIR Baltistan.</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Certification, packaging material, market linkages and human resource development for adding value to enterprises.</li> <li>Capacity building of farmers in apple, apricot and cherry pre and post-harvest management, grading and packaging based on good agricultural practices.</li> <li>Product traceability systems and market exposure facilitated for high-yield farmers and/or entrepreneurs with high-end markets in southern Pakistan.</li> </ul>
Greenwood	<ol> <li>CIQAM, Hunza.</li> <li>Design Workshop Inc., Lahore,</li> <li>Hunza Furniture Pvt. Ltd. Gilgit.</li> <li>Rehmat Furniture House, Chitral.</li> <li>Baltistan Culture Development Forum.</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Product development, seasoning plants, capacity building of wood workers on product design and manufacturing.</li> <li>Greenwood awareness session for farmers on sustainable production and harvesting.</li> <li>Greenwood pruning and harvesting trainings.</li> <li>Electric seasoning plant development for Hunza Furniture.</li> <li>Solar seasoning plant development with partnership of Ciqam, Gahkuch, and Yasin.</li> </ul>

Table 38: Interventions implemented as a result of in/formal agreements, by value chain

#### Immediate Outcome 2.1: Improved and more equitable participation of young women and men in community and civic institutions and in the broader Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral region

#### Indicator 2.1.1: % of young women and men participating in community and civic institutions

To look at civic participation across the GBC, EELY compared the percentage of young women and men within civil society organizations at both baseline and endline.

СЅО Туре	Young women, members (%)		Young men, members (%)			Youth members (%)			
	Base-	End-	Differ-	Base-	End-	Differ-	Base-	End-	Differ-
	line	line	ence	line	line	ence	line	line	ence
Local Support Organization	6	16	+10	8	17	+9	14	33	+19
Village Organization	-	-	-	13	12	-1	13	12	-1
Women's Organization	10	22	+12	-	-	-	10	10	+12
Community Welfare Organization	-	-	-	9	16	+7	9	16	+7
Religious Organization	-	4	+4	6	11	+7	6	10	+4
Professional Organization (e.g. teachers' association)	4	7	+3	7	8	+1	11	15	+4
Local Governance (Other)	10	13	+3	8	9	+2	18	21	+3
Political Organization	2	6	+4	5	9	+4	7	15	+8

Table 39: Percentage of Total CSO Membership, by CSO Type and Sex of Members (Baseline vs. Endline)

As Table 39 demonstrates, with the exception of village organizations, all CSO types experienced an increase in total youth membership with the largest increases coming from LSOs, women's organizations, religious organizations, and political organizations. What is notable is the influx of young women to all types of organizations, with the percentage of young women in LSOs nearly equalling young men. In local governance organizations (others) young women outnumbered their young male counterparts.

### Indicator 2.1.2: % of young women and men with leadership roles in community and civic institutions by level and type

At baseline the large majority of youth members (66%) were part-time volunteers with the least decision-making role within their organization. In Year 4, there was a reduction of volunteers, with a 22% increase in the number of youth full-time members. For the highest leadership positions, management committee, executive committee, and board of directors, there was a slight increase in the percentage of youth members holding these roles, from 20% to 24%.

Table 40: Percentage of Youth in Management Positions at Community Organizations, by Sex and Type of Position (Baseline vs. Midline)

		nageme mmitte		Executive Committee		Board of Di			l of Dire	ectors	Any leadership roles		
	Youth	YW	YM	Youth	YW	YM	Youth	YW	YM	Youth	YW	YM	
Baseline	15%	6%	9%	3%	1%	2%	2%	0.5%	1.5%	20%	12.5%	7.5%	
Midline	13%	7%	6%	8%	3%	5%	3%	1%	2%	24%	13%	11%	
% Change	-2%	1%	-3%	5%	2%	3%	1%	0.5%	0.5%	4%	0.5%	3.5%	

As Table 40 demonstrates, the largest increase for youth in management was mainly through young men (3.5%), with young women experiencing a negligible half percent increase. While women engage increasingly with civil society organizations, gender norms are still preventing them from ascending to leadership roles. Within women's organizations, young women are still seen as being incapable of leadership and these roles stay with older women.

To address this, for the final two years of the project there was a targeted effort to encourage youth to apply for leadership positions and give them the necessary skills. Simultaneously, EELY worked with community organizations to make them more open to increasing youth within leadership roles.

Unfortunately, due to the expense of replicating the study, the endline consultation did not involve an internal membership study of community organizations, and there was no additional data produced for comparability.

# Immediate Outcome 2.2: Enhanced capacity of and strengthened relevant community and state institutions to develop and extend enabling programs for the equal development of young women and men.

#### Indicator 2.2.1: # and type of youth focused services

This indicator looked at the change in the types of services available for youth in GBC, provided by either government or non-government actors. This indicator was assessed by identifying youth-focused services available in GBC. At baseline, services were limited (only five programs identified) and categorized in one of three categories as sports, recreation (non-athletic), and cultural events.

As detailed in Table 41 and summarized in Table 42, in 2017 there are 20 services readily available to youth which span into three additional categories: employment services, youth loans and public-private partnerships for youth.

Type of Service	Services Provided (Updated 2017)
Sports*	Youth polo Tournaments **
	<ul> <li>Mixed sports festival**</li> </ul>
	Football tournaments
	Construction of sports complex in Chitral
Recreation*	<ul> <li>Local/traditional recreational events**</li> </ul>
	Speech competitions
Culture *	Cultural festivals**
	Intercultural exposure visits for youth
	<ul> <li>Participation of GBC youth in national cultural events</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Music and videos to promote local culture</li> </ul>
	Cultural shows**
Employment	Youth resource centres
Services	Trade exhibitions
	<ul> <li>Trainings and workshops for youth entering labour market</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>Seminars and job exhibitions for job hunters</li> </ul>
Youth Loans	<ul> <li>Support provided for youth to access interest free loans/credit</li> </ul>
Public-Private	Youth conventions
Partnerships for	Improvement of public parks
Youth	• Tourism promotion events (campaigns, publicity, festivals, shows)
	Education conferences

 Table 41: Type of Service and Details of Service Provided to Youth in GBC

\*Available category at baseline

\*\* Available service at baseline

Also of note, is that many of the services were directly inspired or borrowed from EELY programming, such as speech competitions, youth resource centres, job exhibitions, etc. This has been verified on multiple occasions at the project steering committee meetings as GBC government officials revealed their youth plans to other members, with attributions to EELY and AKRSP.

|--|

	Number of Types of Services	Number of Services
Baseline	3	5
Endline	6	20
Difference (#)	3	15

Indicator 2.2.2: % of targeted LSOs that are organizationally viable (financial viability, develop plans, resource mobilization, developing partnerships/linkages with stakeholders)

The Pakistan Centre for Philanthropy carried out an organizational capacity assessment study of the AKRSP-fostered LSOs supported under EELY.<sup>22</sup> The findings of this study are summarized in Table 43.

Overall, the assessment shows that LSOs in GBC have performed fairly well in their catchment areas and have shown above average (A and B scores) performance in nearly all categories of evaluation, with the exception of impact.

Rating		Gover- nance (%)	Manage ment Capacity (%)	Networking & Volunteerism (%)	Impact (%)	Sustain- ability (%)	Combined Score (%)
Above 80 % (.	A)	18	20	27	8	30	21
65-79% (	B)	47	43	33	27	30	36
Sub-Total (A+B)		65	63	60	35	60	57
50-64% (	C)	23	20	28	8	28	21
Less than 50% (	D)	12	17	12	57	12	22
Sub-Total (C+D)		35	37	40	65	40	43

Table 43: LSOs Institutional Viability Scores

Overall 60% of the LSOs had demonstrated a good ability and institutional capacities to sustain themselves in the long run. It is encouraging that LSOs are able to self-govern and obtain resources increasingly independent of AKRSP. While the baseline study was done using a different methodology, it was determined that none of the LSOs fell within this category. Twenty-two percent of LSOs scored below 50% with management capacity and impact being the largest driver. Future efforts will be targeted at these LSOs to ensure that they can catch up with the other organizations.

# *Indicator 2.2.3: Perceptions of youth (direct participants) about relevance and quality of programs for young women and men in GBC.*

EELY engaged with community organizations, the private sector, and the government to develop programs and services which are relevant for young women and men in GBC (as described under outputs).

	Positive				No Impact			Negative		
	Baseline	Endline	Diff.	Baseline	Endline	Diff.	Baseline	Endline	Diff.	
Community Org.	65%	78%	+13%	28%	19%	-9%	7%	3%	-4%	
Private Sector	67%	76%	+9%	28%	20%	-8%	6%	4%	-2%	
Govern- ment	50%	60%	+10%	33%	29%	-4%	17%	11%	-6%	

Table 44: Perceptions of Youth about Relevance and Quality of Programs, by Type of Program Implementer (Baseline vs. Endline)

The percentage of youth perceiving a positive impact of community institutions on their lives has increased by 13%, while a negative view of the impact of community organizations has dropped by four percent. Also the percentage of youth not perceiving any impact of the community organizations has dropped by nine percent (from 28% to 19%) which indicates increased trust of youth towards community organizations, one of the goals of the project.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> PCP; the State of LSOs in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral, 2016.

A nine percent increase over the baseline is noted in the number of youth perceiving a positive impact of services provided to them by private sector organizations. The ratio of youth perceiving a negative impact of services provided by private sector has dropped by two percent. The percentage of youth perceiving no impact of such services has dropped by eight percent over the baseline. By connecting youth to employers, and entrepreneurs to value chains, and stimulating the private sector's service providers EELY aimed to improve the link between youth and the private sector, which the improved youth perception suggests was a success.

The perception survey revealed that, compared to the baseline, the perceptions of youth regarding government institutions has increased from 50% to 60% at midline. The number of youth perceiving "no impact" and "negative impact" of government institutions has decreased by four percent and six percent respectively, over the last three year period. The visible decline in negative perceptions and increase in positive impressions of youth suggests a positive impact from the substantial investments by the governments on youth-focused services.

### Indicator 2.2.4: % of young women and men at mid and senior levels in AKRSP

Table 45 demonstrates the distribution of staff by age (youth vs. non-youth) and gender (women vs. men). Between baseline and endline there was an increase of 18.5% of youth at midlevel positions (with a 10.7% decrease in young women in these positions); within the same period, there was a 4.7% increase in the number of youth in senior positions, with young women experiencing 1.7% increase, and young men increased by three percent. It should be noted that in absolute numbers, the numbers remained the same for women at midlevel, but the number over overall positions increased and they were largely filled by young men.

Position	Youth/Non	% Female (#)	% Male (#)	% Total (#)
Baseline		•	•	
Midlevel	Non-Youth	12% (13)	52% (56)	64% (69)
Millever	Youth	20.3% (22)	6.4% (7)	26.7% (29)
Senior	Non-Youth	0.9% (1)	7.4% (8)	8.3% (9)
Senior	Youth	0% (0)	0.9% (1)	0.9% (1)
		33.2% (36)	66.7% (72)	100% (108)
Endline				
Midlevel	Non-Youth	4.8% (11)	21.5% (49)	26.4% (60)
Milliever	Youth	9.6% (22)	35.6% (81)	45.3% (103)
Senior	Non-Youth	1.7% (4)	20.7% (47)	22.4% (51)
Senior	Youth	1.7% (4)	3.9% (9)	5.7% (13)
		18% (41)	82% (186)	100% (227)
Difference				
Midlevel	Youth	-10.7% (0)	+29.2% (+74)	+18.5% (+74)
Senior	Youth	+1.7% (+4)	+3% (+8)	+4.7% (+12)

Table 45: Percentage of Youth in Midlevel and Senior Positions at AKRSP, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)

EELY's internship program under the institutional development component, which placed interns at AKRSP and with their government partners, was a large contributing factor to the increase of youth staff in general. As youth took on more responsibility in a youth-driven project, they were increasingly promoted. One success story is from Chitral where a young woman went from being an intern placed for two-months to becoming the regional M&E manager (midlevel) between the first and fifth year of the project.

The percentage loss of women at mid-level does not represent a net-loss of women, since the number of positions remained the same (22), but a reduction in comparison to the male members at this level. Of note, one-third of the youth promoted to senior management were young women.

# Intermediate Outcome 1: Increased and more equitable employability of young women and men in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral

#### Indicator 1.1: Perceptions of employers on employment challenges

The endline employers' perception survey has provided a comparison of the data with that of previous surveys and found that 28% of employers in the endline found it difficult to find men with necessary skills compared to 57% in midline and 61% in the baseline, while only eight percent of employers faced the same difficulty in recruiting women, compared to 20% in the baseline and 32% in the midline. This indicates a perceived increase in the supply of young skilled labour, a development which can be partially attributed to EELY.

While more employers (30%) faced the problem of high salary demand in the endline compared to the baseline (21%) and midline (16%), there has been a dramatic drop in the proportion of employers facing the problem of high salary demand in recruiting women, from 35% in the baseline to only two percent of employers in the endline.<sup>23</sup> More research is required in the future to see whether this is women understanding salary trends, or women conforming to the glass ceiling which keeps them significantly below male salaries, even when earning more than their non-EELY peers (indicator A2).



Figure 5: Top Challenges Faced by Employers in Recruiting Women and Men, Baseline vs. Midline vs. Endline

Three-quarters of employers (77%) said that they still faced some problems in recruiting youth workers. The same reasons were cited as for recruiting workers of all ages (skills, experience, and salary expectations). The missing skills identified were also similar to those commonly cited for recruiting workers of all age groups, except that language skills were mentioned by the second highest number of employers after vocational or technical skills. Far more reasons were mentioned for hiring of male compared to female workers, since the majority of employers (70%) did not employ females.

# Indicator 1.2: Youth perceptions about equitable employability (disaggregated by youth cohort, gender, age, sector and region)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The survey asked employers to list the problems for both women and men. No data was gathered on the actual salary requests of women compared to men.

Figure 6 illustrates youth's perception regarding employment opportunities considering factors like age, sex, education, experience, differently abled, marital status and others.



Figure 6: Perception of Youth on Factors that Determine Employment Decisions

The finding presented in graph above reveals that youth perceive that education and experience are the main factors required to access employment opportunities by young women and men whereas other factors like sex, being differently abled and marital status are perceived as less important consideration. It should be noted that this is a perception, since the employer's survey revealed that sex considerably contributes towards likeliness of getting hired.

Note: unfortunately sex-disaggregation has not been captured.

# Indicator 1.3: % increase in sales prices and volumes in selected value chains on products sold by targeted producers and entrepreneurs

Table 46 shows that the target products within value chains supported by EELY have all experienced an increase in sales price from baseline, with the largest coming from the high-value horticulture investments in dried apricot and fresh apples.

Name of Products	Baseline sales	Endline sale Price	Difference (PKR)	% increase		
	Price (PKR)	(PKR)				
Apricot (dried)	PKR 70 per kg	PKR 400 per kg	PKR 330 per kg	471%		
Apple (fresh)	PKR 20 per kg	PKR 150 per kg	PKR 130 per kg	650%		
Greenwood	PKR 200 per sq ft	PKR 600 per sq ft	PKR 400 per sq ft	200%		
Prices of Average	PKR 1500	PKR 3000	PKR 1500	100%		
Hotel Room rents						

 Table 46: Percentage Increase in Sales Price in Selected Value Chains (Baseline vs. Endline)

*Source: value chain studies, conducted between 2015 and 2017* 

The volume of products also experienced an increase in volume of annual sales, with the largest increase coming from the horticultural value chain (dried apricot) and tourism. Of note is the greenwood value chain which was almost exclusively participated in by women. While not as large an increase as other value chains, it is encouraging that a green and female-driven product was able to find a foothold within the market.

Table 47: Percentage Increase in Annual Sales Volume in Select Value Chains (Baseline vs. Endline)

Value Chain Sub-	Value Chain Sub- Baseline sales		Difference	% change			
sector/ products	volume	volume*	(Volume)				
Dried Apricot	60 tons	600 tons	540 tons	900%			
Apple (fresh)	50 tons	200 tons	150 kg	300%			
Greenwood	250,000 sq ft	500,000 sq ft	250,000 sq ft	100%			
Tourists	25,000 tourists	300,000 tourists	275,000 tourists	1100%			

Value Chain Sub-	Baseline sales	Endline sale	Difference	% change
sector/products	volume	volume*	(Volume)	
Hotel Room Occupancy Rates (average)	30%	100%	70%	233%

\* Based on records of supported enterprises and value chain studies

Some additional details about the three sectors are listed below.

#### Domestic Tourism sector:

- Tourism promotion videos developed by EELY's youth have more than a half million views on social media and have been aired on national TV channels (55% of survey respondents reported the internet as their primary source of tourism-related information for GBC).<sup>24</sup>
- Similarly, camping sites and tracks developed under the project have been replicated on a large scale by private enterprises and new entrepreneurs. For example, it is reported that over 100 new accommodation facilities, mostly camping sites, have been established in the project area in the 2016 season.

#### *High value horticulture:*

• An apricot and apple juice called "Hunza Meadow," a beneficiary enterprise of the project, was introduced into the market by Gaba Foods (a nation-wide food chain).

#### Greenwood:

- Greenwood is now being used for kitchen and bedroom furniture for the first time in the region.
- Low cost seasoning technology was replicated in the project area which led to a reduction in wood wastage and improved the strength and durability for commercial usage.

#### Indicator 1.4: % female youth with control over financial decisions<sup>25</sup>

Decision-making over finances and income is a global standard indicator for WEE. It represents an increase in agency of women and provides a proxy of household power dynamics.

Female youth who had indicated that they were earning an income, were asked "who normally decides on how the money you earn is spent?" Table 46 presents a summary of the responses.

		Sole Decision Making ("me by myself")	Joint ("me in negotiation with parent / husband")	No Role ("the decision is made without my input")
Baseline (	GBC-wide)	2.2%	54.1%	41.6%
	Gilgit	18%	74%	8%
Endline	Baltistan	49%	43%	8%
Ename	Chitral	42%	50%	8%
GBC-wide		36.3%	55.6%	8.0%
Difference	e (GBC-wide)	+34.1%	+1.5%	-33.6%

Table 48: Female Youth with Control Over Financial Decision-making, by Region (Baseline vs. Endline)

Across GBC, there was a 34.1% increase in young women responding that they are the sole decisionmaker over their income, up from 2.2% to 36.3%. This quantitative figure is backed up by focus group

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Tracer study on Domestic Tourism conducted by AKRSP in 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> This was dropped from the PMF in the 2013 revision, but EELY continued to collect data due to it being a key performance indicator for WEE.

discussions at the endline where women confirmed that their experience under EELY gave them more agency, such as the following:

"By attending the YIP I proved that I could work safely in this male dominant society and increased the level of trust of my parents. Now I am working as a teacher in Army Public School. I am neither dependent upon my family nor am I a passive frustrated youth." – Female FGD member, Astor, Gilgit

This was also supported by observations from the WEE evaluation:

All women said that income from work had helped them renegotiate power structures within the family. It helped them to move from a level of 'welfare' where they were seen as simply recipients of husbands' income and goodwill, to a level of participation, where they were taking a more active and equal role in household decision-making, including on how to spend family income. This transition was engendered by a greater conscientization - a realization that they were equal partners in the family's welfare.

Intermediate Outcome 2: Increased and more equitable engagement between and among male and female youth leaders, community institutions and local government to address the needs of vouth in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral

#### Indicator 2.1 # and type of public, community, private sector policies, services, and practices that are youth and gender sensitive and enable greater participation of young women and men

AKRSP's engagement with the government of GB under the project has been effective in terms of influencing policies, developing strategies and programs. There is no baseline value for this indicator.

Since the start of EELY 40 youth and gender sensitive services were provided by the government of GB, with two in progress.

**40** 

Table 49: Number and Type of Public Services and Practices that are Youth and Gender Sensitive						
	Status	Progress				
Youth and gender sensitive services provided by the government	(Completed/	count				
	in process)	(number)				
1. Provided support to Cultural festivals and sporting events, trade	Completed	34				
exhibitions, calendar events organized by public/ community sector						
2. Diamer Youth Development Program through DPAP in Diamer	Completed	1				
3. Construction of two Sports Stadiums in Chitral	Completed	1				
4. Regional Youth conventions organized through PPP	Completed	1				
5. Youth Resource Centre established	Completed	1				
6. Access to online information on jobs, training, education, etc. for	Completed	1				
youth						
7. Internship programs	Completed	1				

While the GB government is yet to approve its long-standing youth policy draft, it has taken a number of positive steps for youth development, including the Chief Minister's interest free loan program for unemployed youth, TVET strategy for GB, and a significant increase in the annual budget for youth.

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa launched its first Youth Policy in November 2016. It provides resources for supporting micro-finance to youth for self-employment, 5% job quota in universities, social assistance and employment insurance programs for unemployed youth. AKRSP supported the KP government in the formulation of its tourism and youth policies, and has been supporting the tourism and youth departments in implementing these policies. The budget for tourism has increased by over 100 times

**Total completed Policy events:** 

during the last few years. Work on two big stadiums is ongoing in Chitral. A youth centre has been built and it will be functional after inauguration by Q2 of 2017.

# Indicator 2.2 % of young women and men engaged at different levels in community institutions and local administrative bodies

Local government bodies do not exist in Gilgit-Baltistan. However, for Chitral district, 2015 election data is presented in Table 50. Of the 571 general members, 48 were young men. Of the 100 dedicated women's seats, 33% went to young women. In total of the 878 possible seats in Chitral district, 162 (18%) were held by young men and 33 (4%) were held by young women.

Members Types	Total Elected Members	Members of LSOs/VOs/WOs	Young women #	Young men #
General Members	571	246 (43%)	0 (0%)	48 (8%)
Women	100	55 (55%)	33 (33%)	0 (0%)
Youth Members	100	62 (62%)	0 (0%)	100 (100%)
Kisan(Farmer)	100	52 (52%)	0 (0%)	12 (12%)
Minority	7	7 (100%)	0 (0%)	2 (29%)
Total	878	422 (48%)	33 (4%)	162 (18%)

Table 50: Participation of Young EELY Beneficiaries in Local Government after Elections in Chitral, 2015

It should be noted that 48% of the total seats went to a member of an LSO, or VO/WO. Given the increased participation of youth, both young women and men, in these bodies, this means that youth have another opportunity to engage with local administrative bodies.

The challenges in women's leadership in Chitral is evident. One-hundred percent of the youth members went to young men; women (and young women) were relegated to women's seats. However, as Farida's story (p. 52) demonstrated, EELY made a targeted effort on ensuring that elected women, regardless of seat, were able to have their voice heard.

Since this was the only election held during the EELY project, there is no baseline data or endline data for comparison.

# Indicator 2.3: % of the total annual budget allocated for the development of youth by the local administrative bodies

The Annual Development Plan budgets for the financial year 2016-17of the GB government have an allocation of 1.27% of the total annual budget for the development of youth. This represents a 180% increase in the funding available for youth programming (up from 0.7% at baseline).

Some highlights of the 2016-2017 budget include:

- GB government has allocated PKR 400 million for interest-free loans for youth for the 2017 fiscal year and have earmarked an additional PKR 200 million for 2018.
- GB government wants to collaborate with AKRSP in identifying potential entrepreneurs for extending government loans towards promising youth.
- Directly referencing EELY in its 2016/2017 development plan, the GB government launched new programs to engage youth, including creative events and competitions (such as mini-documentary and photography competitions).
- The GB government has taken over the youth internship program from EELY and has put aside enough funds to deliver two years of the program.
- The GB government has created a destination management program to promote tourism as a viable career for youth.
- The GB government is launching a youth exchange program to promote cultural interaction,

peace and harmony among the youth of GB.

# <u>Ultimate Outcome: Increased engagement of youth as productive and full members in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral</u>

# Indicator A1: Proportion of representatives in GB Assembly, local government and community organizations who fall in the youth age group

The government cabinet division data shows that 18% of the GBLA members are young women (9%) and men (9%).

At baseline, 11% of GBLA members were young men (three out of 27 members) and 7.4% were young women (two out of 27 members). The comparison shows that although the youth membership in GBLA has slightly increased (from a baseline of six members at endline) the effect *is neutralized due to the fact that size of GBLA was also increased from 27 total members to 33 during the 2015 elections*. However the proportion of young women members amongst the youth members showed an increase and equal number of young female and male members (three each) elected to the GBLA.

	Baseline		Endline		Differential Change	
GBLA Members	%Youth of Total Members	%within Youth Members	%Youth of Total Members	%within Youth Members	%Youth of Total Members	%within Youth Members
Total GBLA Members	27		33			
Young Women	7.4% (2)	40% (2)	9.0% (3)	50% (3)	2% (+1)	10% (+1)
Young Men	11.1% (3)	60% (3)	9.0% (3)	50% (3)	-2% (0)	-10% (0)
Total Young Members	18.5% (5)	100% (5)	18% (6)	100% (6)	-0.5%(+1)	-

Table 51: Young Women and Men in the Gilgit-Baltistan Legislative Assembly (Baseline vs. Endline)

District Councils and Union Councils did not exist prior to 2008 in Gilgit-Baltistan. However, the youth representation in the District Councils of Chitral district of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa province are provided below. Thirty-seven percent of the total seats were youth. The only young women were the women in the women's members reserved seats.

The Chitral Tehsil Council details are outlined under indicator 2.2. The participation of the total population of youth in community organizations has also increased by seven percent during the EELY project period from 23% at baseline to 30%. This included a four percent increase for young men and three percent increase for young women.

Table 52: Percentage of Youth Who Belong to Community Organization from Total Population, by sex (Baseline vs. Endline)

Youth (from total population) in Community Organizations							
Type of CO MembersBaselineEndlineDifferential Change							
Young Women (from total population)	10%	13%	+3%				
Young Men (from total population)	13%	17%	+4%				
Total Young Members	23%	30%	+7%				

#### Indicator A2: Monthly earnings of the target group

According to the external endline evaluation, the average monthly gross income of youth with an income source was PKR 21,253. This is two and a half times the average monthly income of PKR 8,317 reported in the baseline survey. There was a significant difference in the mean income of youth participating in
EELY projects (PKR 21,911) compared to non-participants (PKR 17,173). However, gross incomes of salaried persons (PKR 22,144) were higher than those of self-employed youth (PKR 20,865). This is possibly due to the fact that businesses normally take two to three years before generating significant profits.

The data suggests that the project has had an impact in improving employability, particularly selfemployment, among youth, and contributed to a significant improvement in their incomes.

Respondent	Gilgit				Baltistan			Chitral		
Category	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
Baseline	6,422*	10,211*	8,317*	6,422*	10,211*	8,317*	6,422*	10,211*	8,317*	
Endline	16,440	23,326	20,593	13,850	23,326	23,052	19,388	23,326	27,721	
Net Increase	10,018	13,115	12,277	7,428	13,115	14,736	12,966	13,115	19,404	
% Difference	164%	178%	168%	186%	178%	156%	150%	178%	142%	

Table 53: Average Monthly Gross Income (PKR), by Region, Sex and Beneficiary Status (Baseline vs. Endline)

Baseline Youth Survey, 2013, n=4276 vs. Endline Youth survey, 2017, N=569

\*Only mean monthly gross income for all of GBC available in baseline report

What is most interesting about the results is the differences for young women and men. While the difference between EELY and non-EELY young men is quite small in Gilgit and Baltistan, partially attributed to a general economic boost in the region, the increase in female income is 22% to 204% depending on the region. As the EELY project evolved, it increasingly tightened its focus on WEE and this demonstrates that EELY's young women were able to enter the economy and earn an income. It is noted however, that even while women are earning more, the inequality in income between women and men has also increased, especially in Baltistan and Chitral.

Respondent		Gilgit			Baltistan			Chitral	
Category	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total
Non-EELY Beneficiaries	11,363	23,200	19,131	11,333	23,200	21,113	6,375	23,200	10,796
EELY Beneficiaries	16,440	23,326	20,593	13,850	23,326	23,052	19,388	23,326	27,721
Net Difference	5,077	126	1,462	2,517	126	1,939	13,013	126	16,925
% Difference	45%	1%	8%	22%	1%	9%	204%	1%	157%

 Table 54: Average Monthly Gross Income (PKR) by Region, Sex and Beneficiary Status (2017 Endline; EELY vs. Non-EELY)

Youth survey, 2017, N=569

#### Indicator A3: % of young women and men employed, unemployed and underemployed (selfemployed and wage-employed) in GBC by gender, age, youth and sector of employment (target group)

The endline survey demonstrated that, among EELY beneficiaries, 77.7% of young men are employed, and 76.4% of young women are employed. The endline report classified employment as working for a wage or self-employment. This represents a 6.4% increase for young men from the baseline and a 28.2% increase for young women. Challenges with measuring underemployment with the survey methods prevented the category from being captured.

 Table 55: Employment Status of Youth, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)

Employment status	Baseline	Endline	% difference
Young women employed	48.2%	76.4%	28.2%
Young men employed	71.3%	77.7%	6.4%

The most common sources of income were professional, technical and related work, business, sales, or trading, while home based work, service, administrative and managerial jobs, and agriculture also

provided income to a substantial number of youth. A significant proportion of youth (44%) started their own business or income generating activity during the last two years.

Tuble 50. Onemployment Status of Touth, by Sex (Buseline VS. Ename)						
Employment status	Baseline	Endline	% difference			
Young women unemployed	51.8 %	23.6%	- 28.2%			
Young men unemployed	28.7%	22.3%	- 6.40%			

 Table 56: Unemployment Status of Youth, by Sex (Baseline vs. Endline)

A far greater proportion of beneficiary (40%) compared to non-beneficiary (18%) youth were working as self-employed workers, indicating a substantial impact of the project in creating self-employment in youth. A greater proportion of youth of Baltistan (44%), compared to Gilgit (33%) and Chitral (30%) regions, was self-employed. While the difference did not emerge in the interviews, one can hypothesize that it might be related to Baltistan having the smallest percentage of youth acting as wage earners.

Respondent	Gilgit				Baltistan			Chitral		
Category	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
Non-EELY Beneficiaries	6%	14%	10%	0%	27%	18%	20%	36%	25%	
EELY Beneficiaries	38%	37%	38%	46%	51%	48%	30%	35%	32%	
% Difference	32%	23%	28%	46%	24%	30%	10%	-1%	7%	

Table 57: Percentage of Self-Employed Youth by Sex and Region (2017 Endline; EELY vs. Non-EELY)

What is interesting to note is the difference for female beneficiaries. As the employer survey suggested, 70% of employers (n=315) do not hire women. In order to gain an income in a restrictive labour market, many women entered the self-employment space. When examining monthly income figures, this suggests that they are succeeding. In fact 62% of women compared to 32% of men said that they had started their own business or other income generating activity during the last two years, indicating that the project had a large impact in supporting young women to start businesses.

While making considerable gains in income compared to the rest of the population, the sectors that women operated in for self-employment were gendered. Most of the women were involved in tailoring, carpet-weaving and handicrafts (33%) and in running ECD centres (30%). In turn, some professions only had men working in them (e.g. construction, transport and storage, air conditioning repair, and plumbing).

Perhaps related to the high percentage of EELY beneficiaries in self-employment (versus the rest of the population) is that, with the exception of young women in Chitral, EELY beneficiaries are behind their non-EELY counterparts in every region for waged employment. This can be explained partially by the EELY demographics (education, skill level, location), but also by the temptation of starting an enterprise.

Respondent	Gilgit				Baltistan			Chitral		
Category	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	Female	Male	Total	
Non-EELY Beneficiaries	25%	46%	36%	23%	39%	33%	4%	41%	15%	
EELY Beneficiaries	20%	28%	25%	15%	31%	23%	22%	30%	26%	
% Difference	-5%	-18%	-11%	-8%	-8%	-10%	18%	-11%	11%	

 Table 58: Percentage of Wage-Employed Youth by Sex, Region and Beneficiary Status (2017 Endline; EELY vs. Non-EELY)

There were clear gender differences in wage-earning status. One-third of men (31%) worked for a salary/wage, compared to only 18% women. Again, this is likely due to the fact that 70% of surveyed employers responded that they do not hire women at their workplace.

# III. Political Considerations

At the outset of the project, there was a delay in signing an MOU with the GB government. The GB representatives wanted AKRSP to extend their reach into Diamer district, an area no international NGO had yet penetrated. AKFC, AKFP, AKRSP, and Global Affairs Canada came to an agreement over this arrangement, and programming began in Diamer in Year 3. This emerged into one of the most positive elements of EELY, as AKRSP became the first external NGO to fully engage with Diamer, and was able to make great strides in working with their youth, especially with young women. The government of GB has fully acknowledged this and the role that AKRSP has played in maintaining stability within the valleys of Diamer.

During the project, general elections were held at national level and the federal and provincial governments were changed in 2013. Also the GB provincial elections were held again in 2015 and as a result the government leadership changed exactly halfway through the project. This change in political leadership at all levels had some positive and negative considerations.

Positive considerations:

- New provincial and federal governments responded to AKDN, AKRSP and EELY positively by actively participating in PPP activities.
- The incoming GB government and representatives from Chitral seamlessly played an active role in the PSC, and through this forum EELY was able to advocate for increased spending on youth initiatives, such as the extension of the youth internship program and interest-free loans to youth entrepreneurs.
- The public sector organizations and elected representatives fully cooperated with LSOs and provided needed support for implementing youth centric interventions.
- The local elections in Chitral and the provincial elections in GB offered an opportunity for EELY to mobilize youth to become more civically engaged, including running for office. EELY supported and trained numerous newly elected youth in both Chitral and GB, including young women, to fulfill these roles within the new governments.
- AKRSP was able to sign an MOU with the redesigned Local Government and Rural Development (LGRD) department of the GB government to build their capacity on working for, and with, youth. This included training their master trainers and strengthening curriculum. This relationship was positive, and EELY used some of their accrued interest income to further bolster their ability to train more LGRD members.

Negative considerations:

- EELY had mobilized and sensitized the public sector stakeholders in the outgoing political leadership. With the change in the government, EELY had to remobilize incoming political leadership; this consumed considerable resources, effort and time to regain momentum.
- The Youth Policy of Gilgit-Baltistan is still undergoing review by the new government, a process stalled by the elections.

Additionally, the national government tightened security protocols due to security concerns with its Afghan border and the initiation of China-Pakistan Economic Corridor which will pass through GB. In turn, the government issued a new notification for all NGOs and INGOs to obtain a no objection certificate (NOC) again in order to continue operations. Subsequently surveys, data collection, and the entry of foreigners without an NOC to GBC was restricted, which resulted in delays in external surveys and research studies.

# IV. Analysis of Scheduling

The signing of EELY agreements and fulfilling initial project launch processes consumed the entire first half of Year 1 and formal activities started late in the second half of the year. This late start caused initial delays in achieving targets for the first two and a half years.

Also the annual PSC meetings were initially scheduled in June or July of every year, where the annual work plans and budgets are approved, which caused a delay of one full first quarter of the new year. This issue was rectified in the third year and beyond with approvals scheduled in February/March, prior to the PSC meeting.

An analysis of scheduling provided by the baseline demonstrates that 70% of EELY beneficiaries were engaged between Year 3 and 6 of the project, with almost 30% of the total engaged during Year 4. While EELY hit the majority of its targets prior to conclusion of implementation, this skewed distribution in scheduling had some draw-backs:

- Beneficiaries were not able to always have a full pathway through various components of the EELY project;
- The follow-up support was not always at the level it needed to be, as described by some youth internship graduates in endline focus group discussions, due to staff responding to compressed schedules.

The project logic model, performance monitoring framework, and work breakdown structure were reviewed and revised in the third year based on the experiences of project implementation. Subsequently, the M&E system was realigned and revamped to mitigate problems regarding clarity, reliability, traceability, quality and timely flow of the data/progress information.

The devastating floods and earthquakes at the start of EELY and in the third and fourth years of the project caused delays in implementation because AKRSP had to divert its available resources and priorities towards rescue, early recovery and rehabilitation activities.

# V. Logistical Difficulties

# **Staffing**

One of the positive additional elements of EELY was AKRSP's commitment to hiring youth both as implementers and promoting youth to middle management positions. Combined with the internships, this meant a youth perspective was always at the forefront of the project. However, a reliance on youth also had some challenges, as capacity had to be regularly upgraded.

Additionally, the large geography and follow-up requirements meant that the staff were constantly stretched until staf scheduling and distribution was solidified mid-project, which contributed towards delays in activities.

#### <u>Travel</u>

The large geographic scope of the project meant that AKRSP had to travel greater distances in comparison to prior projects. The scope was increased as EELY committed to working in Diamer and to engage youth from some of the most remote parts of Gilgit-Baltistan. Since EELY was primarily an HR-focused project, this meant that staff had to travel for mobilization, monitoring, follow-up, and problem-solving. The budget for travel was regularly over-spent and additional resources had to be reallocated to the travel budget in Year 5.

Security issues in GBC also meant that the PSC meetings and annual work-planning sessions had to be moved from Gilgit to Islamabad in Years 4 and 5, which also increased travel spending.

#### Procurement and Services

No major issues were reported regarding procurement of physical items.

For services, EELY made the commitment to work with local service providers. This inherently led to some challenges as the level of service provision in GBC was relatively low at the start of the project. However, increased engagement led to increased capacity and better performance. For certain skills development training, such as heavy equipment operations, no accredited service provider was available in GBC so youth had to be sent to south Pakistan for training.

#### Working with women

From the outset, EELY made a commitment to work with young women and to fully engage them in the economic and social life of GBC. However, this meant that special logistics had to be arranged to ensure women's participation in activities that traditionally would have excluded them. Examples include:

- Special arrangements were made to host women's sporting or recognition events in accordance with local customs and to ensure women's participation; including dedicated pavilions for women.
- Establishing, through YMCA investments, additional women's only markets by negotiating with landlords to only rent out market spaces for women entrepreneurs and negotiating with traditional leaders to allow women to access the markets.<sup>26</sup>
- Extra HR effort and time was dedicated to recruiting and engaging women in non-traditional trades.
- To get increased women's participation in LSOs, AKRSP had to create gender equality policies for LSOs, conduct gender pairing sessions with LSO leadership, and work closely with members to increase social acceptability.

#### Special considerations: Diamer

Working in Diamer had numerous logistical difficulties. Since AKRSP was initially not able to make inroads into the tight-knit community, due to ethnic and sectarian issues, a third-party, DPAP, had to be engaged. DPAP, a relatively new organization, had capacity gaps which needed to be addressed before they could be a viable implementer. Since outsiders were traditionally not permitted to enter Diamer, this was a protracted process. Additionally, in accordance with local norms, all activities within Diamer had to be extensively pre-negotiated with local elders to ensure there would be no community backlash. This was especially true for EELY's well-documented work with Diamer's young women. Before AKRSP's gender and development manager was able to enter the district and negotiate on young women's behalf, DPAP had to ensure that there would be an accepting and safe environment for her. Before any individual female intern was engaged with the project the elders would be consulted, and permission would be sought door-to-door from potential interns' families.

However, the work in Diamer proved to be rewarding for the community of Diamer. EELY was fully accepted within the area, and Diamer is now showing more openness to participate in social and economic development projects, including ones which target young women. At the conclusion of the project DPAP requested assistance to develop a vocational training program for Diamer, specifically targeting young women, something which would not have been conceivable prior to EELY.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The women's only market model, developed by AKRSP prior to EELY, has become a huge success in GBC as part of the local culture. Initially, careful negotiation had to occur with local traditional leaders to gain social acceptance, after which decrees or fatwas were issued and other markets developed independent of the project.

#### Public engagement in Canada

AKFC experienced some delays in producing content based on the 2014 communications mission. Video content was collected by an AKFC volunteer, who donated his time and use of his equipment in exchange for travel expenses and the opportunity to gain field experience. Greater time was required to manage the volunteer, and the process of working with the volunteer to edit the footage protracted when he gained a full-time job. In this case, the cost-savings of using a volunteer was offset by greater investments of time by AKFC, and a lower standard of final product.

# VI. Public Relations

The project benefited greatly from strategic partnerships with government organizations and departments of GBC, as well as non-government and private organizations. The skill development programs benefited greatly from the support of NAVTEC, KIU, and large NGOs like KADO. Collaboration with the Culture, Youth, Sports and Tourism departments led to a substantial increase in the annual budget for youth promotion; collaboration in hosting a number of festivals in Chitral; promotion of tourism activities in GBC; and setting up of a sports stadium and promotion of sports activities, particularly for girls and young women, in Chitral. The project was also able to get government financial support for training 90 youth as heavy machine operators.

AKRSP's relationship with the private sector contributed to the success of the project, since it played a role in placing interns, connecting with youth entrepreneurs, and participating in labour market assessments.

Partnership with all LSOs in the project area helped EELY to have full partnerships with and access to all the target communities. LSOs facilitated the project in mobilization and selection of youth for training, increased involvement of youth in LSO affairs, and development and implementation of youth development plans by LSOs. Additionally, LSO members, especially in Chitral, became heavily involved during the elections and several members, including youth members were elected. This meant that EELY found itself with several allies at various levels of government, willing to advocate on behalf of the project and youth.

As detailed under the logistical difficulties section, partnership with the DPAP enabled the project to engage district elders and get a foothold in Diamer, and implement activities for young women and men. Initially the response to EELY's work was skeptical, but a breakthrough occurred following a first-aid training with young women in Year 4 of the project. Following a successful engagement with young men, community members were willing to send their youth to future EELY events. This was paired with engagement of Diamer's young men through activities such as DRR and wood-working training. Shortly after, the community would directly approach DPAP and request additional training.

Finally, AKRSP is part of the rural support program network (RSPN), which allowed sharing of experiences and best practices with similar rural support programs present throughout Pakistan,.

There were also some cost-savings under the public engagement budget as AKFC was able to profile EELY as part of a number of public engagement activities funded through other GAC programs. For example, the University Seminar Series, Global Village, and the *Together* exhibition were all funded by the AKFC-GAC Partnership for Advancing Human Development (PAHDAA). This approach allowed AKFC to reach a larger number of Canadians with EELY content than would otherwise have been possible.

In total approximately 558,000 Canadians were reached by public engagement activities such as briefs, animated videos, videos, a magazine article and the Together exhibition (detailed in Section B). This provided an opportunity for Canadians to learn more about EELY and engage with various components of the project and in some instances, meet members of the AKRSP team.

# VII. Analysis, Recommendations and Lessons Learned

# <u>Analysis</u>

Using a mixed-methods approach, the endline provided the following analysis of EELY using the criteria of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability.

Relevance:

- In the context of increasing literacy and unemployment rates in GBC, and the devolution of powers to the provinces, the launching of the Project in 2011 was quite timely. A project designed to increase youth employment and civic participation was highly relevant to the needs of the local population, as well as to the priorities of the national and provincial governments.
- The project was also highly relevant to the objectives of Global Affairs Canada, which has been a long-time supporter of the Aga Khan Foundation. The Canadian government has been providing resources for AKRSP since its inception, with a clear gender equality focus, and a strong emphasis on women's economic empowerment. These objectives were an integral part of the project design.
- The project design took into consideration the great diversity of the population in terms of their location (from remote villages to highly urbanized populations), economic status (from the ultra-poor and highly vulnerable to the financially secure populations), gender, age (15-35 years), and education levels (from illiterate to those with postgraduate degrees), etc. It also addressed the needs of youth who had degrees but lacked marketable skills and experience, a group that is often omitted in development projects. It helped increase awareness of youth about the job market and its requirements, business development, life skills, savings and working in community organizations, and helped them to develop linkages with organizations, and technical and professional personnel.
- To quote the report:

It goes to the credit of AKF that it avoided the traditional project approach of focusing [on the supply side of the development equation], usually considered the easy part (e.g. skill development). Rather, AKRSP did a thorough analysis of all the factors and actors involved, and adopted a holistic approach which tried to address all parts of the puzzle. This, of course, made the project far more complex than typical development projects, but led to more meaningful results.

#### Effectiveness:

- EELY demonstrated increases in the following outcomes among youth: marketable skills, employment, self-employment, enterprises, and incomes; participation and leadership in community organizations; positive attitudes towards government, private and community organizations; and sole or joint decision making for young women.
- Engagement with governments resulted in an enhanced budget for youth development, sports facilities, youth centres, interest-free loans for unemployed youth, and the continuation of the successful internship program.
- The success of Diamer district can be considered one of the flagship successes of the project. The project made many modifications in its approach and adopted innovative measures to benefit women. The active involvement of local religious leaders helped in reducing resistance against the project to a considerable extent concluding with vocational centres being developed at madrasas and hundreds of women acquiring marketable skills outside of the project.
- Young women in particular made good use of the opportunities provided by EELY. EELY raised awareness of non-traditional opportunities available to young women, and provided them with the necessary confidence, motivation, skills, experience, and seed money to start their own ventures. Many women set up shops, or sold their products directly in the market rather than

through interlocutors. This in turn motivated other women to start their own small businesses and reassured their families that women could do well as entrepreneurs.

# Efficiency:

- The project achieved, or overachieved, 91% of its outputs, demonstrating that it was effective in delivering the results it had planned. However, it should be noted that 70% of target beneficiaries were reached during the second half of the project. For example an analysis of 8,493 beneficiaries demonstrated that 24% of total beneficiaries participated in EELY activities in 2014, 29% in 2015 and 18% in 2016. This showed that, while the project caught up, it took a few years to become fully efficient.
- One of the most common complaints of youth beneficiaries was the lack of monitoring and follow-up support by AKRSP staff. This was a result of the staff being stretched to their limit across the broad geography of GBC on a tight travel budget. Future projects will need to ensure enough HR-time and travel to rectify this issue.

# Sustainability:

- There are a number of positive developments that have taken place in the last five years which point towards the sustainability of project results linked to EELY interventions. These include:
  - Increases in the number of service providers and trainers for developing marketable skills of youth linked up with public sector organizations;
  - The establishment of a centre for youth skills development at KIU;
  - A significant increase of male and female youth membership in community organizations, with youth increasingly in leadership positions;
  - A substantial increase in the number of youth with marketable skills, including skills required by employers;
  - More youth have skills for setting up and running their own businesses or community organizations, as well as increased self-confidence and leadership potential;
  - An increase in the number of young women and men who are employed or running their own businesses, including some in the most conservative areas of GBC; and
  - An increase in market demand for trained youth.

Since WEE was a key priority under EELY, AKFC commissioned an evaluation of EELY through a WEE lens. The consultant analyzed the impact of EELY in addressing practical and strategic gender needs across the three roles that women play simultaneously: reproductive, productive, and community (explained in Table 59).

Role	Definition	Examples of EELY
		Interventions that targeted
		this role:
Reproductive	Childbearing and rearing responsibilities, and the	• Training women on ECD. <sup>28</sup>
	domestic tasks done by women, required to guarantee	• YMCA grants to women who
	the maintenance and reproduction of the labour force.	started ECD centres.
	It includes not only biological reproduction but also the	
	care and maintenance of the work force (male partner	
	and working children) and the future work force	
	(infants and school-going children).	

Table 59: Guide to Moser's Three-Role Terminology and its Connection to EELY Activities<sup>27</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Caroline O. N. Moser (1993). Gender planning and development: theory, practice, and training.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> As outlined by Frida Khan, this was not a deliberate targeting of the reproductive role, but there were multiple positive unexpected results.

Role	Definition	Examples of EELY Interventions that targeted this role:
Productive	Work done by both women and men for pay in cash or kind. It includes both market production with an exchange-value, and home production with actual use- value, and also potential exchange-value.	<ul> <li>Women's markets.</li> <li>Vocational skills.</li> <li>Enterprise development training.</li> <li>YMCAs.</li> <li>Internships.</li> </ul>
Community managing	Activities undertaken primarily by women at the community level, as an extension of their reproductive role, to ensure the provision and maintenance of scarce resources of collective consumption, such as water, health care and education. This is voluntary unpaid work.	<ul> <li>CBSGs.</li> <li>Life skills.</li> <li>Strengthening LSOs.</li> </ul>

#### **Reproductive roles:**

- In EELY, as with many livelihood projects, activities that are meant to strengthen women's role in the productive sphere often ended up reinforcing women's reproductive roles. Examples of this are the courses EELY offered on stitching and embroidery, deemed acceptable for women since it is an extension of what they already do at home.
- However, while such training is often dismissed as being an extension of gender stereotypes of reproductive work, and not leading to a transformation in power relations, the importance of traditional training should not be underestimated. Being closely linked to women's reproductive work, it can provide an important entry point that can be built upon at later stages as women move from access to conscientization and the questioning of gender roles. Most women responded via interviews and focus groups that income from this work helped them renegotiate power structures within the family. However, women still felt that reproductive responsibilities remained primarily their responsibility. Renegotiating this balance will take more time.
- Many of the activities related to advocacy and awareness raising focused on rights to education, training, work and income, with impressive results, but they did not include elements of change management for men or encouraging them to take on a greater reproductive responsibilities.
- Engaging women in the productive sphere can be threatening due to perceived distraction from women's reproductive role. For example, the LSO in Booni, Skardu district, reported some resistance from religious leaders towards productive WEE activities, saying that women's traditional roles as home-makers were being threatened. However, commendably, AKRSP found a way to work with these leaders. In this example, the religious leader's wife was invited to preside as a high-level guest over EELY events and visit the women's market and then the leader himself issued a *fatwa* (religious decree) encouraging women's participation in women-only markets.

#### Productive roles:

- The income that came as a result of employment was found to be a crucial catalyst enabling women take on a greater role in household decision making and raising their status both in the family and community.
- Many women spent their incomes on household expenses including food, health and special occasions. Some said that they felt more independent in that they no longer had to ask their husbands for money to buy items. They said they were consulted more often about family decisions, including on the use of income. Even community members who had at some stage criticized women for attending training and engaging in work now looked up to them as role models for their own daughters and even approached them asking them to help their children access skills and employment opportunities.

- Training, employment and income from vocational skills development has therefore, improved access for women in the productive sphere, and this has had a knock-on effect in the reproductive sphere. However it has not had the same impact in helping women move up in the productive sphere. A majority of women are involved only in low-skilled, and low-paying work. This is not to undermine this achievement; there is a greater awareness that there is no work that women cannot do, but women will need more support to challenge gender relations in the world of work to participate and benefit equally.
- There is also no doubt that women-only markets have helped create female role models that other women want to emulate. Over time, this has helped to change societal attitudes around women in business, and gender equality being an incremental process rather than a point or action at a particular time, this could set the stage for further progress on gender equality in women's and men's productive roles.

# Community roles:

• Several EELY interventions fall under this sphere namely because their aim has been to engage women as active and informed members of the community and participate in community development decisions equally with men. Some interventions, such as forming savings groups, have been labelled as access to savings interventions, but the nature of the work, including managing finances and community group relations, has enhanced women's participation in the community sphere.

#### **Recommendations**

Utilizing the same categories as analysis, the endline study made the following recommendations for future AKRSP programming focused on youth and young women.

#### Relevance:

- Increase the focus on reaching and involving youth, particularly women, from remote areas in project activities, including in valleys where AKRSP has not previously worked; use best practices from Diamer as a guide.
- To provide a better reflection of results, ensure that individuals selected for baseline are future project beneficiaries.
- Have variable quotas for women in project activities, with a lower quota for women in highly conservative districts, and a higher quota in more liberal areas, or areas where there has been greater success at involving women in higher areas of the value chain.

#### Effectiveness:

- Communicate directly with employers and increase the focus on the development of vocational, technical and IT skills that employers are still having difficulty in obtaining.
- Implement a gender sensitization program for men, including male beneficiaries, TVET instructors, employers, family members, etc., so that they may begin to accept the changing gender roles of both women and men.
- Consider business groups for YMCA grants rather than individuals, as this would enhance the grant size and reduce AKRSP's transaction cost. Alternately, connect high-potential youth businesses to the AKDN's business incubator, Accelerate Prosperity, to provide results at scale.
- Consider announcing an innovation grant for existing enterprises and social development projects to encourage innovations and broaden opportunities for youth leadership.

#### Efficiency:

• Specifically for the internship program: use the feedback of interns and host institutions to improve the program, including criteria and methodology for selection and orientation of hosts and interns; enhance linkages with organizations for placement of interns; develop a job

information dissemination system and design a program for those completing internships to facilitate their joining the job market.

- Continuously update the project databases, including regular contact with alumni through the use of IT (e.g. Facebook page, WhatsApp group, website, etc.)
- Work closely with implementing partners to minimize delays in activities, and ensure timely availability of resources, even in remote areas.
- Improve coordination with government to ensure support for start-up businesses, including NOCs and registration.

# Sustainability:

- Continue to work with the GB government after its announcement and implementation of its Youth Policy and the implementation of the loan program for unemployed youth and TVET strategy for GB.
- Engage with the education department for inclusion of life skills in the curricula, and partner with public and private schools for inclusion of life skills training in their regular classes.
- Encourage TVETs and other technical skills providers to increase their outreach to employers, and provide them the opportunity to recruit qualified and skilled interns.
- Consider the recommendations given in various value chain studies for sustained increases in productivity, market share, revenue, employment, and incomes in GBC, including:
  - Create and support lead enterprises in the region to provide inputs and support market linkages;
  - Provide additional capacity building in branding and marketing;
  - Train producers and service providers in modern production techniques and accessing high quality inputs;
  - Support technological innovations and accessing technology through necessary institutional arrangements;
  - Establish community-based processing and storage facilities; and
  - Strengthen associations of producers and service providers.

The *Women's Economic Empowerment Assessment* also had recommendations for future WEE-focused programing.

# <u>Reproductive roles:</u>

- Interventions to improve women's productive employment should be supplemented with activities that address women's needs in the reproductive sphere. For instance women who have been trained in ECD courses could be trained further in business management and helped to set up ECD centres where other women could leave their children under professional care as they pursue work in the productive or community sphere. There was an increased demand for such services in several communities and it will likely continue to increase as family structures change and women move away from villages to urban centres to work.
- Future projects need to challenge misconceptions about women's work. One misconception that can be addressed is that women don't work. Time-use studies can demonstrate how much of women's work is productive work, and even if it is not remunerated, it contributes to the household income through income offsetting (not having to pay someone to do it).

# Productive roles:

• Leverage the media for development messaging. Society's negative attitude towards working women is often the biggest hurdle for women engaging in productive roles. Media can be brought on as a partner given its increased penetration and its influence in shaping people's ideas.

- AKRSP has had good success in training women as plumbers, masons and electricians in Hunza, and employing them in their own conservation projects such as Altit Fort. This shows that there is potential for women to enter such unconventional trades if provided alongside post-training support to ensure employment.
- Improve pre-training and post-training activities. Women being trained in new trades require more than vocational training. Additional support should include pre-employment advocacy and job guarantees from potential employers, business training and making training part of larger infrastructure projects, for instance the green jobs described previously, or conservation projects as AKRSP has done, where women are given preferential employment. Pre-training activities also include better feasibility studies to assess potential economic opportunities.
- Once training is over, there needs to be a formal mechanism by which trainees can get posttraining support, such as access to finance, further training, or links to new markets. Such needs are often not identifiable until several months into work or business have passed.
- The focus on educated, professional women should continue in any future intervention on WEE, especially because of the large gains that can be made from a small input. The women who have been through the professional internship program could be organized along similar lines to form a professional women's association. Their role could be advocacy, training, networking, and liaising between employers, government and other working women to raise and solve issues they face.
- The China-Pakistan Economic Corridor project has great potential for the socio-economic development of the area. It is important that any economic assessment carried out is done in a gender responsive manner, ensuring decent work, and the enabling environment that would help women benefit from these opportunities is considered. These factors could include safe transport, childcare facilities and pre-emptive training in the skills likely to be in demand and advocacy with employers to give priority to female employees with the required skills set.

# Community roles:

• WOs and LSOs should continue to be encouraged to become more active in politics. Many of the problems women and men face on issues such as safe transport and poor infrastructure are best resolved at a government level through political intervention. EELY demonstrated that working with elected officials, such as women in Chitral, can have good results both for women's individual leadership, but also for their communities.

# Lessons Learned

During the course of implementation, the EELY team kept a detailed record of lessons learned. Incorporating lessons and data interpretation were a regular part of annual work planning. Listed below is a summary of the key 14 lessons that the implementation team learned between Years 1 and 6 of the project.

- 1. Spending additional time building relationships and partnerships with different actors can result in successful implementation of project activities and an increased sustainability of results. However the systems approach (of working through various types of actors) which underpins EELY's project design, at times presented a level of complexity with respect to implementation since creating functioning partnerships often takes longer than anticipated, which can delay the implementation of specific activities. This long-term partnership building needs to be factored into future implementation plans.
- 2. Partners often have varied capacities and therefore, AKRSP was also charged with providing technical backstopping and capacity development. While progress has been made on strengthening service providers in GBC, it is important to continue to explore partnerships with national and international service providers to introduce new techniques, curriculum, and approach.

- 3. Gender mainstreaming objectives are time-consuming and complex in areas like Diamer with conservative societal norms. However women's practical needs and issues can be addressed through a well-planned and targeted approach by taking into account the local social and cultural sensitivities, such as holding separate activities for women, engaging directly with families, parents and community elders.
- 4. Recognizing, engaging and working through traditional community and religious leaders and other influential community members has proved effective in community acceptance for development work, especially regarding women's empowerment and development in more conservative areas.
- 5. Gender pairs training (couples and peers in the form of brothers and sisters) proved to be a useful activity that has created increased gender sensitivity within targeted LSOs and their constituent communities, especially in offsetting the reproductive responsibilities of women. This technique is ready for scaling up to accompany future WEE efforts.
- 6. Communities in conservative areas are receptive to development activities if the intended objectives of the interventions are shared in advance and their concerns are addressed at planning stages. Since acceptance, capacity, organization, mobilization and security challenges exist in areas such as Diamer, the timeframe of implementation needs to be flexible. For achieving any visible socio-economic development impact, multiple years of patient, layered, and sustained efforts must be planned.
- 7. Incorporating the aspect of post-training placement of trainees as a pre-condition with the service providers for TVET trainings has resulted in an increased number of trainees being placed with different organizations (e.g. ECD at Professional Development Centre North). This approach needs to be continued for increased placement of youth. It also helps establish relationships between TVET and employers that extend beyond the project.
- 8. TVET service providers are heavily dependent on public and NGO sectors. The interventions in this sector needed to be initiated through PPP arrangements to lower the cost and increase accessibility for the youth coming from poorer backgrounds.
- 9. Societal awareness on the value of entrepreneurship is a key factor for entrepreneurship development. Moreover, the context specific entrepreneurship development modules are more effective as these are directly relevant to the gaps in different value chains and focused on emerging business opportunities.
- 10. Access to markets can be enhanced through online platforms, e.g. e-marketing. The internet connectivity has substantially improved in GBC with the inception of mobile internet services. Most of the prominent business entities are now accessible online and young entrepreneurs can easily be connected to business entities at national and international levels using readily available technology and by providing relevant training and skills to sell their products online.

# Public Engagement with Canadian Audiences

- 11. AKFC has learned the necessity of providing content which speaks to people at various levels of interest and knowledge: from short, engaging products (such as 60 second videos) aimed at audiences with limited knowledge of global development to more comprehensive materials (such as project briefs) aimed at those who want additional information. This layered approach creates multiple entry points to the content, and provides people the opportunity to dive deeper into the information if they wish to do so.
- 12. In developing content, the power of storytelling and person-focused narrative has emerged as a crucial approach to engaging audiences of all levels of interest and knowledge. By framing communications materials and activities around real, human stories, the audience is more immediately engaged and connected to the information being presented.
- 13. AKFC must carefully consider the appropriate roles for volunteers in future communications activities, to determine whether the anticipated cost savings are offset by the possibility of delays, reduction in professional quality of the final product, and additional time resources required to manage the volunteer.
- 14. AKFC also recognizes the value and importance of bringing together Canadian development organizations to promote knowledge-sharing and learning, particularly around promoting women's economic empowerment. The two roundtable discussions held in the final year of the project were

well-received by participants and provided an opportunity for development practitioners to learn from one another and share experiences and lessons. Such events will be included in future projects to foster a community of practice.

# VIII. Assessment of the Synergy between EELY and Other Projects Funded by Global Affairs Canada

During implementation, there were two other GAC-funded projects in the EELY geography, both implemented by Aga Khan Foundation. They covered two sectors, civil society and education, and represented part of the multi-input area development (MIAD) approach that the AKDN country programs strive to implement. Combined with EELY, the AKFC portfolio assisted Global Affairs Canada in continuing its decades-long partnership of improving quality of life of GBC.

Table 60: Assessment of S	Synergy between EELY and two Global Affairs' Funded Projects
Project	Assessment of Synergy
Strengthening Civil Society Initiative (SCSI) "Reducing Climate Change Impact on	<b>Snapshot:</b> one of seventeen civil society sub-projects funded under the strategic partnership between Global Affairs Canada and AKFC, this project enhanced the knowledge of local CSOs and government authorities on climate change, particularly the linkages to disaster risk reduction and climate change adaptation solutions.
Vulnerable Communities by Enhancing Community Preparation at the Local Level"	<b>Similar core strategies:</b> the project was complementary to EELY, utilizing similar trainers from the AKDN-humanitarian organization, FOCUS, to create local response units focused on DRR. AKRSP and FOCUS coordinated with EELY to ensure that combined they could cover a large area of GBC. As with EELY, AKF used its relationship with the government to help influence policy on climate change alleviation and disaster preparation.
	<b>Direct crossover:</b> young women and men, many of whom were also beneficiaries of the EELY project became members of the village emergency response teams (VERTs). LSOs, VOs, and WOs were invited to participate in forums on climate change; due to the large increase of youth in these organizations under EELY, more young women and men's voices, were heard on policy for a on climate change.
Strengthening Teachers and Education in Pakistan (STEP)	<b>Snapshot:</b> a 2009 to 2015 project which strengthened the professional development and performance of teachers, teacher educators, and education managers.
	<b>Similar core strategies:</b> As with EELY, STEP acknowledged that there is a disconnect between skills and knowledge being learned in the classroom and the outside world. Like EELY, the STEP project helped improve the skills of teaching professionals, many of them young women and men, so they can perform their jobs better.
	STEP also represented a continuation of several decades of the AKDN's investment in education in GBC, contributing towards literacy and numeracy rates greater than in other parts of the country. These literate, educated, but underemployed beneficiaries of prior GAC-AKF collaborations were a huge driving rationale for a strategic movement into the youth sector.
	Direct crossover: There was no direct crossover.

In the table below is an assessment of their synergies.

# Annex A: Year 6 Summary Report

Activity number	Activity	Targets	Year 6 progress and results
WBS1.1	Employable Skills	3	
1.1.1.4	Conduct EELY endline survey (LMA including LFS, YPS, SPS, ES) and disseminate findings	5 selected studies on flagship activities	Five studies have been conducted and the results of these studies have been incorporated into the end of project report.
	Facilitate	15 events	Twelve visits were achieved, including: six exposure visits in Gilgit, four exposure visits in Baltistan, one in Chitral, and one from the core office. The objective was to familiarize the participants with new forms of interactive teaching tools and equipment. Participants were trainers of handicrafts, beautician skills, gem cutting and polishing, and dress making. Chitral could not achieve the target as the service providers were not available due to their teaching schedule.
1.1.2.2	participation in key sector events, forums and learning trips	3 validation workshops and 100 participants per region	The overall objective of conducting regional workshops was to validate EELY's impact by presenting to public stakeholders results, achievements, lessons learned, and implications for future programming. The workshops provided a platform for EELY beneficiaries and stakeholders to explore their experience. The agenda of the workshop included: • Review of the project components • Results achieved • Lessons learnt • Recommendations for future programming • Replicable components The workshops were attended by around 400 participants including 40% women.

Activity number	Activity	Targets	Year 6 progress and results
1.1.3.4	Provide job placements for skilled graduates	50 placements	EELY provided apprenticeships to 52 skilled graduates (Gilgit: 25, Baltistan: 13, and Chitral: 14). In these placements, youth worked closely with experts in their chosen trades to enhance skills, make connections, and pave the way for future employment.
1.1.41	Youth Internship Program	1,094 interns (45% women)	EELY provided professional internships to 1,206 fresh graduates (669F, 537M). By region the internships were spread out as: Gilgit: 450, Baltistan: 250, Chitral: 311, Diamer: 108, and the core office: 87. Lessons from the final year of placements were shared with the GB government who took over the program from October 2016.
WBS1.2	Entrepreneurship Employment Crea		
1.2.3.3	Youth entrepreneurship development training including gender session as part of curriculum	331 participants	The project exceeded the period target and trained 348 youth (42% YW), targeting GBC's most underserved and remote areas. The 348 trained entrepreneurs included 113 youth in Gilgit (23% YW), 94 in Baltistan (53% YW), 101 in Chitral (70% YW) and 40 in Diamer (0% YW).
WBS2.1	<b>Civic Participation</b>	n & Leadership	
2.1.1.1	YMCA for youth organizations (social component) 30% awards to young women-led organizations	3 awards in Diamer	Two YMCA awards were awarded in Diamer. The budget for the third award was merged into the total of the two awards to cover the requirements of the ambitious award winners. Awards were given for two tailoring centres, one in Jaglote Tangir and the other in Saree Thore, to develop women's programming post-EELY.
2.1.1.2	Maintenance of Youth Portal	1 in core	AKRSP closely monitored content being posted on the portal and performed regular follow-up with the service providers for quality assurance. The web-site is functioning well independent of AKRSP.
2.1.2.1b	Support partners in organizing	150 events	

Activity number	Activity	Targets	Year 6 progress and results
	recognition awards, creative events and festivals, and forums at district and regional levels		<ul> <li>153 events and initiatives were supported benefitting 11,047 youth (4,253F, 6,794M). These include: 55 in Gilgit, 30 in Baltistan, 33 in Chitral, 10 at core office, and 25 in Diamer.</li> <li>The themes included: ECD, women in sports, International Youth Day, speech competitions, mainstreaming services for differently-abled people, health and hygiene, the reactivation of defunct WOs, and peace and development.</li> </ul>
2.1.4.1	Support and organize dialogue forums, and communication events and material on DRR	12 events	A total of 13 events were accomplished including five events in Gilgit, three in Baltistan, two in Diamer, and three in Chitral. A total of 761 youth (287F, 474M) participated in these events. The major themes included: climate change-related risks in mountain regions, disaster risk management, awareness raising in pre- and post- conditions of disaster, international water day, world environmental day, reorganization of VERTs and CERTs, and the role of women in DRR.
<b>WBS2.2</b>	Institutional Deve	elopment	
2.2.1.1b	Support implementation of LSO youth development	26 YDP interventions	A total of 26 LSOs were supported to implement key interventions from their respective YDPs. These include ten LSOs in Gilgit, seven in Baltistan, seven in Chitral and two organizations from Diamer district. The major themes included: financial management and bookkeeping training for youth organizations,
	plans		first aid, combating drug abuse, social mobilization, career counselling, youth forum formation, inter- school speech competitions, the establishment of a library, and a survey on engagement of educated youth in Diamer.
2.2.1.4	plans Follow-up support to existing CBSGs	180 CBSGs	first aid, combating drug abuse, social mobilization, career counselling, youth forum formation, inter- school speech competitions, the establishment of a library, and a survey on engagement of educated

Activity number	Activity	Targets	Year 6 progress and results
	and KP government priorities in implementing government youth priorities		<ul> <li>All six priorities were supported with the following details:</li> <li>Six young entrepreneurs were supported to establish model camping sites for tourists in their native villages (Ghizer, Hunza, and Astore);</li> <li>Two ECD training events (Skardu and Ghanche) were conducted for 60 female teachers of government schools;</li> <li>The district government of Chitral was supported to conducti two cultural festivals;</li> <li>The woodworking work centre in Diamer was upgraded; and</li> <li>The computer skills lab of the Social Welfare Department was upgraded.</li> </ul>
2.2.3.2	Support public, private partnership events between LSOs and government line departments	2 events	<ul> <li>The key priority during the final year was strengthening dialogues between LSOs and line departments.</li> <li>The target was overachieved and six events were facilitated including: <ul> <li>Regional consultative workshop;</li> <li>Three day training organized for capacity building of LGRD officials on project management and implementation strategy;</li> <li>A bazaar was held in Skardu where the majority of stalls were run by youth;</li> <li>Two sessions were held with GBLA members to acquire support for LSOs; and</li> <li>A two-day workshop was organized in Chitral on PPP in collaboration with the Chitral Community Development Network.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
2.2.3.2A	Training of government officials	6 officials	AKRSP organized a three-day orientation training on the <i>Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Local Government Act-</i> <i>2013</i> which focused on the roles and responsibilities of the elected young women in Chitral. The training was organized by the Chitral Community Development Network. Additionally, a four-day training on project cycle management, proposal development, gender mainstreaming and environment was conducted for government officials in both Diamer and Baltistan.

Activity number	Activity	Targets	Year 6 progress and results
			One LSO and three local NGO networks were
2.2.3.2B	Support to district LSO networks	2 LSO Networks	<ul> <li>supported during the review period, exceeding the target.</li> <li>In Gilgit, the LSO Network Ghizer organized a seminar to promote peace and harmony in Ghizer district through civil society participation.</li> <li>In Diamer, three workshops were conducted bringing together civil society, youth, and the community to discuss peace, harmony, and future development.</li> </ul>

#### ANNEX B: ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN UNDER EELY'S INTEREST

# Support to Local Government and Rural Development Department (LG&RD) in strengthening the training centre for participatory governance.

This was part of the broader MoU signed between AKRSP and LG&RD to collaborate to address the development needs of local communities and institutions in Gilgit-Baltistan. Under this MoU it was also

agreed that AKRSP would build the capacity of LG&RD staff to address development challenges effectively.

With interest income, AKRSP supported the capacity development training centre housed within LG&RD. The centre will provide training to elected representatives and government functionaries with a special focus on youth and women. Under terms of partnership, AKRSP has agreed to provide a partial sponsorship to LG&RD through providing essential training aids such as ICT equipment (multimedia projector, screen, camera, computer, etc.) and the cost of a consultant for developing relevant training modules.

# *Up-grading of Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Database with advanced features and supportive version for new projects and activities*

AKRSP contracted a service provider to incorporate the following two features into MELD:

**Beneficiary Tracking**. This feature will be used to reach out to beneficiaries tracked in MELD through emails for event promotion, sharing of employment or training opportunities, or follow-ups. Beneficiaries can be filtered by activity code, district, region, project and qualification. For example, beneficiaries of YCLDP, YCMA, and other programs could be targeted for opportunities relevant for to their training and geography.

**Google Maps Integration**. This feature will be used to map poverty scores by household, poverty bands and gender on Google Maps in MELD. This will give additional context to the needs of EELY beneficiaries and all future AKRSP beneficiaries.

# Support Private Sector TVET providers and job placements providers

AKRSP worked on the development of key partnerships with national level service providers which offer internationally accredited, certified and quality TVET services, with a view to extend their outreach to GBC. This was one of the key recommendations of the TVET Assessment by Seneca College.

By the end of September 2016, AKRSP signed an institutional MOU with Aman Foundation, a renowned national level TVET provider with a strong endorsement from the corporate sector. The MoU has enabled AKRSP and Aman Foundation to collaborate in sharing resources and knowledge on labor market assessments, industry trends and national and international job markets. It allowed both the institutions to collaboratively mobilize resources to improve access to internationally accredited and quality TVET services across GBC. In addition to the MoU, the project also contributed in launching the first City and Guilds Group-certified training by Aman on construction trades (plumbing and electrical) for youth of remote and underserved valleys of GBC.<sup>29</sup> Around 60 youth (30 in each trade) will benefit from this training in Karachi for a period of three to four months.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> City and Guilds Group is an internationally recognized certification standard for the trades: <u>https://www.cityandguildsgroup.com/about-us</u>

# Strengthen access to business incubators and accelerators

AKRSP supported and facilitated the development of a new AKDN initiative, Accelerate Prosperity Pakistan, which launched its first ever start-up challenge in GBC bundled with a comprehensive business incubation program for 25 businesses selected through a competitive process. Incubates were onboard starting in November 2016 for a fivemonth incubation program, ending by March 31<sup>st</sup> 2016. It should be noted that the majority of the qualifying ideas were EELY enterprise development training graduates.

News coverage: http://news.gbee.pk/2016/11/03/akdnannounces-prosperity-cup/

Accelerate Prosperity Website: <u>http://accelerateprosperity.org/</u>

Facebook Page (30,000 followers): <a href="https://www.facebook.com/accelerateprosperity/">https://www.facebook.com/accelerateprosperity/</a>

#### Accelerate Prosperity Pakistan shared their photo. 6 April · @

#ProsperityCup2016 - A Life-changing experience for women.

"Previously, my life was limited to my household chores and my children. Now (after going through business incubation program) I really want to work hard to realize my business idea so that I create my own name and identity" #accelerateprosperity

Photo 11: Accelerate Prosperity's Prosperity Cup had an extensive online presence which allowed thousands of Pakistanis witness the confidence of strong women entrepreneurs

#### Support DRR Communication

Under this activity, an informational video has been developed in collaboration with FOCUS. The documentary provides information to school children and communities on climate change adaptation and DRR. The video also shares effective practices in case of occurrences of disasters. The documentary also advocates for including DRR and climate change adaptation as a subject at school level, so that the children will be more informed and resilient. The documentary was disseminated to all EELY-supported LSOs, public and private educational institutions and other relevant stakeholders, such as VERTs.

# Support LSOs in Disaster Prone Areas

**Baltistan region:** two seminars on global warming were held in Union Council Hussainabad and Union Council Daghoni Balghar Ghanche. In addition, lessons were provided to the participants on how to protect and preserve the glaciers in their communities. The number of total beneficiaries for both seminars were 52, including seven young women and 45 young men.

**Chitral region:** six LSOs were supported for conducting trainings on engagement of communities in DRR in order to make the communities resilient and prepared for coping with the disaster. LSOs in areas with the highest risk of disasters were selected to participate.

Type of Training	Young Women	Young Men
First aid training for youth	41	41
Advanced first aid training for youth	30	13
Training on preparedness, prevention and mitigation	29	20

Table 61: Number of DRR Trainings and Trainees, by Type of Training and Sex of Trainee

Type of Training	Young Women	Young Men
Training on community based disaster risk management	36	39
	136	103

# Support DPAP's continued engagement in Diamer

# *i)* Support madrasas in organizing coaching classes for youth in Diamer

Support was provided to three madrasas. Coaching classes were organized for madrasa graduates to be able to transfer into the national education system and write national examinations. A total of 182 madrasa graduates (all young men) have been registered in coaching centres, and out of these, 130 students have sat for their examinations.

#### *ii)* Support poor & vulnerable drop out students

A local NGO working on education was selected as an implementing partner for DPAP and 130 drop outs (young men) were identified and integrated into community development activities. This contributed towards the GB government's stabilization priorities within Diamer

#### **ANNEX-C: MEET THE BENEFICIARIES**

In March 2017 a photographer went to GBC to capture how EELY has changed the daily lives of youth. The photos have been utilized throughout this report. Below are eight additional stories of how EELY has positively changed the lives of young women and men in Gilgit-Baltistan and Chitral.



Photo 12: Nayab Fatima, 25, is building stimulating ECD Materials out of greenwood. She attended a workshop on carpentry in early 2013 and now has developed a livelihood out of making toys to meet the demand from the growing number of ECD centres in Gilgit.



Photo 13: Nisar Hussain, 24, runs Skirchan Bakery in Kharmang Khas, a small village in Gilgit. Prior to EELY he was facing challenges providing for his family while also working far from home, in Karachi. Nisar attended the entrepreneurship training and won an award of PKR. 60,000 to open the first bakery in his community. Nisar now earns an average of PKR 80,000 monthly and gets to spend more time with his family.



Photo 14: Amina Begum, 30, owns two shops in the Women's Only Market in Chatorkhand, Ghizer. She runs a handicraft centre and makes local bed sheets, college bags, clothing, etc., and employs 15 women from the area, many of whom she trained herself.



Photo 15: 24-year-old Zubaida works as a Banking Sales Officer at Habib Bank Limited, Skardu. She did an internship with AKRSP's finance team and used her new skills and experience to earn a livable wage. She is the first female employee of the bank.



Photo 16: Tahira Kiran runs a beauty parlour in the Women's Market of Skardu and earns PKR 5,000 daily. She borrowed from her CBSG for some of her initial upgrades and still attends every meeting. She is the breadwinner for her household while her husband pursues a doctoral degree.



Photo 17: Sajjad Ali, 27, was placed at AKRSP as an intern in late 2015. He worked as a Master Trainer in Gilgit-Baltistan and used his communication skills to mobilize the trainees. His coordination skills caught the attention of Accelerate Prosperity, the AKDN business incubator, and he became a fellow and played a key role in coordinating the Prosperity Cup.



Photo 18: Lal Shazadi (left) and Chand Bibi (right) are preparing a popular cheese-bread called Burutz-Shapik for their customers. The pair run a small but popular food stall in Karimabad, Hunza. They developed the business model after participating in EELY's entrepreneurship training and won an YMCA grant.



Photo 19: Amanat Ali, 32, won a small grant to start a food stall business. He learned business development skills through EELY and put together a plan. Every day he travels three kilometres to sell samosas, chicken rolls and jalebi (sweets). Amanat has developed regular clientele and makes an average of PKR 3,500 daily, far more than he earned when he worked at a shop.